

Appendix 2
CTSA WOMEN'S SEMINAR
IN CONSTRUCTIVE THEOLOGY:
A THUMBNAIL HISTORY IN THREE ACTS

Prelude

WOMEN'S INVOLVEMENT IN CTSA, 1965–1986

Founded in 1946 as a society of priest-theologians, the Catholic Theological Society of America admitted its first women members, Elizabeth Jane Farians and Cathleen M. Going, in 1965. Already in 1953, Christian Brother Luke Salm was accepted as the first “noncleric” member. A change in membership requirements in 1964 permitted anyone “professionally competent in Sacred Theology” to join, opening the door to these two professionally qualified women. The welcome was far from warm and beginnings were rocky. When Elizabeth Farians attended the convention for the first time in 1966 and attempted to enter the banquet, she was initially denied, and then only reluctantly granted admission.¹ Despite what she later described as this “horrific experience,” a growing trickle of qualified women continued to seek and gain membership and attend the annual convention. Let it be noted that on the fortieth anniversary of Farians’s ordeal, she once again attended the CTSA. After she addressed the more than sixty women present at the Women’s Seminar luncheon, the group feted her pioneering spirit with a plaque and a standing ovation. In addition, she was a special guest of President Mary Catherine Hilker at the John Courtney Murray Award banquet, which she entered with no problem at all.

In 1968 Agnes Cunningham and Jane Stier were appointed to the committee on admissions, becoming the first women to serve on a CTSA committee. Cunningham’s subsequent rise to leadership testifies both to her gifts and to the efforts of the Society to accommodate women’s presence. In 1969 she became the first woman elected to the board of directors as well as the first to address the

¹See annex A for details and correct account. Robert Wister’s chronology of “CTSA Firsts,” detailed in *CTSA Proceedings* 50 (1995): 293-98, marks several key developments leading to the declericalization of the Society and mentions several key instances of women’s advancement in the Society, to which may be added here mention of the first woman treasurer (Mary E. Hines, 1988–1994), first woman editor of the *Proceedings* (Judith A. Dwyer, 1995–1997), and first woman executive secretary (Maryanne Stevens, 1994–1995). Robert Wister’s chronology of the CTSA, detailed in the 1995 *Proceedings*, marks several key developments leading to the declericalization of the Society.

organization, speaking on "The Role of Women in Church and Society." In 1970 Cunningham was elected CTSA Secretary, serving in that capacity until her election as vice president in 1976 and President a year later. In 1978 she became the first woman to deliver a presidential address at the annual convention. In that same year, a committee chaired by Sara Butler presented its research report on *Women in Church and Society*, which sparked a well-attended and spirited discussion.² The welcome of women into prominence in the CTSA seemed assured in 1984, when Monika K. Hellwig became the first woman to receive the John Courtney Murray Award and was also elected to presidential office. Ever since Hellwig's election in 1984 there have been at least two women on the CTSA board, serving as elected officers or appointed as executive secretary or editor of the *Proceedings*.

In the early 1980s, women began to assume leadership of subject-area seminars. Mary Ann Donovan chaired the Trinity seminar during 1981–1983; Elizabeth A. Johnson chaired the Christology seminar for five years (1982–1986); Anne E. Patrick served on a steering committee for the Moral Theology seminar for three years (1983–1985); and Catherine Mowry LaCugna chaired the Trinity seminar for four years (1984–1987). In each case, these scholars were responsible for planning the two sessions held at each convention, moderating them, and writing summaries for the *Proceedings*. As other women also assumed leadership of seminars, such as Elizabeth Dreyer (Spirituality, 1985), and Mary Catherine Hilkert and Susan Ross (Theological Anthropology, 1986), conditions for the possibility of the women's seminar were in place. Increasing numbers of women were attending conventions, with some gaining leadership experience in the society. Various men leaders had been active in inviting women's participation in plenary and break-out sessions. Women were routinely elected to board positions. And women's topics were successful program events that drew many participants. This last development was the factor that led eventually to the women's seminar, for these sessions drew overflow crowds but were scheduled at the same time as other seminars and workshops in which women also had an interest.

