CHARITY AND THE PURSUIT OF WISDOM

The last two presidential addresses delivered at the annual conventions of our Society were concerned respectively with, first, the hardships and consolations of theology ¹ and, secondly, the grandeur and misery of theology. ² To endure the hardships of limited insight and to suffer the misery of a science yearning for vision are challenges to the theologian's capacity for love. So in an effort to follow the leadership of my eminent predecessors I have chosen as my topic tonight: the role of charity in the pursuit of theological wisdom. This topic, I think, will not only provide me with an attempt at continuity of thought with previous addresses but will also invite us to consider anew some of the current theological discussions on the nature and object of theology, the mode of the Divine Indwelling, and the primacy of love in moral theology.

Both faith and theological science, we know, can exist in a man who does not have charity. The theological habit which we call the virtue of wisdom is acquired by study and learning. ³ This virtue of wisdom is distinct from the gift of wisdom which is inseparable from charity. ⁴ The gift of wisdom is formally perfecting the intellect, though causally dependent upon love. ⁵ The gift of wisdom cannot of itself substitute for the theological habit of wisdom. Love does not make the dull but holy man a theologian. But it does in some way perfect the habit of wisdom in the man who already has it. In fact, the dull but holy man has a kind of knowledge given only to those who love fervently and without which even the expert theologian

¹ Yelle, G., On the Hardships and Consolations of Theology, in Proceedings of Ninth Convention, pp. 224-231.

² O'Connor, W. R., The Grandeur and the Misery of Theology, in Procedings of Tenth Convention, pp. 285-294.

⁸ St. Thomas, Scriptum Super Sententiis, III, d. 35, q. 2, art. 1, ques. 1, sol.

⁴ John of St. Thomas, *De Donis*, Disp. 18, art. 4, 42: "... donum sapientiae non est theologia per accidens infusa et ejusdem speciei cum theologia quam sudore et studio scholarum addiscimus, sed est mystica et affectiva sapientia, quae interna experientia et gustu divinorum de divinis judicat."

⁵ St. Thomas, Scriptum Super Sententiis, III, d. 35, q. 2, art. 1, ques. 3, sol.

would not know God as he ought. ⁶ The habit of theology or the virtue of wisdom deals with virtual revelation by means of discursive reasoning; the gift of wisdom gives knowledge by way of an experienced connaturality for divine things. ⁷ The questions prompting the present inquiry are these: what does charity do to produce this connaturality with divine things how does it become conducive to illumination of the mind? in what sense can the experimental knowledge coming from the gift of wisdom be called an enrichment of scientific theology?

In keeping with the first point of the inquiry we shall consider charity's essential sameness on earth and in heaven, together with its power to introduce us into the Trinitarian life of God; with the second question in view we shall look to charity's role in producing the "sensus Christi" in the theologian; and the final point of our inquiry will be met by an analysis of the cognitive virtuosity of affective union.

I. By Charity we possess God as really and substantially as we shall possess Him in the life of eternity.

"God is love," says St. John, "and whoever abides in love, abides in God and God in him." Supernatural love is a work of divine power so great and so wonderful that it becomes a reality in the Christian soul only in virtue of a special presence of the Triune God. "If any man love me," our Lord tells us, "he will keep my word, and

⁶ St. Thomas, *Idem.*, I, d. 15, q. 4, art. 2, ad 4: "Ad quartum dicendum quod illa notitia ex qua procedit amor, viget in ferventibus divino amore, qua scilicet cognoscunt divinam bonitatem in quantum est finis, et inquantum est largissime in eos profluens sua beneficia; et talem notitiam perfecte non habent qui amore ipsius non accenduntur."

⁷ John of St. Thomas, *Op. cit.*, Disp. 18, art. 4, 6: . . . "ratio formalis qua cognoscit istas causas est experimentum quoddam internum, quod habetur de Deo et de rebus divinis in ipso gustu seu affectu et delectatione seu tactu voluntatis interno de istis rebus spiritualibus."

⁸ John 4:16.

⁹ St. Thomas, Super Evangelium S. Joannis, on 14:23 (1944): "Et ad eum veniemus" Deus dicitur venire ad nos non quod ipse moveatur ad nos, sed quia nos movemur ad ipsum. Dicitur enim aliquid venire ad locum in quem prius non fuit; hoc autem Deo non convenit, cum sit ubique. . . . Dicitur enim

my Father will love him and we will come to him and make our abode in him. ¹⁰ Charity is the human evidence of grace which bears witness to the divine indwelling. We have God as the Final Cause of our supernatural being because we love; and we love thus only because we first have God as the Efficient and Exemplar Cause of our

supernatural life. 11

The first truth we must remember for understanding charity's role in producing connaturality for divine things is this: by charity we possess God as really and substantially as we shall possess Him in the life of eternity. The charity by which we love God on earth is not essentially different from the charity with which we shall love Him in heaven. 12 Both as wayfarers and as the blessed of God we love by reason of a real Presence of God within us. On earth we love a God dwelling within us really and substantially but perceived only in the dark mirror of faith. In heaven we shall love this same God dwelling within us really and substantially but perceived in the clear vision of the light of glory. In both states love unites us immediately to God. 13 We do not love merely our concept of God or our idea of divinity, even though that idea or concept be God's own revelation of Himself, far outstripping the natural leap of the most wonderful human mind imaginable. We love God as He is in Himself. 14

No love can bring union with the beloved without bringing some kind of transformation into the beloved. ¹⁵ Love produces likeness. ¹⁶

venire ad aliquem inquantum est ibi novo modo, secundum quem prius non fuerat ibi, scilicet, per effectum gratiae et per hunc effectum gratiae facit nos ad se accedere."

10 John 14:23.

11 Cunningham, F., O.P., The Indwelling of the Trinity, ch. 6, (Recapitula-

ion, p. 211).

12 St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I II, q. 65, art. 5, c, et ad 1: "charitas non solum significat amorem Dei sed etiam amicitiam quamdam ad ipsum. . . . Haec autem societas hominis ad Deum, quae est quaedam familiaris conversatio cum ipso, inchoatur quidem hic in presenti per gratiam, perficietur autem in futuro per gloriam." cf. also, Idem, q. 67, art. 6, ad 1 et 2.

