

analogical connection of inculturation with incarnation has been replaced by a translation model of inculturation.

Hillman concluded by questioning if the Incarnation were taken seriously as a principle of action by persons engaged in crosscultural ministries, whether this might prove to be a transforming leaven even more illuminating and revitalizing than the current dialogue among separated Christians.

In the discussion which followed Hillman's presentation, participants raised the issue of the relationship between the universal and local church citing limitations of an emphasis on each.

SUSAN K. WOOD, S.C.L.
Saint John's University
Collegeville, Minnesota

HISPANIC/LATINO THEOLOGIES

For the seventh consecutive year, the workshop on U.S. Hispanic/Latino theology met during the annual CTSA convention. Orlando Espín of the University of San Diego, again served as convener and moderator.

This year the workshop centered on two recent books by Latina theologians: María Pilar Aquino's *Our Cry for Life* (New York: Orbis Books, 1993), and Ada María Isasi-Díaz's *En la Lucha / In the Struggle: A Hispanic Women's Liberation Theology* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1993). Two well-known non-Latino theologians were invited to review the books during the meeting and start the discussion among the participants. The two theologians were Lisa Sowle Cahill and David Hollenbach, both of Boston College. (The just-published book by Jeanette Rodríguez, *Our Lady of Guadalupe: Faith and Empowerment among Mexican-American Women*, was not available in time for review by the panelists.)

After presentations from the reviewers and authors, the floor was opened for discussion. The presentations and discussion revolved, first, around the emphasis placed by Aquino on the need of Latina/feminist theologies to challenge liberation theologies (and, indeed, all mainstream theologies). Feminist theology is not an appendix but a necessary epistemology for all theology. An interesting discussion followed on the discovery and role of causality and its implications for liberation from oppression.

Isasi-Díaz's book led to a conversation on the role of moral agency and protagonism in social, ecclesial, and familial contexts. Participants emphasized that, by retrieving the theme of "agency," the author showed the link between Latina

women's experience and the best (and often disregarded) Western moral tradition.

Both *Our Cry for Life* and *En la Lucha / In the Struggle* brought out very serious questions concerning (and substantial dialogue on) how traditions and experiences of particular human groups can relate to issues regarding the "universally human."

This year's workshop exposed many Euro-American theologians to the work of some of their Latino colleagues. It further pointed to the need for continuing and expanding the dialogue, as it affects the theological enterprise. Approximately thirty-five participants shared in this year's workshop.

ORLANDO O. ESPÍN
University of San Diego
San Diego, California

JOHN COURTNEY MURRAY GROUP

MURRAY'S SHIFT FROM A CONCEPTUALISTIC TO A HISTORICALLY EMBEDDED CHRISTOLOGY

Presenters: Charles Curran, Southern Methodist University
Leon Hooper, Woodstock Theological Center
Thomas Hughson, Marquette University

The presentations focused on Murray's systematic theologies of the 1930s through 1967. It was noted that (1) Murray was more comfortable with the Christ of Nicea than with the Jesus of Nazareth, i.e., that his Christologies remained firmly in an intellectualist tradition, and (2) that his early Christology was shaped by the Catholic manualists, while his late theology relied heavily on the trinitarian theology of Lonergan. At issue was whether Murray's work in all its forms represents a tradition in sharp discontinuity with present christological approaches, or whether it both mirrored and facilitated a shift from conceptualistic and ahistorical Christologies to the contemporary focus of Catholic Christologies on history.

Hooper outlined the conceptualism of Murray's earlier manualist theology. For the early Murray, theology foundationally represented the redemption of theoretical intelligence. It took the beatific vision as its primary model for human participation in God's life, understanding redemptive truth as timeless, essentially ahistorical and asocial. Curran described the fundamental dualism in Murray's