²Initials for religious communities of women members of CTSA have been omitted, as is generally the custom on convention programs, but it is of historical significance that women religious were particularly influential in bringing women's leadership and concerns into this organization. Here are the congregational affiliations of sisters whose part in this history is mentioned in this narrative, in order of first mention: Agnes Cunningham SSCM, Jane Stier OSU, Sara Butler MSBT, Mary Ann Donovan SC, Elizabeth A. Johnson CSJ, Anne E. Patrick SNJM, Mary Catherine Hilkert OP, Jamie Phelps OP, Regina Coll CSJ, Mary Ann Hinsdale IHM, Ellen Leonard CSJ, and Dawn Nothwehr OSF. Indeed, there are numerous other women deserving of mention, just as there are men whose proactive efforts on behalf of justice for women in the CTSA have contributed to the development of this seminar.

Act One

THE BREAKFAST MEETINGS (1987–1989)

In 1986 the Theological Anthropology seminar held a session on “The Future of Humanity: Feminist Perspectives,” cochaired by Susan A. Ross and Mary Catherine Hilker along with John Farrelly. There was a very exciting buzz around this session, both before and afterward. Many CTSA women were involved, and their ongoing deliberations led to envisioning a book, which later came out as *In the Embrace of God: Feminist Approaches to Theological Anthropology*, edited by Ann O’Hara Graff.³ According to the convention schedule, the Christology and Trinity seminars were scheduled at the same. As these sessions concluded, chairs Elizabeth Johnson and Catherine LaCugna bumped into each other in the hall. Both bemoaned the fact that they were missing the exciting discussions held by women in the Theological Anthropology seminar. Nevertheless, they shared a strong conviction about the value of women leading and participating in these other key seminars. So they hatched an idea. Why not gather the women together to discuss theology, but at a time when it would not interfere with other interests and duties? Going through and discarding all kinds of time periods during the convention, they came up with the only slot open: breakfast. The two of them proposed this idea to Vice President Michael J. Scanlon, who was about to become president-elect responsible for planning the next year’s convention. He responded with enthusiasm. Asking how much they thought it would cost, he generously offered to have the CTSA treasury pay for it. This is in fact what happened. The CTSA funded the first gathering of its women members.

At that same convention in 1986 Johnson was elected a member of the Board of Directors, and at the invitation of Scanlon she presented the idea of a women’s breakfast to the entire board during its post-convention meeting. No formal vote was taken, since this changed nothing about the convention’s procedures, but general approval was evident. Information went out with the convention literature, and the first women’s breakfast took place June 12, 1987 at 7:30 a.m. in Philadelphia. There were about 20 women in attendance, including Monika Hellwig, that year’s President. Johnson and LaCugna welcomed participants and told the story of how the breakfast came to exist. Over juice, coffee, and Danish, the women introduced themselves, shared what research they were working on, and announced information about job openings in their places of work—university, college, or seminary. There was little time for any formal presentation, but the excitement of such shared words almost made this group late for the first plenary session at 9:00 a.m. Finally women theologians had a space in which to gather without being pulled away from the other activities of the convention!

³(Maryknoll NY: Orbis, 1995).

In 1988 and again in 1989, the women's breakfast took place, this time paid for by the participants. Information was sent out with the convention literature, and tickets sold with registration either through the mail or at the convention. The number of women at each successive breakfast grew rapidly. Still, the need for substantive discussion of theological topics from a feminist perspective could not be met within the limited time frame of a breakfast.

Act Two

THE POST-CONVENTION SEMINARS (1990–1993)

At the 1988 convention in Toronto, President-elect John P. Boyle had scheduled a workshop organized by Ann O'Hara Graff on "Women Creating Theology." It drew an overflow audience that required seating in the hallway outside the room. This reminder that the women's breakfast had not solved a basic problem led President-elect Anne E. Patrick to report to the board in October 1988 that "women members feel torn between the time given to women's concerns and the time given to their particular disciplines." She went on to say that "the solution might be for the women members to arrange a special 'women's concerns' meeting immediately before or after the convention."⁴ In the ensuing months Patrick and Vice President Walter Principe were in conversation with Ann O'Hara Graff about this possibility for the 1990 convention. Plans went forward to propose a change to the women who would attend the next breakfast meeting. At that breakfast meeting on June 9, 1989 in St. Louis, agreement was quickly reached that the following year the breakfast would be replaced by a women's luncheon on the last day of the convention. This would be followed by an event open to all interested CTSA members, a "Saturday afternoon Women's Seminar which will be planned by a steering committee composed of Ann Graff, Elizabeth Johnson, and Jamie Phelps."⁵

