

wondered, though, how Girard might account for the Buddha's universal compassion and what the implications for our conventional soteriologies might be.

O'Connell Killen, too, appreciated the book as a powerfully revelatory lens upon facets of culture that otherwise go unexplained. She was troubled by the book's apparent affinity for singular explanations of complex phenomena. While the Holy Spirit plays a critical role in unmasking the scapegoating mechanism, the Spirit does not seem to be a resource for the creative restructuring of culture. Further, the book's metaphors sometimes suggest that humans were trapped in a cosmic struggle beyond their awareness and power.

In the time available, Bailie was understandably unable to respond fully to these and the other questions raised. He reminded theologians, however, that the Gospel makes universal claims; no wonder that it might uncover "things hidden since the foundation of the world." Girard came upon these in pursuing answers to his questions. He does not claim to be an innovator; his research only showed him what the Gospel already discloses.

People were still deep in conversation with Bailie over an hour after the formal end of the session.

JON NILSON

*Loyola University Chicago  
Chicago, Illinois*

## SPIRITUALITY

- Topic: Authority, Leadership, and the Search for the Spirit  
Convener: Elizabeth E. Carr, Smith College  
Presenters: Brian O. McDermott, Weston Jesuit School of Theology  
Theresa Monroe, John F. Kennedy School of Government,  
Harvard University

Brian McDermott, S.J. and Terri Monroe, R.S.C.J. initiated a conversation on their work on leadership and authority from the perspectives of theology and the social sciences. In elaborating some elements of a public or systemic spirituality and relating leadership and authority to the search for the Spirit, Brian McDermott and Terri Monroe see the need to be bilingual—to use language appropriate to "within the walls" of a theological school and "on the wall" between the church and the secular world.

Brian McDermott began with the reminder that, theologically speaking, "The Holy Spirit does what the Holy Spirit is." The Holy Spirit fashions the hearers of Jesus to be the recipients of divine life. This divinization of our humanity involves the remission of sins and the fashioning of individuals into being members of one another. Thus, the Holy Spirit creates a "membering experience" within the Church. The Spirit operates not only in individual human hearts and in the interpersonal sphere, but, in social science terms, is "systems-friendly."

In the discernment empowered by the Spirit among the members, they learn to differentiate between a true and a false spirit, for example by recognizing the difference between "group think" or false consensus and authentic unity, which may involve healthy conflict. The Spirit allows one, as well, to acknowledge in faith the demands of a tough love in which the long-term good is pursued and enacted, even if it involves short-term hurt.

Terri Monroe spoke of the tendency to confuse or conflate the terms leadership and authority. Leadership is often associated with personal traits, such as compassion, vision, and courage. Another view of leadership, however, sees it as the activity of mobilizing a group to do difficult work, such as narrowing the gap between the present reality of a group and where the group wants most deeply to be. Neither discerning the present reality nor getting to a level of deeper hopes and desires is easy. Leadership is the activity which mobilizes a group to do this new kind of learning.

Monroe described two kinds of problems groups face: "technical problems," or those problems seen before and to which routine solutions (be they simple or sophisticated) apply, and "adaptive challenges," or those problems the group hasn't faced before and for which answers do not yet exist. There is always a temptation to treat an adaptive challenge as a technical problem.

When a group faces adaptive challenges, there is anxiety, pain, and loss and, hence, a need for a container for the inevitable stresses. The social function of authority during times of adaptive work is to be such a container, working like a pair of arms holding a group and giving it the necessary boundaries and safety to do its work. Using the analogy of a pressure cooker, Monroe cautioned that without boundaries the necessary steam gets dissipated when it needs to be focused.

The need for healthy containers is central to the contemporary search for an adequate spirituality. Monroe pointed to a radical shift which has taken place: more and more people are left on their own to discover, indeed invent, a spirituality for themselves. These folks do not experience themselves as being held by a tradition in which duty, discipline, and practice make sense. The self can't find a home or a context within which to connect with the Divine; rather, the self experiences alienation and fragmentation. One result of this fragmentation can be an anesthetizing of fear through drugs, TV, and workaholism. For some, the search for the self collapses into an authoritarian environment when the stress level becomes intolerable. Spiritual practice, drawing on deep traditions, can pro-

vide a holding environment for people in this new place. The Holy Spirit, the ultimate holding environment for the world's living and learning, seeks in myriad ways to build up this kind of container for the healing of our common humanity.

ELIZABETH E. CARR

*Smith College*

*Northampton, Massachusetts*

## THEOLOGICAL ANTHROPOLOGY

- Topic: Pneumatology in Theological Anthropology  
Convener: Anne M. Clifford, Duquesne University  
Moderator: Anne H. King-Lenzmeier, University of St. Thomas, St. Paul  
Presenters: Nancy A. Dallavalle, Fairfield University, "The Role of the Spirit in Late Modernity: Safeguard of Particularity"  
 Janice M. Poorman, University of Notre Dame, "In the Spirit We Are One: Pneumatological and Anthropological Foundations for Interreligious Dialogue"

The task for theology today is both to take pluralism seriously and to respond to religious diversity. In their papers on pneumatology and theological anthropology Nancy Dallavalle and Janice Poorman engaged in this task. In "The Role of the Spirit in Late Modernity: Safeguard of Particularity," Dallavalle observed that recent constructive pneumatologies emphasize the Spirit's activity in the multiplicity, rather than in the unity, of creation. Focusing on the work of Reformed theologian Colin Gunton, author of *The One, the Three, and the Many: God, Creation, and the Culture of Modernity*, Dallavalle noted that he criticizes both modernity and postmodernity as, paradoxically, simultaneously individualistic and homogeneous. Moreover, both are profoundly gnostic in their prizing of rationality and their antimaterialism. Gunton's response is a doctrine of God, an anthropology, and a theology of creation all characterized by a relational ontology that strictly preserves particularity-in-otherness, a particularity that is maintained by the Spirit both in the Godhead and in creation. The Spirit both crosses boundaries enabling that which has spirit to be open to what is other than itself and sustains the relation of otherness which establishes the other in its true reality. The Spirit does this by maintaining relations that do not violate what creation is; humanity, for example, brings nonhuman creation to perfection not through instrumental use, but through a relationship of dominion.