18 St. Thomas, Idem, II II, q. 27, art. 4, c.

14 Garrigou-Lagrange, R., O.P., De Virtutibus Infusis, pp. 472-473.

15 St. Thomas, Op. cit., I II, q. 26, art. 2, c.

16 St. Thomas, Scriptum Super Sententiis, III, d. 27, q. 1, art. 1: "amor nihil aliud est quam quaedam transformatio affectus in rem amatam.

If we have God within us by charity, it is that the charity of God might be poured out more abundantly within us. "The charity of God is poured forth in our hearts by the Holy Ghost who has been given to us." ¹⁷

The Spirit of Love who dwells within us to pour out His love is just as truly the Spirit of Life and the Spirit of Truth. ¹⁸ The God of Love who progressively manifests Himself by the communication of His own very life is a God who is subsisting intellect. ¹⁹ We cannot grow in love without growing in knowledge because the life we have by grace is a life of *knowing* love. ²⁰ "For the Spirit searches all things, even the deep things of God." ²¹ Love is not content to love in enduring darkness, either in the darkness of natural knowledge or in the obscurity of faith. It years for face-to-face vision of the Beloved. Love wants to break through the restrictions of formulas, even the formulas of faith, to see the Reality which is God.

The whole movement of love is toward possessing the Beloved as perfectly as possible to a creature of *mind* and will. As love deepens its hold on God it must in some way also engender a deeper understanding of God. This deepening of understanding comes from the connaturality for divine things which is an inseparable accompaniment of the transforming effects of love. ²²

¹⁷ Romans 5:5, Commentarium S. Thomae in hoc loco (caput 5, lectio 1): "Spiritum enim Sanctum, qui est amor patris et filii, dari nobis, est nos adduci ad participationem amoris, qui est Spiritus Sanctus. A qua quidem participatione efficimur Dei amatores. . ."

¹⁸ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas Pauli, in Primam ad Cor. caput 2, lectio 2: "Spiritus Sanctus est spiritus veritatis, utpote a Filio procedens, qui est veritas Patris, his quibus mittitur, inspirat veritatem, sicut et Filius a Patre missus notificat Patrem. . . .

¹⁹ St. Thomas, Summa, I. q. 14, art. 4, c.

²⁰ St. Thomas, *Idem*, I II, q. 28, art. 2, c: "Amans vero dicitur esse in amato secundum apprehensionem, inquantum amans non est contentus superficiali apprehensione amati, sed nititur singula quae ad amatum pertinent, intrinsecus disquirere; et sic ad interiora ejus ingreditur, sicut de Spiritu Sancto, qui est amor Dei, dicitur . . . quod "scrutatur etiam profunda Dei."

²¹ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, in 1 Cor., 2:10, caput 2, lectio 2: "Dicuntur autem profunda ea quae in ipso latent et non ea quae de ipso per creaturas cognoscuntur, quae quasi superficie tenus videntur esse, secundum illud Sap. 13, "A magnitudine speciei et creaturae cognoscibiliter poterit creator eorum videri."

²² John of St. Thomas, De Donis, d. 18, art. 4, 43.

In analyzing charity's role in producing connaturality for divine things we must never forget that the ideal of love is to be always preoccupied with God in holy emulation of the blessed. Charity can never achieve this ideal perfectly on earth. ²³ The "semper actu ferri in Deum" of St. Thomas is the happy state of the blessed. But the wayfarer has the same infinitely lovable God within him as the beatified saint has. Hence the interior vocation of love is as inexorable in its demands as the love of the blessed. ²⁴ St. Thomas, following St. Paul, speaks of the goad of charity which urges us. ²⁵ Charity utters an unrelenting summons of the Paraclete to come and find God ever more perfectly in one's own soul. ²⁶

Love's ultimate finding of God will be verified in vision, with God immediately present to the created intellect without created forms or formulas of faith. ²⁷ Love's provisional finding of God in its dark but valiant emulation of the blessed must be verified in some earthly analogue of this vision of the saints. What is this earthly analogue of vision? It must be knowledge through experience, born of love. It must be the insight of the man who, like Hierotheus, has been taught not only by learning but also by suffering divine things. ²⁸

II. CHARITY IS A REAL PARTICIPATION IN THE INTRATRINITARIAN LIFE OF GOD. THIS LIFE IS A LIFE OF KNOWLEDGE AND LOVE.

Charity of its own nature makes us cleave to God with connaturality. This is so because charity is a real participation in the intratrinitarian life of God.

²³ St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, II II, q. 24, art. 8, c.

²⁴ St. Thomas, De Perfectione Vitae Spiritualis, c. 6.

²⁵ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, in Heb. 4:11, c. 4, lectio 2.

²⁶ St. Thomas, Contra Retrahentes Homines a Religionis Ingressu, c. 6: "Sic igitur praeceptum dilectionis Dei quod est ultimus finis christiane vitae, nullis terminis coarctatur; ut possit dici, quod tanta dilectio Dei cadat sub praecepto; major autem dilectio limites praecepti excedens sub consilii cadat; sed unicuique praecipitur ut Deum diligat quantum potest; quod ex ipsa forma praecepti apparet, cum dicitur: "Diliges Dominum Deum tuum ex tota corde tuo". (cf. also II II, q. 44, a. 6.)

²⁷ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, in 1 Cor. 13:12, c. 13, lec. 4.

²⁸ St. Thomas, Summa, I, q. 1, art. 6, ad 3.

The Incarnate Son of God summed up the meaning of His mission among men in these words: "I have come that you might have life, and have it more abundantly." ²⁹ In its consummation this life, according to St. Thomas, is formally a life of beatified knowledge. ³⁰ Love consequent upon such beatific knowledge belongs, in Thomistic thought, to the integrity of heavenly beatitude. ³¹

The life which Christ came to bestow upon us is the very life of God. This life in God is eternally dynamic, eternally fruitful, eternally complacent in Himself. ³² The circumincession of the three divine Persons is nothing less than the theocentric holiness of God Himself. ³³ The eternal processions in God are the origins and exemplars of the supernaturalized thought-life and love-life of the sanctified soul. ³⁴

By grace the sanctified soul becomes a real partaker of the life of God. The dynamic principle of this divine life in the creature is charity. ³⁵ By charity the soul is plunged into the intratrinitarian life of God. ³⁶ The Father is there within it because this life is a dynamic life. Principium sine principio, He is eternally begetting His Son. Through a relation of paternity, which is of reason on God's part but real on the part of the creature, this begetting is still going on in the soul which is being sanctified. ³⁷

²⁹ John 10:10.