Shepherded by their leadership, the first "Women's Theology Seminar" took place Saturday afternoon June 9, 1990 in San Francisco, on the topic "The Construction of Feminist Systematic Theology." The aim of the first part of the program, which was scheduled from 2:00-3:30, was to provide a forum in which work-in-progress could be shared. The hope was that those attending would learn of important new work, and also that those presenting papers might benefit from the insights and suggestions of colleagues as they prepared their research for publication. Circulated in advance of the convention, two papers were discussed at this session, namely, Elizabeth Johnson, "God as Triune: Mystery of Relation," and Susan Ross, "Notes Toward a Feminist Sacramental Theology." The second part of the program, which lasted from 3:40-5:00, consisted of a practical colloquium

⁴Minutes of CTSA board meeting (22 October 1988) p. 4. Thanks here are due to former CTSA Secretary Edward H. Konerman for assistance in obtaining records about developments during the 1980s.

⁵"President-elect's Report," *CTSA Proceedings* 44 (1989): 184.

for women members on “Sharing Strategies for Survival and Growth in Various Settings,” moderated by Joann Wolski Conn.

The Women’s Seminar in Constructive Theology, the group’s official name, met annually on the afternoon following the close of the convention for four years. Ann O’Hara Graff moderated the seminar from 1990 until 1992, with Pamela Kirk serving in that capacity from 1992 through 1994.

Act Three

THE PRE-CONVENTION SEMINARS (1994–PRESENT)

With the changing of the convention meeting days from Wednesday-Saturday to Thursday-Sunday, the position of the seminar at the close of the convention became a matter of concern. Some women had to miss the seminar due to the need to travel home at the end of the weekend. In addition, the traditional banging of the gavel which brought the annual meeting to a close seemed to some to make the women’s seminar something of an afterthought to the major work of the convention. In 1993, after a poll of seminar members showed strong support, Pamela Kirk requested that the time be moved to the afternoon *before* the official evening opening of the convention, and the CTSA board so approved. Starting in 1994 and remaining until this writing at the 20th anniversary, this pre-convention time slot has served as the location of the seminar.

Ann O’Hara Graff resumed a leadership role in 1995, convening the seminar and writing the report for the *Proceedings* on a session that focused on the CTSA’s 50th anniversary convention theme, “Evil and Hope: Womanist/Feminist Contributions.” Her report opens thus:

The purpose of this seminar is to study together the ways in which women are shaping the theological tradition through discussion of the method and content of recent constructive contributions to the discipline. Among several new texts by women on evil and hope, the seminar steering committee chose two, Emily M. Townes, ed., *A Troubling in My Soul: Womanist Perspectives on Evil and Suffering*, and Wendy Farley, *Tragic Vision and Divine Compassion*. These were chosen both for their intrinsic value, and because the seminar has been quite intentional about our pursuit of conversation among diverse women.

(Proceedings 50 [1995]: 267)

Although Graff was listed as a convener for the 1996 seminar on the programs mailed to members that spring, by then she was too ill with ovarian cancer to travel. She died in Seattle June 9, 1996, the day the convention ended in San Diego. The seminar on June 6 had been co-convened by Susan St. Ville and Susan Simonaitis, who generously stepped in to fill the gap; they also contributed the report to the *Proceedings*. Because Graff’s leadership was acknowledged to have been so crucial during the first several years of the seminar’s existence, the group decided to institute the Ann O’Hara Graff Memorial Award in 1997. The award recognizes a woman whose work embodies the quality present in Graff’s work, namely, the intersection of scholarship, faith, and lived experience. The first recipient was Joan

Timmerman, and Graff's parents were present at the luncheon in Minneapolis when the award was given. In addition to a citation, the recipient receives a rosebush planted on the grounds of the institution where she teaches, along with a crystal vase for the flowers. This vase gets passed on annually to the next honoree. Recipients of the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award to date are: Joan Timmerman (1997); Regina Coll (1999); Diana Hayes (2000); Susan Ross (2001); Mary Ann Hinsdale (2002); Monika Hellwig (2003); Ellen Leonard (2004); Gaile Pohlhaus (2005); Maria Pilar Aquino (2006).

