The photo on the cover of this issue shows one of the clearest physiological effects detectable in frontal lobe dementia: a whole area of the diseased brain displays decreased activity, indicated in this picture by a lack of color in the part of the brain directly behind the forehead. Though frontal lobe dementia is relatively rare, other dementing disorders such as Alzheimer’s disease are extremely prevalent, levying a burden of $70 billion in U.S. health costs annually. Despite the clear physiological symptoms and the obvious economic burdens associated with dementia, the ethical picture of this type of disorder is far from clear. As Andrew Orr argues in “The ‘Now Patient’ and the ‘Then Self,’” the conflict between the present and past wishes of a patient, taken in combination with the professional advice of a doctor and the personal wishes of family members, requires a carefully thought-out ethical framework.

As with Orr’s article, the other articles in this issue share this spirit of broadening the scope of whatever they investigate. Whether by situating a single piece of art in a larger historical context or by sketching a philosophical way of understanding nature, the authors in this issue contribute work that broadens the horizon of work in their field. Indeed, I take this keen awareness of perspective—this knowledge of one’s place in a more general conversation—to be one of the hallmarks of scholarship at Boston College.

Undergraduate scholarship at Boston College is expanding, and so is Elements. As Elements expands, I hope that it mirrors Boston College’s ethos in research, public service, and personal development. To that end, this latest issue of Elements introduces a new segment labeled “Perspectives.” After years of only soliciting submissions for peer review and selection for publication, we have decided to add this mini-review section to complement the research presented in Elements. These reviews will hopefully allow our readers to get the most out of every article we publish. As an added benefit, seventeen authors are featured in this issue, twice as many as Elements usually publishes.

Ultimately, the “Perspectives” section provides an outlet for authors to mend cracks in the continuity of scholarship. To borrow from Karen Kena- ket’s “Transcendental Geology,” it will help Elements to reflect students making the jump from the visible to the invisible—the transition from a single discipline to the awareness of both the worldly situation of their endeavors and the Western cultural tradition that we all share. I am confident that the interdisciplinary research explored in this issue is not embodied by perpetually opposed concepts but by a certain “chiasm”—a blending that builds bridges both within the academy and beyond the academy. Thank you for taking part in our project.

Sincerely,

B. Brian Tracz
Editor-in-chief
The "Now Patient" and the "Then Self": Conflicting Views in the Ethics of Dementia Care
Andrew Orr

Investigating the ethical dilemmas surrounding the consideration of dementia patients' wishes, including weighing the desires of the "then" patient against the current happiness of the "now" self.

Coping in Jordan: The Plight of Iraqi-Female-Headed Households
Sophia Moradian

Interviewing displaced Iraqi women to understand the economic coping mechanisms of female-headed-households in Jordan.

The Mystery of Mithras: Analyzing Religious Practices in Dura-Europos
Jenna Howarth

Unearthing the unique cult of Mithras to understand the relationships between religions in the ancient city of Dura-Europos.

Culture in Conflict: Remembering the Vietnam War Through Cinema
Rosa Mariel Colorado

Reflecting upon the connection between historical film and collective memory to explore the evolution of post-war culture and "The American Hero."

The Virgin of Jeanne d'Evreux: An Affectionate Mother in an Unaffectionate Era
Brian D. Varian

Gilding the virgin of Jeanne d'Evreux, revealing its origins while uncovering its position as a reflection of transformative style and enduring iconography.

A Viable Option: Organ Procurement in the Face of a National Shortage
Zachary T. Martin

Examining the significance of altering policy to allow for the procurement of organs from non-heart-beating cadavers.

Frank Lloyd Wright: The Power of Illumination in Architecture
Tiphaine Leverrier

Illuminating the interplay of shadows and light in Frank Lloyd Wright’s architectural designs.

Transcendental Geology: Towards a Phenomenology of Nature and History
Karen Kovaka

Reframing the philosophy of nature by providing a phenomenologically nuanced account of work by Merleau-Ponty, Dilthey, and Husserl.

Author Biographies

List of Artwork
the environment by regulating temperature, reducing storm water runoff, and providing a human habitat. Living Roof structures, such as Frank Lloyd Wright’s Fallingwater, have been called "the greenest building ever," as they not only contribute to the environment but also provide a sense of unity with nature.