³⁰ St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I II, q. 3, art. 4, c.

³¹ Idem. I II, q. 4, art. 1, c.

³² Chambat, L., O.S.B., Les Missions des Personnes de la Sainte Trinité, pp. 75-76.

³³ DB 704 and Summa, I, q. 36, art. 1, c: "Sanctitas vero illis rebus attribuitur, quae in Deum ordinantur. Quia igitur persona divina procedit per modum amoris quo Deus amatur, convenienter Spiritus Sanctus nominatur."

³⁴ St. Thomas, Scriptum Super Sententiis, I, d. 14, q. 1, art. 1, sol. et art. 2, ad 2: "Et quia processiones personarum aeternae sunt causa et ratio totius productionis creaturarum, ideo oportet quod sicut generatio Filii est ratio totius productionis creaturae secundum quod dicitur Pater in Filio omnia fecisse, ita etiam amor Patris tendens in Filium ut in objectum sit ratio in qua Deus omnem effectum amoris creaturis largiatur; et inde est quod Spiritus Sanctus, qui est amor quo Pater amat Filium, est etiam amor quo amat creaturam impartiendo sibi suam perfectionem."

³⁵ St. Thomas, Idem, I, d. 17, q. 1, art, 1, ad 1.

³⁶ Gilleman, G., S.J., Le Primat de la Charité en Théologie Morale. p. 162.

³⁷ St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I, q. 43, art. 2, ad 2.

The Son is there, the eternally begotten One. He is still reflecting the splendor of the Father's glory by being the very figure of His substance. ³⁸ The temporal procession of this Son in the creature is going on through a configuration to Him by way of wisdom. ³⁹

The Father and Son are there actively breathing forth the Holy Spirit in the soul who loves; and the Spirit proceeds from them as from one principle in an eternally self-complacent procession of love. The temporal procession of the Spirit in the soul is a progressive sealing of Himself upon it by way of love. 40

There can be no growth in holiness in the creature without an ever more perfect mirroring of the intratrinitarian life of God. Growth in holiness comes about through growth in grace whose dynamic principle of operation is charity. So by charity we participate ever more fully in the earthly counterparts of the eternal processions of the Word and of the Spirit of Love. "The temporal procession," says Chambat, "does not terminate either in a pure presence or in a pure assimilation, but in an assimilating presence." ⁴¹

Consequently, there cannot be an increase of charity in us without a new temporal procession; nor can there be a new temporal procession without a new assimilation to the Word and the Spirit. ⁴²

³⁸ Hebrews 1:3.

³⁹ St. Thomas, Op. cit., I, q. 43, art. 2, c.: "Nam Filius ab eterno processit ut sit Deus; temporaliter autem, ut etiam sit homo, secundum missionem visibilem; vel etiam ut sit in homine, secundum invisibilem missionem." et Scriptum Super Sententiis, I, d. 15, q. 4, art. 1, sol: "Unde sicut Spiritus Sanctus invisibiliter procedit in mentem per donum amoris, ita Filius per donum sapientiae; in quo est manifestatio ipsius Patris, qui est ultimum ad quod recurrimus."

⁴⁰ St. Thomas, *Idem*, I, d. 14, q. 1, art. 1, ques. 2, sol: "Et ideo procedit ipse (Spiritus Sanctus) in nos et dona ipsius; quia et dona ejus recepimus et per eadem ad ipsum nos aliter habemus, inquantum per dona ejus ipsi Spiritui Sancto conjungimur per donum nos sibi assimilanti."

⁴¹ Chambat, L., O.S.B., Op. cit., p. 76.

⁴² St. Thomas, *Scriptum Super Sententiis*, I, d. 15, q. 4, art. 2, sol: "... propria ratio processionis Filii non est propria ratio processionis Spiritus Sancti, cum ille procedat ut amor et hic ut Filius vel Verbum; et similiter proprius modus quo Filius dicitur esse in creatura non est proprius modus quo Spiritus Sanctus est; quinimmo unus per sapientiam et alter per amorem... una missio nunquam est sine alia; quia amor sequitur notitiam; notitia perfecta, secundum

This new assimilation necessarily means a new sharing in the gifts proper to the Persons who give themselves to us.

"The Divine Persons," says St. Thomas, "by a kind of imprinting of a seal of themselves upon our souls, leave certain gifts therein which we formally enjoy, namely, wisdom and love." 43

Just as the Word cannot proceed temporally within us except by also breathing forth love. 44 so too the Holy Spirit cannot proceed temporally within us without concurrent illumination. "To manifest the *truth*," says Aquinas, "is becoming to the property of the Holy Spirit. For it is love which makes for the revelation of secrets." 45 The two missions have this in common that they are rooted in grace; but they are distinguished in the effects of grace produced by them, which are illumination of the intellect and the enflaming of our affective life. And so, concludes St. Thomas, "it is manifest that one procession cannot exist without the other because neither is without sanctifying grace nor is one Person separated from another." 46

The whole movement of charity within us is to make us more God-like. The temporal processions which make the soul with its supernaturalized faculties a tiny but living replica of the Blessed Trinity occur under the impetus of God's gratuitous love enflaming our own. Love then must produce a connaturality for divine things

quam est missio Filii semper inducit in amorem, et ideo simul infunduntur et simul augmentatur."

⁴³ St. Thomas, *Idem*, I, d. 14, q. 2, art. 2, ad 2: ". . . ipsae personae divinae quadam sui sigillatione in animabus nostris relinquunt quaedam dona quibus formaliter fruimur, scilicet, amor et sapientia. . "

44 St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I, q. 43, art. 5, ad 2: "Filius autem est Verbum, non qualecumque sed spirans amorem.... Non igitur secundum quamlibet perfectionem intellectus mittitur Filius, sed secundum talem instructionem intellectus qua prorumpat in affectum amoris...."