A new generation of leaders rose up to convene the seminar in the late 1990s and into the new millennium. Susan St. Ville and Susan Simonaitis planned and led the seminar from 1996 to 1999. They were followed by Elena Procario-Foley and Jane Redmont from 2000 to 2002; Redmont and Gaile Pohlhaus in 2003; Pohlhaus and Elaine MacMillan in 2004; MacMillan and Dawn Nothwehr in 2005 and 2006. Subjects presented and discussed have ranged from postmodern theory to conscience and authority, from theological education to sacramentality, from Catholicism in public life to female names for God, and from a feminist interpretation of the cross to human identity in feminist ethics. Annex B presents a detailed account gleaned from the convention program and *Proceedings*. The Women's Seminar in Constructive Theology is the fruit of the collaboration of many women forging a way where there was no way. Twenty years out it functions as a vibrant colloquium of interested women and men. Its primary goal is to promote and assist the women whose research is engaging feminist, womanist, and *mujerista* theories and who are testing new, constructive theological positions in a global context. It stands as a vital, creative component of the annual convention.

* * * * *

Annex A

THE FARIANS INCIDENT

Anne E. Patrick writes: I must set the record straight on one matter about which I was in error in my 1990 Presidential Address. Unfortunately, this error has also appeared in several other publications. These include the 1995 anniversary edition of the *CTSA Proceedings*, and my 1986 essay "Toward Renewing 'The Life and Culture of Fallen Man': *Gaudium et Spes* as Catalyst for Catholic Feminist Theology," which was reprinted in the Paulist Press volume edited by Charles E. Curran, Margaret A. Farley, and Richard A. McCormick, *Feminist Ethics and the Catholic Moral Tradition*, Readings in Moral Theology no. 9 (1996) 491.¹

¹The essay on *Gaudium et spes* was originally published in Judith A. Dwyer, ed., "Questions of Special Urgency": *The Church in the Modern World Two Decades after Vatican II* (Washington DC: Georgetown University Press, 1986) 55-78, with the error occurring on 61. The mistake had first appeared in print a year earlier in my article, "Coming of Age: Women's Contribution to Contemporary Theology," *New Catholic World*

Basically I was mistaken to infer from Mary Daly's words in *The Church and the Second Sex* that she herself was the woman initially denied, and then reluctantly granted, admission to the CTSA reception and banquet in 1966, an event that Daly described in the third person without naming the person. Charles E. Curran was present at the meeting in question, and his clear memory is that the woman involved was Elizabeth Farians. The latter has now written a personal note that verifies this fact.

An attempt was made to rectify my mistaken interpretation of Daly's story before the Paulist volume was published in 1996, but due to the complexities of the editorial process the correction I prepared did not make it into the publication. Here is how the text of "Toward Renewing . . ." (p. 491) should read, with corrections noted in upper case:

In *The Church and the Second Sex* Daly describes the disillusioning experience of ELIZABETH J. FARIANS:

In 1966 an American woman who holds a doctorate in theology traveled to Providence, Rhode Island, to attend the annual meeting of the Catholic Theological Society of America, of which she is a member. . . . When she attempted to enter the ballroom of the hotel in which the meeting was being held in order to attend a buffet for members of the society, she was prevented from doing so by one of the officers, a priest. When she insisted upon her right to enter, the priest threatened to call the police. She replied that in this case it would unfortunately be necessary for her to call the newspapers. After a long and humiliating scene, she was finally permitted to enter. This was the debut of the female sex in the Catholic Theological Society of America.

(Quoted from Mary Daly, *The Church and the Second Sex*, 2nd ed. [1968; New York: Harper & Row, 1975] 141-42.)

I enjoin CTSA members to find their copies and mark the correct facts on these pages: 1990 *Proceedings* (p. 45) and 1995 *Proceedings* (p. 296), thereby reclaiming a few "feathers in the wind" for the sake of historical truth.

* * * * *

Following are some excerpts from the letter written by Elizabeth Farians to CTSA President Mary Catherine Hilkert in September 2005.