Living and working throughout the first half of the 20th century, Wright asserted that our work, dwelling, and leisure spaces should mirror our values as a society. He was heavily influenced by the writings of Henry David Thoreau and Ralph Waldo Emerson, and believed that the best society is one that respects its roots in nature and works with its forces in a symbiotic relationship; thus, his architecture was termed "organic." His design for Fallingwater, a home for the Kaufmann family in Mill Run Pennsylvania, presents a marriage of nature’s elements to architectural forms as he incorporates the rocks of the hill into the hearth of the home. The hearth is commonly symbolic as the heart of the home therefore, it may be that Wright’s emphasis on nature in this particular space is a reflection of the family and its natural nucleus of society. Wright’s architectural school of thought became known as the Prairie School Movement in which architects strove to incorporate the most basic elements of nature including water, light, and heat as sources for a "new indigenous American architecture." He believed that the structure of a home should reflect the climate and culture of the region it was built in, and that the relationship between the building and its environment was crucial.

The endless battles of the Hundred Years War plagued fourteenth century France, bringing with it intermittent violence which punctuated daily life for over two centuries. A series of several wars, the conflict known as the Hundred Years War was not the first dispute between France and England. The two nations had engaged in sporadic power struggles since the 13th century with the English occupying parts of northern France for over two centuries. The rivalries of the 14th century solidified into a full-scale war with France and England fighting for control of the Low Countries.

In the 1920’s, the excavation of a Roman Mithraeum in Dura Europos, a port city on the Euphrates River in what is now Syria, sparked a scholarly discussion on Mithraism; its record entertains questions about the extent of its popularity with the Roman military, the cult’s use of eastern motifs, and the general popularity of the cult in the empire. The Cult of Mithras is particularly intriguing for scholars. Though no literary sources from the cult survive save for a few wall graffiti, the cult was a forerunner in Rome’s increasingly popular religious cults, with practitioners worshipping alongside more long-lived religious traditions of Christianity and Judaism. In spite of the lack of Mithraic literature, a number of Mithraeums—houses of worship for the adherents of Mithraism, the Mithraic equivalent of shrines—survive. Excavations in Dura Europos and Merv (now in Turkmenistan) suggest that the cult worshipped a central deity, Mithras, his relations with the sun, and his ceremonial actresses to a "tauroctony"). Reliefs of Mithras near sprouting plants suggest the adherents connected him with harvest and life. Through the ceremonial narrative that encircles him, the worshipper would identify with the deity’s suffering and thus gain immortality. The magical record has provided important information about the cult, including the initiates’ initiation ceremony, the Mithraic calendar, and the cult’s prominent role in the worship of eastern motifs, and the general popularity of the cult in the empire.

The Virgin of Jean d’Evreux is a good example of one of the most widespread. The Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread religious imagery dominated the subject matter of Gothic art; in lofty cathedrals housing pious individuals at prayer, illuminated manuscripts relaying religious messages, devotional objects aiding in prayerful contemplation and relics containing the venerable remains of saints. Of religious images, the Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread.

The social changes of this transitional era, including the rising prominence of artistic guilds, provided wealthy Parisians with the opportunity to commission luxurious art for religious worship. In 1393, at the onset of the Hundred Years War, a silver-gilt sculpture was completed for Jeanne de France, known as the Virgin of Jean d’Evreux. Although commissioned by a noble patron, the statue was donated to the Church of St. Denis, to be viewed by the public as a devotional aid. The chaos of the Hundred Years War did not go unnoticed by any member of French society, yet the statue continues to stand as the Virgin of Jean d’Evreux; its calm and tenderm绩 to the instability of the political landscape.

The Deer Hunter is a good example of one of the most widespread. The Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread religious imagery dominated the subject matter of Gothic art; in lofty cathedrals housing pious individuals at prayer, illuminated manuscripts relaying religious messages, devotional objects aiding in prayerful contemplation and relics containing the venerable remains of saints. Of religious images, the Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread.