⁴⁵ St. Thomas, Super Evangelium S. Joannis, c. 14, lectio 4, (1916): "Manifestare autem veritatem convenit proprietati Spiritus Sancti. Est enim amor qui facit secretorum revelationem. . . ."

⁴⁶ St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I, q. 43, art. 5, ad 3: "Si autem quantum ad effectum gratiae, sic communicant duae missiones in radice gratiae; sed distinguuntur in effectibus gratiae, qui sunt illuminatio intellectus et inflammatio affectus. Et sic manifestum est quod una non potest esse sine alia; quia neutra est sine gratia gratum faciente, nec una persona separatur ab alia."

because by the interior law of its own being it cannot help but cleave to what is supremely lovable. 47

Love in the thoroughly purged soul makes even the infused moral virtues look for their perfect pattern in the *virtutes exemplares* of God. ⁴⁸ These, in St. Thomas' explanation of Plotinus, are nothing less than God's own thought of Himself, His holy self-complacence, His immutability, and His adherence to the law of His own wisdom. This kind of love which, apart from the blessed, is found only "in certain most perfect men" in this life, makes infused prudence look only to divine things; it urges justice to be wedded to the divine mind in a perpetual bond; it gives a model to temperance and fortitude so unearthly as to make the body unresponsive to earthly allure and unterrified by the threat of pain. ⁴⁹

Certainly this kind of charity must make a man know God with insights unknown to the man whose faith or theological habit is not similarly fired by an inner flame of godliness. For it is this kind of love which best enables a man to verify those three things necessary, according to St. Thomas, for him who wants to see God: (a) that he draw near to God, (b) that he lift up his eyes, and (c) that he be free for vision. ⁵⁰

In so disposing the soul for transforming union with God charity engenders the connaturality for divine knowledge which manifests itself in the intellectual gifts of the Spirit of Love.

III. THROUGH CHARITY THE SPIRIT OF LOVE SUBSTITUTES THE FILIAL SPIRIT OF CHRIST IN US FOR THE SPIRIT OF EGOTISM.

To all Christians St. Paul gave the uncompromising command: "Have this mind in you which was also in Christ Jesus." 51 St. Thomas tersely paraphrases the "Hoc sentite" by saying: "Hold by

⁴⁷ Idem, II II, q. 24, art. 11, c: "Alio modo potest considerari charitas secundum propriam rationem; et sic charitas non potest aliquid nisi id quod pertinet ad charitatis rationem. Unde charitas nullo modo potest peccare sic nec calor potest infrigidare et sicut etiam injustitia non potest bonum facere."

⁴⁸ Idem, I II, q. 61, art. 5, c.

⁴⁹ Ibidem.

⁵⁰ St. Thomas, Super Evangelium S. Joannis, c. 14, lectio 6, 2 (1941).

⁵¹ Phil. 2:5.

experimental proof what was in Christ Jesus." ⁵² This "sensus Christi," so necessary for all Christians, is preeminently required in the theologian. ⁵³ The connaturality for divine things engendered by charity is conducive to illumination in the theologian, first of all, by removing any impediment to his having the mind of Christ in him. This impediment comes from the befogging effects of pride. It is removed by charity's power to substitute the filial spirit of Christ for the egotism of pride in us.

Charity, says Aquinas, by uniting a man's affections to God makes that man live, not for himself, but for God. ⁵⁴ Pride, which is love of one's own excellence, is opposed to this filial complacence in God. ⁵⁵ The effect of pride upon knowledge of the truth is set forth in Gregory's words: "Swelling of the mind is an obstacle to truth because when it puffs up, it also beclouds." ⁵⁶ In explaining these words of Gregory, St. Thomas gives us an astute insight into the role of love in the production of knowledge.

He distinguishes between speculative and affective knowledge. ⁵⁷ The first is indirectly hurt by pride because the man in love with himself cannot subject his mind either to God, who reveals His secrets to little ones, or to learned men, who can help only the docile mind. The second, affective knowledge, is directly hurt by pride because the proud man, while delighting inordinately in his own excellence, disdains the splendor of truth. ⁵⁸ Again he quotes Gregory: "The proud, even if they perceive some hidden things by understanding

⁵² St. Thomas, *Commentaria in Epistolas Pauli*, in hoc loco, c. 2, lect. 2: "hoc sentite," id est, "experimento tenete quod fuit in Christo Jesu."

53 Garrigou-Lagrange, R. O.P., De Revelatione, p. 21: "Sacra Theologia magnum auxilium accepit a dono sapientiae, scilicet, perfectionem ipsius spiritus Domini seu sensus Christi qui quasi anima informat et vivificat Sacram Theologiam ad quamdam intelligentiam mysteriorum habendam, ad vitandos errores in difficilissimis questionibus. . . ." See also his italicized footnote from the Vatican Council, DB. 1796.

54 St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, II II, q. 17, art. 6, ad 3: "charitas proprie facit tendere in Deum, uniendo affectum hominis Deo ut scilicet homo

non sibi vivat sed Deo."

⁵⁵ St. Thomas, Idem, II II, q. 162, art. 2, c.

⁵⁶ St. Gregory, Moralia, 23, 17, 31; PL. 76, 269.

⁵⁷ St. Thomas, Op. cit., ibid, art. 3, ad 1.

⁵⁸ Ibidem.

them, are not able to taste their sweetness, and, if they know how they are, they are ignorant of how they taste."

Revealed truth, as it is contained in Sacred Scripture, is truth which can be savored only by the man who lives for God. ⁵⁹ In searching out the truth of other sciences, Aquinas reminds us, it is sufficient that a man be perfect according to his mind alone. But here a man must be perfect according to mind and affections. ⁶⁰ This is so because in sacred doctrine there are not only things to be considered speculatively, as in geometry, but also things to be approved by love. ⁶¹ And each one judges according as he is disposed toward the end proposed to him. ⁶²

Since by the grace of divine adoption we have been preordained to know and love God with a son's knowledge and a son's love, we have received the Holy Ghost, who is the Spirit of Jesus: "Because you are sons, God has sent the Spirit of His Son into your hearts, crying, Abba, Father." ⁶³ The Spirit's gift of love begets in us the filial spirit of Christ. He as Man, knows and loves the Father perfectly with truly filial complacence. The theologian must in a special way be illumined by human mind of Christ whom the Church envisions in glory and beautifully salutes with the title: "Casta Lux

59 St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, in Heb., caput 5, lectio 2: "Quanto enim quis magis ascendit in Deum, tanto plus contemnit temporalia."

