

modified by the human historical action of Christ's disposition. This presence of the Holy Spirit is in the believer and in the believing community.

Questions led to discussion about the desired payoffs of Kilmartin's vision. Obviously there is an ecumenical benefit. Also, the *lex orandi* is the very life of the Church. Responsibility for the life of the Word is critical. Kilmartin integrates early (first millennium) Western theology, some of the best in the Reformers' theology, and Eastern eucharistic theology. Presence is in the believing community, in the faith of the community. Yet Kilmartin does not give us a completed theology; the weakest part is the overshadowing of the heavenly Christ in this whole new schema. Kilmartin was not interested in canon law questions but rather whether one could have a sacramental Eucharist without a prayer, without involving the Holy Spirit. Specifically we should look at the Eucharistic Prayer and its continuity in the Eastern churches.

PRUDENCE CROKE, R.S.M.
Salve Regina University
Newport, Rhode Island

SPIRITUALITY

RESOURCES IN SPIRITUALITY FOR FACING FEAR AND LIVING IN HOPE

Presenters: Rosemary Haughton, Wellspring House, Gloucester, Massachusetts
Jon Sobrino, Universidad Centroamericana

Moderator: Lawrence Cunningham, University of Notre Dame

In her paper, "Women and the Spirituality of Hope and Fear," Haughton stated that "Fear is the appropriate reaction to evil" and its very real experience is the motivating power to confront actual evils, for the experience of fear rouses the necessary rage and courage. Fear without hope, however, leads to depression or despair. "It is fear that makes action necessary and hope that makes it possible." More than a personal challenge, fear for women is a condition of living in relationship and it embraces the loved ones who, by virtue of being human, are vulnerable to danger. "When something bad does happen the embracing fear has known it and the hope is ready to respond—with incredible energy, dogged patience, towering rage when it is appropriate—and to work at

rebuilding what has been broken." The spiritual dimension involves making choices about how to respond to the images created by fear and by hope, how to respond to crises or disasters. Traditional virtues of humility and willingness to accept pain are fostered because the outcome of one's choices is never certain. "Humility acknowledges the limits of the power to protect the creation of love, it accepts the risks of the gift of freedom and the pain that goes with it, which is the pain of fear." Fear is the condition of caring, hope the guide, and humility the discipline.

The spirituality of hope and fear is a spirituality of community, concerned with the interdependence of humankind and all of creation. This spirituality is concerned with "homemaking" and nurturing life on this planet, and as such it is global. The fear with which we live is fear for the human community; it "releases our hope, drives our work for one another, binds us together, calls us to humility and heroism and rewards us with the joy of companionship." Finally, fear is the condition of our bonding as people of God committed to the struggle against evil, in whatever form. To cease to be afraid is to be numb, to have given up the struggle. "That is why fear is not the enemy but the condition of our work for the kingdom for which, in spite of all, we still hope."

Jon Sobrino, in speaking of suffering and the human response to it, said that it is normal, good, and inevitable that we ask questions when things go wrong, searching for the meaning. In Job's experience there is no answer. If we presuppose that we have a right to an answer there will be no answer. In El Salvador, 75,000 people have been killed and yet life makes sense. Meaning comes from the answer we give when we are asked. In Job, Jeremiah, Mark, and Matthew, God asks the question "what have you done for your brothers and sisters?" We might or might not hear the answer. In Micah, God is tired of hearing the same question and asks for the last time, "What is good?" The answer is this: to act justly, to love tenderly, to walk humbly through history with God. We are confronted with a question and a demand is made on us. Hearing the word is more than a book; it is the essence of the whole thing. Do we think that we have the question and are waiting for God to answer to make sense of it all? If we do this, life doesn't make sense. Nothing can explain the suffering of innocent children.

Taken the other way, we care and fear for others, not only for ourselves, and meaning is found in terms of the horizons of the human family. To act justly is more important than analyzing the latest book. We work in our own sphere to find a solution and must talk therefore not only of liberation theology, but of liberation engineering, liberation law, etc. When we look at the totality of the human family we see that the majority of that family is living under oppression. What does it mean to love tenderly and to walk humbly in history with God? Because of the resurrection of Jesus Christ, we can live as resurrected people in history, that is, humbly. This is not a matter of living immaterially, but of living in freedom, joy, and hope. Freedom is not merely freedom to do what we can, but a sense that nothing will be an obstacle to the good. A peasant, full of

wisdom, said to Gustavo Gutierrez, "We are joyful people. You don't understand." The opposite of joy is not suffering, but sadness. When we live without sadness and with suffering, our life is joyful. The masses of martyrs are the most joyful. (As to hope, Sobrino referred to his morning keynote address.)

For Sobrino, the term "spirituality" is not useful when abstract. Human beings have an inner force to live in a given way, e.g., to do something in a spirit of love or of revenge, joy, hope, freedom, or honesty. In terms of praxis and ethics, our intelligence should take upon itself the burden of reality. We know something of the reign of God and the antireign, and that that antireign will affect us. We should be ready to bear upon our shoulders reality as a burden. A month before he died, Karl Rahner said "the Gospel is a heavy light burden." The more we carry the burden the more the Gospel carries us. We have to be ready to take upon our shoulders the burden of reality, what the Lamb of God did. This is a part of the spiritual life and conversely reality also takes us upon its shoulders as gift and grace. Readiness to accept the burden of reality—that is spirituality. In other words, spirituality is being responsible towards reality with its difficulties, open to grace. It is this openness to grace that makes martyrdom possible. There is structural sin addressed in Medellín and also structural grace; there is something in reality that also makes us live in hope. Our theory, thinking, and praxis need this spirit—this responsibility towards reality.

To a question on fear and the fear of God, Rosemary Haughton commented that fear not felt, fear that is denied, is a paralyzing numbness. Hope is frightening, but allows us to move beyond fear and calls us to action. We say "yes" to hope which gives us freedom. Sobrino cited the closeness of God in the New Testament. The fear of God is the beginning of community. Freedom comes from goodness which liberates us and makes us free to make other people free. This opening out to others is the test of spiritual integrity, Haughton said, and takes courage, friendship, mentoring, and example so that people learn that it is worth taking the risk. According to Sobrino, a tradition has come *up* to us but we must know its reality, i.e., we must not just know about slavery but be able to smell poverty. How to become real on this planet is our spiritual problem. To be real we must relate to the real majority; this relationship is the first act of the spiritual life. The task of theology, according to Haughton, is a mediating one. The very excuse for doing theology is to discover or rediscover a language that can convey the riches of the tradition to people who live in a very different reality.

ELIZABETH CARR

Smith College

Northampton, Massachusetts