Greetings Mary Catherine,

I consider myself a pioneer woman theologian, having graduated from Saint Mary's-Notre Dame in 1958. I was one of the first women to go out and try to get a job teaching theology. (Most of the other graduates were women religious who went back to their own colleges to teach, if the local bishop would let them). My dear friend, Mary Daly, was in Europe. It was very difficult. I was told many times: "We don't let women teach the sacred sciences." I applied several times for

(March-April 1985): 61-69, with the error occurring on 63.

membership to the Catholic Theological Society and finally I was informed that the Society would admit qualified lay people, including women. (Before that they always said the Society was open only to clerics.) So I attended the next meeting in 1966. It proved to be an horrific experience. Charles Curran was my saviour that day. At his request I wrote an account of the event. [See below.]

Having women recognized by the CTSA was a very important moment in the struggle for women's equality. Women touch the sacred in a tangible way. I think the event should be noted. It will be the fortieth anniversary in 2006 and I will be 83. . . .

In 1970 I was fired from my teaching post at Loyola University (Chicago). I was told it was because I was a feminist. The title did fit, although my crusade for women was never brought up in my classes. Things were so different then—I cannot go into it all. The text book was standardized; there was no deviation and no such thing as modern social problems. My crusade for the ordination of women was very active and often in the press. If you are interested, my article, "The Struggle for Women's Rights in the Catholic Church" can be found in *Women's Studies Abstracts*, vol. 2, no. 2 (1973). . . .

Now we have women presidents of CTSA. Congratulations! That is wonderful, but we still have the fear of the feminine in the bishops and the pope and it continues to cause great problems for all of humankind. . . .

Now I am on another crusade. My concern is for the animals. The animal issue is very much related to the woman issue but it is almost totally neglected in theological circles. . . . As usual I am ahead of my time, but to ignore so much of the creation brings on grave consequences for humankind, the animals, and theology itself.

Best wishes,

(Elizabeth)

* * * * *

My Experience Becoming a Member
of the Catholic Theological Society of America
by Elizabeth Farians, Ph.D.

As a theologian I considered the Catholic Theological Society of America (CTSA) to be my proper professional society, the one to which I should belong. After graduating with a PhD from Saint Mary's College Graduate School of Sacred Theology (Notre Dame IN) in 1958, I enquired about membership sometime in the early sixties. I do not remember the exact year, but I do remember being surprised and upset when I was informed that only priests could be members. I became even more upset when, while checking the *Proceedings* of the Society, I found a "brother's" name in a leadership position. It was not that I had anything against the "brothers"; it was just that it became obvious that it was women who were the target of the Society's discriminatory policy. When I questioned this I was told that it was really only "clerics" who could be members but that the Society was working on admitting women. I don't think brothers are considered clerics in canon law.

As it turns out, the constitution was changed in 1964 to admit any qualified person. Sometime during the summer of 1964, I received an application from the Society. I immediately sent it in with the required dues but I was told that the new applications would not be considered until the 1965 convention. This meant the approved applicants would not be permitted to attend the annual convention until 1966. My experience with most organizations is that they would welcome new members as soon as possible; but not the CTSA. This was annoying.

The 1966 convention of the Society was held in Providence RI at the Sheraton-Biltmore Hotel. Although registration started on Monday evening it was still open when I arrived late Tuesday afternoon. I registered and bought a ticket for the buffet supper, which was the upcoming event Tuesday evening. The buffet was being held in the ballroom on the top floor of the hotel. The elevator opened to a small foyer across from the door to the ballroom.

As I arrived, a priest stood at the door as the ticket-taker. I tried to give him my ticket but he said, "You can't come in here," and he began, with a stiff outstretched arm, to back me toward the elevator. When we reached the elevator he pushed the button and said: "If you don't leave I will call security and have you arrested." I was frightened but I became angry by his threat. Somehow I retorted: "If you call the police I will call the press." With that he backed off and went over to his post and closed the door to the ballroom.

I stood by the elevator, wondering what to do. When I had looked into the ballroom and had seen a sea of black clad clerics I thought, what am I doing here. I had not come to make trouble. I was an approved member of the Society. I had never given a thought to the fact that I might be the only woman in attendance and how uncomfortable that would be. How naive and really stupid I was to have gone to the meeting by myself. To make matters worse I wore a white dress.