60 Ibidem, "In aliis scientiis sufficit quod homo sit perfectus secundum intellectum; in istis vero requiritur quod sit perfectus secundum intellectum et affectum."

61 Ibidem, "Hoc enim habet sacrae scripturae doctrina quod in ipsa non tantum traduntur speculantia, sicut in geometria, sed etiam approbanda per affectum."

62 Ibidem, "Unusquisque enim secundum quod est dispositus, sic judicat; sicut iratus aliter judicat durante passione et aliter ipsa cessante. Et similiter incontinens aliter judicat aliquid esse bonum tempore passionis, aliter post. Et ideo dicit Philosophus quod unusquisque qualis est, talis sibi finis videtur; et quia quae in sacra scriptura traduntur, pertinent ad affectum et non tantum ad intellectum, ideo oportet esse perfectum in utroque. . . ."

68 Gal. 4:6, vide Commentaria St. Thomae in hoc loco, c. 4, lectio 3: "Alia est spiritualis (generatio) quae fit per semen spirituale transmissum in locum spiritualis generationis; qui quidem locus est mens seu cor hominis, quia in filios Dei generamur per mentis renovationem. Semen autem spirituale est gratia Spiritus Sancti. . . Tunc enim clamamus "Abba, Pater" quando per affectum accendimur calore Spiritus Sancti ad desiderium Dei. . . "

Amantium." ⁶⁴ But only in so far as he subdues his own sinful egotism can the theologian be disposed for far-reaching illumination by Christ's own mind. ⁶⁵

When Father Gilleman sets out to examine fundamental attitudes toward a Christocentric moral theology, he rightly, I think, stresses the dogmatic truth that there was no human personality in Jesus. ⁶⁶ Never were a human mind and a human will so completely at the service of a Divine Person as in the human life of our Lord. His human thinking and human loving were, of course, always the works of the Word. No human personality was there to intrude itself between His human activity and its perfect possession by the Son of God. ⁶⁷

Does not charity produce in us an imperfect human counterpart of this mysterious effect of the hypostatic union? "I live, now no longer I," cries out the enamoured Paul, "but Christ lives within me." 68 Through charity our disordered self, our sinful personality, the man of sin in us, becomes subordinated to the real self, the sanctified personality, the man of Christ. 69 In perfect charity there will no longer be any sinful intrusion of self between our human activity and its possession by God. 70 It is only by looking to Christ,

⁶⁴ Vesper Hymn: Feast of the Ascension.

⁶⁵ Contenson, V., O.P., Theologia Mentis et Cordis, I, Prael. 1, app. 2: "Accedit quod pietas non parum juvat ad arcana theologica penitus indaganda; pietas enim, quae, teste Apostolo, ad omnia utilis est, huic instituto necessaria videtur; etenim gustanda sunt prius divina mysteria quam videnda per speculationem, quia soli mundi corde Deum videbunt et in hoc saeculo et futuro." (cf. also I, Prael. 2, c. 2, refl.)

⁶⁶ Gilleman, G., S.J., Le Primat de la Charité en Theologié Morale, p. 202.

⁶⁷ *Ibidem*, "Pour Jésus-homme un retour sur soi serait un retour sur Dieu; son amour de soi est un amour de Dieu, amour humain de Dieu, tout désintéressé du créé qui ne peut lui apparaître comme un gain ni un enrichissement de sa vraie personalité."

⁶⁸ Gal. 2:20.

⁶⁹ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, in hoc loco, c. 2, lect. 6: "Sic ergo Christus in nobis renovat vitam novam, destructa vetustate peccati. Et ideo dicit, Vivo autem, id est, quia Christo confixus sum cruci, vigorem bene operandi habeo; jam non ego secundum carnem quia jam non habeo vetustatem quam prius habui, sed vivit in me Christus, id est, novitas quae per Christum nobis data est."

⁷⁰ Ibid. "Vivo autem, id est, jam non vivo ego, quasi in affectu habens

the Exemplar of perfect filial love, that we can begin to understand the mystery of charity itself. Basically, our charity, as Father Gilleman beautifully points out, makes us share in the human activity of Christ.⁷¹ And this human activity is the activity of One in whom dwells all the treasures of wisdom and understanding.

When the same author attempts to delineate the basic features of a moral theology built upon the primacy of love, he looks to the human activity of Christ for discovering the qualities of this Christocentric science. He finds a priori that it must be (a) a moral theology of generous communion with others, (b) a moral doctrine of filial devotedness, (c) a mystique of life finalized by death, (d) a sacramental moral, (e) a moral of authority and community living, (f) a moral doctrine of surpassing effort. All this is so because the Christian mind must be enlightened by the human mind of Christ and follow the summons of Christ's own Spirit of Love. In that human mind of Jesus dwells the fullness of theological wisdom. But in Christ Himself, as in all of us, such wisdom is brought into act "through an agency belonging to a higher sphere."

Here we might ask: is it possible for scientific theology to see its full material object without theological wisdom being aided by infused wisdom? ⁷⁵ In the area of moral theology, if it is true to say that only Christocentric thought can show us the full terrain of Christian activity dynamized by love, can sinful egotism keep us

proprium bonum; sed vivit in me Christus, id est, tantum Christum habeo in affectu, et ipse Christus est mea vita."

⁷¹ Gilleman, G. S.J., Op. cit., p. 164.

⁷² Idem. pp. 199-237.

⁷⁸ St. Thomas, Compendium Theologiae, c. 216: "Sed quia Christus secundum humanam naturam non solum fuit reparator naturae sed et gratiae propagator, affuit ei etiam tertia cognitio, qua plenissime cognovit quidquid ad mysteria gratiae potest pertinere, quae naturalem hominis cognitionem excedunt sed cognoscuntur ab hominibus per donum sapientiae vel per spiritum prophetiae."