The social changes of this transitional era, including the rising prominence of artistic guilds, provided wealthy Parisians with the opportunity to commission luxurious art for religious worship. In 1393, at the onset of the Hundred Years War, a silver-gilt sculpture was completed for Jeanne de France, known as the Virgin of Jean d’Evreux. Although commissioned by a noble patron, the statue was donated to the Church of St. Denis, to be viewed by the public as a devotional aid. The chaos of the Hundred Years War did not go unnoticed by any member of French society, yet the statue continues to stand as the Virgin of Jean d’Evreux; its calm and tenderm绩 to the instability of the political landscape.

The Virgin of Jean d’Evreux is a good example of one of the most widespread. The Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread religious imagery dominated the subject matter of Gothic art; in lofty cathedrals housing pious individuals at prayer, illuminated manuscripts relaying religious messages, devotional objects aiding in prayerful contemplation and relics containing the venerable remains of saints. Of religious images, the Virgin and Child was one of the most widespread.
Although Cimino has been widely criticized for historical errors in the film, such as the Russian roulette scenes and in his caricature of the German soldier, he forced Americans to question their self-perceived moral and ethical standards. Socially it generated a generation of Americans who had seen the effects of war firsthand. A study of the war and its legacies in Hollywood films about the Vietnam War, one can begin to understand how these films impact the American mind.

The principle of justice extends beyond the application of the previous three principles, but they tend to be applied on a consistent basis in cases of dementia ethics. The principle of autonomy calls for the respect of an individual’s right to self-determination. The principle of beneficence, acting to promote the wellbeing of the other, often determine which principle should prevail in determining the course of care. In the issue of dementia ethics, the conflict between respecting the patient’s autonomy and exercising paternalism for the best interest of the patient is constant. According to the bioethicist, Richard McCormick, S.J., the principle of justice is in a state of an “absolutization of autonomy,” where the rightness or wrongness of a choice is left only in the individual’s hands and which results in a sense of isolation and disenfranchisement.

A very useful moral resource that arose in the late 1970’s is the Georgetown Manus of Baethink. Applied within many political and legal domains, the principles of this “manus” include autonomy, beneficence, nonmaleficence, and justice. The practice of bioethics is by no means reduced to these four principles, but they can be applied on a consistent basis in cases of dementia ethics. The principle of autonomy calls for the respect of an individual’s right to self-determination. The principle of beneficence, acting to promote the wellbeing of the other, often determine which principle should prevail in determining the course of care. In the issue of dementia ethics, the conflict between respecting the patient’s autonomy and exercising paternalism for the best interest of the patient is constant.

The principle of justice extends beyond the application of the previous three principles because justice concerns itself with the fair distribution of health care to all people. The structure of medicine has progressively evolved into a business model, and bioethics has found itself responding to the call for a return to the care, compassion, and personalization of the patients who enter the hospital seeking the best medical treatment possible. I say “possible” not in the sense of what medical technology is capable of, but in the sense of what our society and its individuals can afford in medical expenses. The exponential growth of our health care costs is certainly important to consider given the problem of organ donation today. The shortage of available organs for transplantation brings on the search to find new ways of harvesting organs, and careful ethical reflection needs to be taken to ensure that organ procurement is performed in a just way without violating the rights or the dignity of human beings.

The two issues of dementia ethics and organ donation continue to incite a vast ethical debate in the bioethics community. The multitude of case studies illuminate the extremely challenging ethical decisions being made every day, for example, to a patient with increasing stages of Alzheimer’s and who is in a state of an “absolutization of autonomy,” where the rightness or wrongness of a choice is left only in the individual’s hands and which results in a sense of isolation and disenfranchisement. However, as he notes, “the shortage of available organs for transplantation brings on the search to find new ways of harvesting organs, and careful ethical reflection needs to be taken to ensure that organ procurement is performed in a just way without violating the rights or the dignity of human beings.”

The principle of autonomy calls for the respect of an individual’s right to self-determination. The principle of beneficence, acting to promote the wellbeing of the other, often determine which principle should prevail in determining the course of care. In the issue of dementia ethics, the conflict between respecting the patient’s autonomy and exercising paternalism for the best interest of the patient is constant. The principle of justice extends beyond the application of the previous three principles because justice concerns itself with the fair distribution of health care to all people. The structure of medicine has progressively evolved into a business model, and bioethics has found itself responding to the call for a return to the care, compassion, and personalization of the patients who enter the hospital seeking the best medical treatment possible.
A phenomenologist passes from static to genetic phenomenology when he begins asking questions like: What conditions must an object meet in order to be perceived as a glass by a subject? Or what must a subject have experienced in order to perceive an object as a glass? Husserl and his most notable student, Martin Heidegger (1889-1976), disagreed vehemently over how to make progress on these genetic questions.