The elevator brought more clerics to the ballroom and again the door was closed. As I stood there alone pondering the idea of calling the press, a priest came along and asked, "What's the problem, Elizabeth, why are you standing here?" I told him what had happened. And he said, "That's not the way it's supposed to be, we voted to admit qualified persons. We don't want the press. Wait here." He went into the ballroom and brought out several of his friends and they escorted me into the ballroom to the buffet. The priest was the Rev. Charles Curran from Catholic University. No doubt we wore registration badges because he had addressed me by name. What I did not know at the time was that Father Curran had called the president of the Society, the Rev. Eamon R. Carroll, O.Carm, advising him to "Get down here because there may be a fight." A fight, can you imagine? Apparently Father Carroll told the self-appointed door screener that I should be admitted.

I remember all this very vividly because it was such an unpleasant, frightening experience. Later I found out that the priest at the door was Rev. Vincent J. Nugent, a member of the Vincentian congregation, secretary of the Society and connected to the Society for the Propagation of the Faith. He has never apologized to me. The next day during one of the seminars several of the priests privately thanked me for coming.

* * * * *

In a later e-mail, Elizabeth Farians wrote to CTSA President Mary Catherine Hilbert in September 2005:

I would love to attend the next CTSA conference. I am in Cincinnati, a long way away, but for me the time is urgent. . . . I would really love to meet with the women's caucus and hug each one of its members. They have accomplished so much. . . . I would also want publicly to thank Fr. Curran for his part in getting women admitted to the Society and for saving me that day when I was so all alone.

* * * * *

Annex B

BRIEF RECORDS FROM *PROCEEDINGS* (AND CONVENTION PROGRAMS)

- 1990 Saturday, June 9 (San Francisco)
12:15-1:45 Informal Women's Lunch
2:00-5:00 Seminar: discussion of papers by Elizabeth A. Johnson (Chapter 8: "God as Triune: Mystery of Relation" and Susan A. Ross "Notes Toward a Feminist Sacramental Theology.") The program also included a discussion of "Sharing Strategies for Survival and Growth in Various Settings" led by Joan Wolski Conn. At the business meeting we decided to seek a dialogue with black women theologians in Atlanta in 1991.
(*Proceedings* report by Ann O'Hara Graff, pp. 136-37.)
- 1991 Saturday, June 15 (Atlanta)
12:30-1:30 Informal Women's Lunch
2:00-5:00 Seminar: Presentation by Jacquelyn Grant, "Black Womanist Christology"
(*Proceedings* report by Ann O'Hara Graff, p. 199.)
- 1992 Sunday, June 14 (Pittsburgh)
12:30-1:30 Informal Women's Lunch
2:00-5:00 Seminar: Pamela Kirk moderated a discussion of Catherine Mowry LaCugna's *God for Us: The Trinity and Christian Life*. Presentations were given by Jamie T. Phelps, Sally McReynolds, and Ann O'Hara Graff, with a response by LaCugna.
(*Proceedings* report by Pamela Kirk, pp. 175-76.)
- 1993 Sunday, June 13 (San Antonio)
12:30-1:30 Informal Women's Lunch
2:00-5:00 Seminar, convened by: Pamela Kirk, with Ann O'Hara Graff moderating. Presentation by Ada María Isasi-Díaz. Graff then led a

discussion on popular religious practices within other groups represented among the 53 participants, and compared these with Isasi-Díaz's data on Hispanic popular religious customs. Patricia O'Connell Killen then synthesized "elements of the preceding discussion into principles which could serve as guides" in the process of assessing popular religious expressions. A business meeting followed, with election of the chair.

(*Proceedings* report by Pamela Kirk, pp. 172-73.)

- 1994 Thursday afternoon, 2-5 p.m. June 9 (Baltimore)
Seminar focused on *She Who Is* by Elizabeth A. Johnson. Pamela Kirk convened the session, and three panelists spoke: Christine E. Gudorf, Diana L. Hayes, and Julia A. Upton. Johnson responded, and discussion followed.

(*Proceedings* report by Pamela J. Kirk, pp. 219-220).