⁷⁴ Ibidem, "Nam ad huiusmodi cognoscenda est in potentia intellectus humanus, licet ab altiori agente reducatur in actum."

⁷⁵ See Contenson in 1. c.; also *The Interior Life of St. Thomas Aquinas*, (Grabmann-Ashenbrener) pp. 45-46 for the role of infused wisdom in St. Thomas' theology of the Eucharist.

from seeing moral obligations where the saints would see them? ⁷⁶ If so, does not charity extend the area of moral obligation and thereby expand the subject matter of moral theology? ⁷⁷

There is a place in St. Thomas' commentary on the Epistle to the Philippians where he asks a similar question. The Apostle prays that the charity of his converts may more and more abound in knowledge and all discernment so that they may approve the better things. St. Thomas asks: "But does it then happen that science comes from love?" And he answers: "Yes." Resting on his principle that he who has a habit has right judgment in what pertains to the habit, St. Thomas suggests the regency of love in all areas of theological knowledge: "cognoscibilia" which pertain to dogma; "agibilia" which pertain to morals; and "potiora vel meliora" which, being discerned by a perceptive understanding, pertain to ascetical and mystical theology.⁷⁸

In this context so great an intellectual as Aquinas is eager to quote those inspired words so dear to the medieval mystics: "And as for you, let the anointing which you have received from him dwell in you, and you have no need that anyone teach you. But as his anointing teaches you concerning all things, and is true, and is no lie, even as it has taught you, abide in him." ⁷⁹

Only the anointing of the Spirit from on high can thoroughly imbue us with the "sensus Christi," and the anointing comes through love.

IV. CHARITY PRODUCES AN AFFECTIVE UNION WITH DIVINE
REALITIES AND THIS AFFECTIVE UNION IS VIRTUALLY
COGNITIVE, EVEN THOUGH IT BE SUPRACONCEPTUAL
MYSTICAL EXPERIENCE

St. John, the Beloved, great contemplative that he was, built his testimony to Christ upon three inseparable concepts: light, life, and

⁷⁶ cf. St. Thomas Summa, II II, q. 8, art. 7, c, on "duplex munditia" required in those who would see God.

⁷⁷ Merklebach, B., O.P., Summa Theologiae Moralis, I, De Fide, Paris Prima, q. 2, art. 3, (Explicatio subjectiva in mente cuiusque fidelis).

⁷⁸ St. Thomas, Commentaria in Epistolas, on Phil. 1:3, c. 1, lectio 2. 79 1 John 2:27.

love.⁸⁰ Christian mysticism has always delighted in that tender Cenacle scene wherein light and love in the soul of a man were fed at the breast of Life itself: John questioned Christ about the mystery of redemption while leaning on the breast of our Lord. Commenting upon this incident, St. Thomas observes:

Mystically, we are meant to understand from this scene that the more a man wants to understand the secrets of divine wisdom, so much the more ought he to strive to come closer to Jesus. "Draw near to him and you will be enlightened," says the Psalmist. For the secrets of divine wisdom are especially revealed to those who are joined to God through love.⁸¹

Although, speaking unqualifiedly, the intellect is for St. Thomas a higher and nobler faculty than the will, it is nonetheless better to love God in this life than to know Him. This is so because something is required for the perfection of knowledge which is not required for the perfection of love. To know something perfectly we must know it in all its detail; to love it perfectly we must simply love it in itself, even though we do not apprehend it completely. Hence it happens, says the Angelic Doctor, that "something may be loved more than it is known because it is able to be loved perfectly even if it is not known perfectly. And this can be said of the love of God." The same said of the love of God." The

Charity causes this affective union with God and divine things. It is a union which penetrates deeper into the goodness of God than is commensurate with the mind's shadowy knowledge of God's su-

⁸⁰ Grossouw, W., Revelation and Redemption (tr. Schoenberg), ch. 2, pp. 27-49, vide etiam pp. 111-118.

⁸¹ St. Thomas, Super Evangelium S. Joannis, caput 13, lectio 4 (1807): "Mystice autem per hoc datur intelligi quod quanto magis homo vult divinae sapientiae secreta capere, tanto magis conari debet ut propinquior fiat Jesu, secundum illud Ps. 33:6, 'Accedite ad eum et illuminamini.' Nam divinae sapientiae secreta illis praecipue revelantur qui Deo juncti sunt per amorem."

⁸² St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, I. q. 82, art. 3, c: "Unde melior est amor Dei quam cognitio. . . . simpliciter autem intellectus est nobilior quam voluntas."

⁸³ Idem, I II, q. 27, art. 2, ad 2.

⁸⁴ *Ibidem*, "Ob hoc contingit aliquid plus ametur quam cognoscitur, quia potest perfecte amari, etiamsi non perfecte cognoscatur. . . . Et similiter est dicendum circa amorem Dei."

preme intelligibility.⁸⁵ This deeper penetration of love, while not being formally cognitive in a way unknown to faith or theology, is nonetheless virtually cognitive.⁸⁶ This is so because it actuates the gift of wisdom under the special movement of the Holy Spirit.⁸⁷

"Wisdom which is a gift," says Aquinas, "has its cause indeed in the will, namely, charity, but it has its essence in the intellect whose act is to judge rightly." 88

This right judgment coming from wisdom fired by love is a judgment through "a certain experimental and affective union in an interior taste." 89

85 John of St. Thomas, De Donis, Disp. 18, art. 4, 13: ". . . amor et affectus licet ex parte rei amatae non possit aliud experiri et attingere quam quod sibi proponitur, quia non potest ferri in incognitum et non proponitum, tamen ex parte modi attingendi potest plus et meliori modo experiri et uniri objecto quam per intellectum sibi proponatur, quia stat bene quod per intellectum sibi proponatur obscure et involute, et ex hac parte imperfecte, et tamen voluntas feratur in ipsum objectum immediate et in se. Sicut facit charitas, etiamsi per fidem sibi proponatur Deus obscure, imo voluntas aliquando solet tanto ardentius desiderare rem in seipsa videre et frui quanto sibi per velamina occultatur, quia licet non proponatur sibi res ut est in se, sed sub testimonio extrinseco, tamen hoc in illo velamine proponitur quod plus latet de re quam cognoscatur et manifestetur; et illud plus quod latet etiam voluntas desiderat, illique unitur affectus, quod nescit proponere intellectus."