The two diverged over the question of being. Husserl insisted that—the natural sciences take for granted the material reality of their subject matters—so too must the phenomenology take for granted the reality of conscious phenomena, generally excluding their ontological status from consideration just as the natural sciences do. Heidegger, on the other hand, defended the question of being as the central question of phenomenology, asserting that the conditions under which the regularities of a subject are apparent, the effects of the world on subject and meanings that we are free to indulge or deny. We simply take a sip of water, reflecting only on its taste. This natural attitude— that is, attention to the natural motivations and assumptions driving our experiential economy—must be suspended so that the activities which set the glass before us might come to light. The phenomenological reduction “clacks the intentional threads which attach us to the world and brings them to our notice.”

Once we have adopted an attitude that exposes conscious activity, then the work of identifying the irreducible elements of a conscious phenomenon can begin. This eidetic reduction of a phenomenon proceeds into high relief. In our normal commerce with the world, we pay no attention to the fact that consciousness is a water-filled object on a table as a glass. We see instead a world of structural and conditional meanings that are free to indulge or deny. We simply take a sip of water, reflecting only on its taste. This natural attitude—that is, attention to the natural motivations and assumptions driving our experiential economy—must be suspended so that the activities which set the glass before us might come to light. The phenomenological reduction “clacks the intentional threads which attach us to the world and brings them to our notice.”

From a critical mass of these descriptions, the phenomenologist abstracts a glass on the table, my visual and tactile experiences apprehend a different perception. That glass on the table, for example, affords a visual experience and checking the accuracy of result against the original descriptions. From a critical mass of these descriptions, the phenomenologist abstracts a glass on the table, my visual and tactile experiences apprehend a different perception. That glass on the table, for example, affords a visual experience and checking the accuracy of result against the original descriptions. From a critical mass of these descriptions, the phenomenologist abstracts a glass on the table, my visual and tactile experiences apprehend a different perception. That glass on the table, for example, affords a visual experience and checking the accuracy of result against the original descriptions.
Alzheimer’s disease is a neurodegenerative condition that typically affects the elderly and gradually consumes a patient, destroying the connection between body and mind in the process. Due to the aging of the baby-boom generation, Alzheimer’s disease is expected to substantially increase in prevalence in the coming years. Despite this epidemiological probability, public policy regarding treatment of patients with the illness remains piecemeal. Controversy stems from the fact that, in many cases, a severely demented patient’s wishes for treatment differ from the wishes he or she expressed in the earlier stages of disease. When considering whose perspective—that of the competent, “then” version of the patient or that of the demented “now” version of the patient—should take precedence, the guiding principle should be respect for overall dignity. From this perspective, honoring the autonomy of the “then” self is the most viable option and should serve as the basis for future policy decisions regarding the treatment of Alzheimer’s disease.

“Until the advent of drugs that slow, stop, or reverse the syndrome that gradually steals its victims’ most intimate thoughts and threatens the cores of their identities, society’s interests are best served by a policy that protects these vulnerable individuals.”
“With the rapidly increasing elderly population in the United States, the number of persons affected by Alzheimer’s disease is projected to reach 13.2 million by mid-century.”

Discovered in the early twentieth century, Alzheimer’s disease accounts for 60-80% of dementia in the elderly. According to various studies, it affects 20-40% of people over the age of eighty-five. Although this condition contains a signature pathology of neuritic plaques in combination with neurofibrillary tangles, the underlying cause of these abnormalities remains unknown. The development of such trademark brain lesions makes diagnosis seem straightforward, yet the lack of sufficient brain scanning technology makes diagnosis rather difficult in the early stages of the disease. On average, Alzheimer’s disease patients live eight to ten years after being diagnosed, which places a significant strain on caregivers and acute pressure on the country’s long-term care system.”