Friday afternoon, 12:30-1:30 June 10

Women's Seminar Luncheon

- 1995 Thursday afternoon, 2-5 p.m. June 8 (New York)
Seminar focused on convention theme, "Evil and Hope: Womanist/Feminist Contributions." Ann O'Hara Graff convened a panel that included: Morny Joy, Susan St. Ville, Cynthia Crysdale, and Jeannette Rodriguez. Discussion centered around two texts: Emily M. Townes, ed., *A Troubling in My Soul: Womanist Perspectives on Evil and Suffering*, and Wendy Farley, *Tragic Vision and Divine Compassion*.

(*Proceedings* report by Ann O'Hara Graff, pp. 267-68).

Friday afternoon, 12:30-1:30 June 9

Women's Seminar Luncheon

- 1996 Thursday afternoon, 2-5 p.m. June 6 (San Diego)
Susan M. Simonaitis and Susan M. St. Ville convened the 2-3 p.m. panel on "Practical Action: Report on Women's International Connections," with presenters Ada María Isasi-Díaz (Beijing Conference), Jeanette Rodriguez (meeting of Latin American and Hispanic North American Theologians), and Mary E. Hines (Women's Ordination Conference and the Network of Women Theologians). Susan St. Ville moderated the 3-4 p.m. session on "Postmodern Theories: Moving from Experience to Theory," which involved presentations by Susan Simonaitis and Mary Gerhart. A business meeting followed during 4-5 p.m.

(*Proceedings* report by Susan M. Simonaitis, pp. 290-291).

Friday afternoon, 12:30-1:30 June 7

Women's Seminar Luncheon

Appendix 2. CTSA Women's Seminar in Constructive Theology 229

- 1997 Thursday afternoon, 1-4 p.m. June 5 (Minneapolis)
The focus was "Conscience and Authority: A Conversation with Anne Patrick's *Liberating Conscience*." Susan M. St. Ville and Susan M. Simonaitis convened the session, which involved presentations by Lisa Sowle Cahill, Patricia Beattie Jung, and Jamie Phelps, with a response by Patrick.
(*Proceedings* report by Susan M. St. Ville, pp. 161-62).
[Note: An information session from 4:00 to 5:30 on "Tradition and Women's Ordination" was of particular interest to the women's seminar participants]
- Friday afternoon, 12:30-1:30 June 5
Women's Seminar Luncheon, with presentation of the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award to Joan Timmerman.
- 1998 Thursday afternoon, 1-4 p.m. June 11 (Ottawa)
Susan M. St. Ville and Susan M. Simonaitis convened a session on "Feminism and Theological Education: Multiple Commitments, Moments of Grace," with Mary C. Boys as presenter. Following a dialogue between Boys and Simonaitis, there were small group and plenary discussions. A business meeting followed.
(*Proceedings* report by Susan M. Simonaitis, pp. 166-67).
[The conveners' spring letter to seminar members indicated the luncheon would take place as usual Friday from 12:30 to 1:30, but there had been no reminder about nominations for the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award and none had been received, and so there was no presentation this year.]
- 1999 Thursday afternoon, 3:15-6:15 p.m. June 10 (Miami)
Susan M. St. Ville and Susan M. Simonaitis were conveners, with Mary T. Stimming moderating the discussion entitled, "Reconsidering Sacramentality: A Conversation with M. Catherine Hilbert and Susan A. Ross." Hilbert and Ross opened the seminar by reflecting on their recent books, *Naming Grace: Preaching and the Sacramental Imagination* and *Extravagant Affections: A Feminist Sacramental Theology*, respectively. Discussion followed.
During a reception after the seminar (6:15-7:15 p.m.) the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award was presented to Regina A. Coll.
(*Proceedings* report by Elena G. Procario-Foley, pp. 129-30.)
- 2000 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-6:30 p.m. June 8 (San Jose)
Elena G. Procario-Foley and Jane Carol Redmont convened a session on "*Ex Corde Mulieris*: Insights into Catholicism and Public Life," moderated by Redmont, who opened the session with a presentation on "Catholic

Women in Global Context: Who is the 'Public' in 'Public Life'?" Frances Forde Plude then spoke on "Feminism and the Cultural Change Process: A Communication Theology Perspective," and Barbara Andolsen gave a working paper on "Feminine Names for God and Public Theology." The Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award was presented to Diana L. Hayes.