86 William of St. Thierry, De Natura et Dignitate Amoris, c. 8 to c. 10. PL 184, 390-399: col. 390: "Ipsa (charitas) est oculus quo videtur Deus." col. 393: Cum tamen, ut dixi, invicem se adjuvant, et ratio docet amorem et amor illuminat rationem." col. 399: "Hic est gustus quam in Christo facit nobis spiritus intellectus, intellectus, scilicet, Scripturarum et sacramentorum Dei." (q. v. in toto.)

87 John of St. Thomas, Op. cit, ibidem, 14: "Et sic licet fides regulat amorem et unionem ad Deum quatenus objectum proponit, tamen ex ista unione qua tangitur ab affectu Deus immediate eique unitur, movetur intellectus sicut a quadam experientia affectiva ad judicandum altiori modo de divinis quam illa obscuritas fidei patiatur, quia penetrat et cognoscit plus latere in rebus fidei quam fides manifestat, quia plus ibi amat et plus gustat in affectu, et ex illo plus quod cognoscit judicat altius de ipsis rebus divinis, innitens affectui experimentali (priusquam nudo testimonio credentis) cum instinctu Spiritus Sancti sic altiori modo certificentis et moventis intellectum."

⁸⁸ St. Thomas, *Summa Theologica*, II II, q. 45, art. 2, c: "Sic ergo sapientia, quae est donum, causam habet in voluntate; scilicet, charitatem; sed essentiam habet in intellectu cujus actus est recte judicare."

89 John of St. Thomas, Op. cit, Disp. 18, art. 4, 41: "Nam formalis ratio

It is to St. Bonaventure, the Seraphic Doctor, that we turn to find what is perhaps the boldest affirmation of how affective union brings with it a cognitive virtuosity. In discussing the relationship between wisdom and understanding, the learned Franciscan doctor avers that wisdom directs understanding because "experimental knowledge concerning the divine sweetness broadens speculative knowledge concerning divine truth; for the secrets of God are ordinarily revealed to His friends and familiars." 90

It is the gift of wisdom, according to Bonaventure, which leads to ecstatic knowledge; ⁹¹ this is the highest grade of knowledge possible to a creature this side of heaven. Such wisdom, he says, is a knowledge with a conjoined savoring of divine things through which "the intellect is enlightened and the will rooted in good." ⁹²

Etienne Gilson in his masterful study of St. Bonaventure's philosophy tells us in what sense this enlightenment of the intellect can be called truly cognitive:

"It is only in a very special sense," he says, "that St. Bonaventure defines ecstasy as an experimental knowledge of God; for there is no question here of an knowledge properly so called; yet it remains that ecstasy is an experience, and that this experience, which is not knowledge, is pregnant with all knowledge which is ultimately to be developed from it. Hence his allusions to the science and light hidden in ecstasy. . . . " 93

qua sapientia procedit et judicat de veritatibus est ex causa suprema et altissima quae est Deus, quatenus cognoscitur ex quadam experimentali et affectiva unione et interiori gustu. . . ."

90 St. Bonaventure, Expositio in Libros Sententiarum, III, pars prima of Dist. 34, art. 2, q. 2 ad 2: "Et propter hoc dicit quaedam Glossa quod donum sapientiae donum intellectus habet dirigere; quod ideo dictum est, quia cognitio experimentalis de divina suavitate amplificat cognitionem speculativam de divina veritate: secreta enim Dei amicis et familiaribus consueverunt revelari."

91 Idem, III, Dist. 24, dubium 4: ". . . cognoscitur (Deus) etiam per intimam unionem Dei et animae juxta quod dicit Apostolus "Qui adhaeret Deo, unum spiritus est cum eo." Et haec est cognitio excellentissima quam docet Dionysius quae quidem est in exstatico amore et elevat supra cognitionem fidei secundum communem statum."

92 Ibidem, "Unde haec scientia sapientia est quia secum habet junctum saporem et per hanc illuminatur intellectus et stabilitur affectus."

98 Gilson, E., The Philosophy of St. Bonaventure. (tr. Trethowan and Sheed) p. 462.

The Bonaventurian doctrine on the mysterious illumination of the mind through love is well expressed by Gilson in these words:

It is love which goes the farthest in the soul's exploration of being; for whereas our faculty of knowing cannot pursue Being to the point of seeing it, our love can pursue it—as Good—to the point of contact and joy in it. The experience of God as the mystic has it is exclusively affective. . . . 94

In his Breviloquium Bonaventure's treatment of the Grace of the Holy Ghost (Part 5) reveals that the soul's ascent to this mystical illumination is under the regency of love along the way. He first shows us the soul's equipment for its ascent to God, namely, habits of virtue, habits of the gifts, and habits of the beatitudes, which, in turn, produce the fruits and spiritual senses.95 Then he tells us how the practice of charity is the unifying principle of all these operations of the Spirit leading to God.96 The habitual equipment which is progressively dynamized by love is the Jacob's ladder reaching from earth to heaven.97 Its summit leads to the throne of the most wise King, Christ Himself; the summit is reached through the way of wisdom which is a nocturnal and delightful illumination. No one knows what this is like except him who experiences it; no one experiences it unless given it by God; and no one is given it except by the practices of merits, namely, faith, love, the evangelical counsels, and filial prayer.98

⁹⁴ Idem, p. 460.

⁹⁵ St. Bonaventure, Breviloquium, Paris Quinta, c. 4, to c. 7.