(*Proceedings* report by Elena G. Procaro- Foley, pp. 132-34.)

- 2001 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-6:30 p.m. June 7 (Milwaukee)
Elena G. Procaro-Foley and Jane Carol Redmont convened the seminar, with Maura Ryan as moderator. Cynthia Crysdale spoke on the issues in her book *Embracing Travail: Retrieving the Cross Today* (Continuum, 1999). Respondent M. Shawn Copeland pointed out the need for awareness of the social dimension of suffering, while Donna Teevan discussed the workings of grace in feminist theological method. Discussion followed.
The session ended with the presentation of the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award to Susan A. Ross.

(*Proceedings* report by Jane Carol Redmont, pp. 152-54.)

- 2002 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-6:00 p.m. June 6 (New Orleans)
The seminar, focused on "Feminism and Catholicism: Reading the Signs of the Times," was convened by Elena G. Procaro-Foley and Jane Carol Redmont, with Michelle Gonzalez as moderator. Nancy A. Dallavalle gave a presentation on her work in progress, "Gospel Feminism, Papal Feminism, Catholic Feminism." Anne M. Clifford's response raised questions concerning all three points. Respondent Phyllis Zagano noted a distinction between ecclesial and ecclesiastical location. A lively discussion ensued.
Mary Ann Hinsdale received the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award.

(*Proceedings* report by Elena G. Procaro-Foley, pp. 155-57.)

- 2003 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-6:00 p.m. June 5 (Cincinnati)
The seminar on the theme "Sexual Ethics: Here and Now" was convened by Gaile Pohlhaus and Jane Carol Redmont, with Jane Russell as moderator. Christine Gudorf presented her work on the collapse of sexual dimorphism. Questions followed concerning how a new paradigm to replace sexual dimorphism would change the existing teaching of sexual ethics in the Catholic Church.
Monika Hellwig received the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award for her work as model and mentor to women in theology.

(*Proceedings* report by Gail Pohlhaus, pp. 107-08.)

- 2004 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-6:00 p.m. June (Reston VA)

Gaile Pohlhaus and Elaine Catherine MacMillan convened the seminar, with Dawn Nothwehr serving as moderator. The topic, "Are the CTSA and Feminist Theologies Reconciled? Is there a Continuing Role for the Women's Seminar in Constructive Theology in the CTSA?" grew out of a question raised by the prior year's session. Susan Ross, Cynthia Crysdale, Mary Doak, Meghan Sweeney, and Rosemary Radford Ruether presented the history of this seminar, pointing out the need for this "sacred time" for women, the challenges women face in theology, the importance of a forum for feminist scholarship, and the reality that 'mainstream' theology is still 'male stream' theology. The discussion raised further questions.

Ellen Leonard received the Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award.

(Proceedings report by Elaine MacMillan, pp. 103-104.)

- 2005 Thursday afternoon, 3:00-5:30 p.m. June 9 (St. Louis)
Dawn Nothwehr and Elaine MacMillan convened the seminar with the theme "Theologies of the Body." Margaret Farley gave the main presentation, delineating elements that comprise personal identity in feminist theological anthropology. Respondents were Maria Cimperman, Gemma Tulud Cruz, and Stephanie Mitchem. Discussion followed.
Gaile Pohlhaus received Ann O'Hara Graff Memorial Award.
(Proceedings report by Elaine MacMillan, pp. 101-102.)

- 2006 Thursday afternoon, 3:30-5:30 p.m., June 8 (San Antonio)
Elaine MacMillan and Dawn Nothwehr convened the seminar with the theme "Undomestic Conversations: Women Talking Across Borders." Led by moderator Phyllis Kaminski, the session heard presentations by Milagros Peña (the Hispanic context) and Carolyn Sharp (the French Canadian context). Discussion followed, and included problems attending the borders between academic and pastoral work.
María Pilar Aquino received the Ann O'Hara Graff Award.
(Proceedings report by Dawn M. Nothwehr)

ANNE E. PATRICK

Carleton College

Northfield, Massachusetts

ELIZABETH A. JOHNSON

Fordham University

Bronx, New York