⁹⁶ Idem, c. 8: "charitas ipsa est radix, forma, et finis virtutum, quae jungit omnes cum ultimo fine, et ligat omnia ad invicem simul, et ordinat; ac per hoc ipsa est pondus inclinationis ordinatae, et vinculum colligationis perfectae; ordinem quidem servans respectu diligendorum diversorum, quantum ad affectum pariter et effectum; unitatem autem habens in habitu quantum ad unum finem, et unum principale dilectum, quod est ratio diligendi respectu omnium aliorum dilectorum, quae per amoris vinculum nata sunt colligari in unum Christum quantum ad caput et corpus, quod unitatem continet in se salvandorum: quae unitas nunc inchoatur in vita sed consummatur in aeterna gloria. . . . Qua unitate consummata per vinculum charitatis erit Deus omnia in omnibus. . . ."

⁹⁷ Idem, caput 6, conclusio.

⁹⁸ Idem, c. 7 to c. 10 inc.

In directing the potential mystic to the "practices of merit" in his pursuit of wisdom, Bonaventure is outlining a program of action founded on love. Its effectiveness is expressed theologically by John of St. Thomas when he writes:

The will does not formally illuminate the intellect. However it can causally furnish the intellect with greater light in so far as love makes the object more united to the soul, more immediately attached to it, and tasted by it. . . . 99

Conclusion: Charity Is the Dynamic Unitive Force Behind Theology in All Its Functions

The classic phrase for expressing the function of theology is "fides quaerens intellectum." ¹⁰⁰ In great theologians like Aquinas and Bonaventure, who were also saints, this seeking for the understanding of mystery was an adventure of love. The saints hungered for the knowledge of God. The very light they received brought the pain of still greater hunger with it. ¹⁰¹

There is a touching poignancy in the words of the suffering Aquinas to Reginald when the secretary was urging St. Thomas to write still more before he died. "Reginald, I am not able; for all that I have written appears as straw compared with what I have seen. I hope that God will soon prepare an end to my life and teaching." 102 It was this yearning for perfect union which supplied the dynamic behind all the "sweat and study" of theological effort. It was this same yearning of love which led Thomas to heights where even his angelic mind reeled under the impact of God's light and was left longing "to be dissolved and to be with Christ." 108

Charity in the saints was the driving force behind all their works and in none more so than in their works of theology. If to

⁹⁹ John of St. Thomas, *De Donis*, Disp. 18, art. 4, 15: ". . . voluntas non formaliter illuminat intellectum sed potest causaliter majus lumen praebere seu perficere quatenus reddit objectum magis unitum sibi per amorem et immediatius in se attactum et gustatum. . . .

¹⁰⁰ St. Anselm, Proslogion, Proemium, PL, 158, 225.

¹⁰¹ St. Thomas, Summa Theologica, II, II, q. 180, art. 7, ad 2 et 3.

¹⁰² Acta Sanctorum, Martii, Tome 1, p. 712.

¹⁰³ Phil. 1:13.

this science there is attributed all that by which most wholesome faith is begotten, nourished, defended, and strengthened, it must never be forgotten that "fides saluberrima" is faith vivified by love. 104 While charity, as Father Congar notes, does not enter into the noetic structure of theology, whose mode of union with its object is intentional and intellectual, not affective and real, it nonetheless supplies a filial drive giving impetus to the theologian's research and a congeniality for the fruits of his discovery. 105

This impetus given by love to the pursuit of wisdom is never a substitute for "sweat and study." It is rather the good which makes the theologian's yearning for God express itself in the proper manifestations of his special zeal for the cause of Christ. And the first manifestation proper to him as a scientist is to study. Without, however, in any way detracting from the rigorous scientific effort which must go into the making of the expert theologian, we can subscribe, I think, to Bonaventure's conviction that "the ecstatic excesses of Christian wisdom" can be reached in only one way:

There is no way except through a most ardent love for the Crucified One, which so thoroughly transformed Paul . . . into Christ that he could say: With Christ I am nailed to the cross; I live, now no longer I, but Christ lives in me. 106

As we begin our convention I know no better prayer to utter in behalf of all of us than the one which fell from the lips of the same holy Paul:

And this I pray, that your charity may more and more abound in knowledge and all discernment, so that you may approve the better things, that you may be upright and without offense unto the day of Christ, filled with the fruit of justice, through Christ Jesus, to the glory and praise of God.¹⁰⁷

AUGUSTINE P. HENNESSY, C.P.

¹⁰⁴ St. Thomas, Op. cit., I, q. 1, art. 2, sed contra.

¹⁰⁵ Congar, M.J., "Théologie" DTC, 15, 489.

¹⁰⁶ St. Bonaventure, Itinerarium Mentis ad Deum, Prol. (cf. also c. 7): "Via autem non est nisi per ardentissimum amorem Crucifixi, qui adeo Paulum ad tertium coelum raptum transformavit in Christum ut diceret "Christo confixus sum cruci; vivo ego, jam non ego, vivit autem in me Christus. . ." Cf. also, Idem, Lignum Vitae, Praefationis conclusio.

¹⁰⁷ Phil. 1:9.

LETTER ADDRESSED TO THE MEMBERS OF THE HIERARCHY

January 6, 1956.

YOUR EXCELLENCY:

Within a few days Your Excellency will receive the latest issue of the PROCEEDINGS published by the Catholic Theological Society of America. For some time now you have been receiving each year a copy of the PROCEEDINGS of our annual convention. This year we are accompanying our gift with this short letter because we feel that our tenth anniversary was a notable event in the development of our Society.

Our Tenth Convention brought us back to New York City where we had our Foundation Meeting in 1946. The intervening years have been much blessed by God. Our membership has increased from the original 104 charter members to more than 500 present active members, among whom we are privileged to number some representatives of the Hierarchy. Our ten conventions, we think, have made some modest contributions to the advancement of theological thought and have been profitable to all of us as teachers of future priests. We are especially indebted in this matter to those Archbishops and Bishops who have so kindly acted as our hosts at conventions held in their episcopal cities.

As we enter our second decade the members of the Society are anxious to thank the Hierarchy of the United States and Canada for their encouragement of the work of the Theological Society. At the same time, with all due reverence and humility, we wish to proffer the services of the group for any theological projects which may be suggested by members of the Hierarchy.

With prayers and good wishes for Your Excellency's health and work, I am,

Sincerely yours in Christ,

Augustine Paul Hennessy, C.P.,

President.

St. Joseph's Monastery 3800 Frederick Avenue Baltimore 29, Maryland