Mark Rothstein estimates the annual cost of caring for a “patient with moderate Alzheimer’s disease” to be $50,000 while the annual national cost of the disease amounts to roughly $150 billion. Data from 2008 shows that at that time, Alzheimer’s disease affected approximately 1.7 million people. With the rapidly increasing elderly population in the United States, the number of persons affected by Alzheimer’s disease is projected to reach 15.2 million by mid-century. This article will address the myriad issues surrounding dementia, particularly the distinct notions of personhood raised by the syndrome as well as the resulting perspective on the viability of advance directives for making treatment decisions. It will contest aspects of certain arguments that favor the privileging of the patient in late stage dementia over the same patient in an earlier stage and will offer policy suggestions for the future designed to create a more effective treatment plan for patients with dementia.

THEORIES OF PERSONHOOD IN DEMENTIA

Significance and Implications

The reasoning behind many decisions regarding demented individuals often has as its foundation one of two theories of personhood presented by the progression of dementia: the theory of the “now” self or the theory of the “then” self. Stephen Post articulates the difference in his article “Alzheimer Disease and the ‘Then’ Self,” writing, “In doing so, however, she disregards the earlier wishes of the patient on the basis of her presumed knowledge of the patient’s opinion of advance directives because they have not yet experienced the unique situation for which they are providing instructions. Conversely, by the time the patients acquire the necessary experience to execute an informed treatment decision, they are no longer competent to give consent. Dresner approaches this catch-22 by fully endorsing the ‘now’ self and proposing a policy of ignoring advance directives that refute treatment in order to continue the life of the severely demented patient. She states: “Many mildly or moderately demented patients do appear to obtain significant benefits from continued life. Although these benefits may seem small to us, we must evaluate them from the patient’s perspective. Given their limits, then, patients who can relate to the people and objects surrounding them typically have lives that for them are significantly better than no life at all.”

Dresner rejects the notion that demented patients are merely fossilized versions of their former selves and counsels that an external, compared to an introspective, view of personhood is more suitable under these circumstances. In doing so, however, she disregards the earlier wishes of the patient on the basis of her presumed knowledge of the value of life for someone with dementia. Her relational perspective on the significance of life for a dementia patient also leads to an acceptance of extramarital intimate relationships and extramarital patients in nursing homes. This controversial situation frequently arises when one nursing home resident with dementia, due to a distorted reality, mistakes another resident for a spouse or, due to Alzheimer’s disease, experiences loss inhibition and expresses aggressive sexual desire. Perhaps the most well-known incidence of cohabitation between dementia patients occurred when former Justice Sandra Day O’Connor permitted her husband, who was in the late stages of Alzheimer’s disease, to have a romance with another woman in the nursing home. O’Connor, in accord with Dresner’s argument, privileged current happiness through a relationship over the objections that her husband would likely have had were he competent.

Another implication of this view of personhood can be seen in the employment of a best interest methodology instead of substituted judgment in court-ordered treatment decisions.”

Indeed, this objective approach was utilized in the cases of Barber v. Superior Court and In re Conroy. In Barber, Clarence Herbert enters a vegetative state follow- ing cardio-respiratory arrest after a successful surgery, and his family successfully petitions the physicians to remove the feeding tube. “The court in Barber did not find the physician guilty of murder, and, of the current approach to life-sustaining treatment, argued, “A more rational approach
Seemingly, being human involves on its deepest level some element, free from the constraints of time, akin to a soul that prevents infants and dementia patients from being empty shells even in the absence of cognition.

This argument implies that severely demented patients lacking relational abilities need not be kept alive “for their own good” if it is against the wishes of their former, competent selves.

One potential danger of such an argument lies in applying the “empty shell” principle to seemingly contradictory conclusions about the value that the patient derives from life. Surely no person can be so qualified to deliver that judgment as the patient herself, whose opinion would be considered more legitimate than that of the medical professionals. One can find support for this argument in the writings of Dr. Cindyff and Dr. Deoncker, who argue that “the intact self with a diagnosis of Alzheimer’s disease should be permitted to exert control over the future through the implementation of precedent autonomy.”

The argument for MHADs generally consists of an appreciation of the medical benefits that the directives offer as well as a positive evaluation of their utility as a planning instrument. Concerning the medical benefits, MHADs provide the opportunity for patients to avoid patient-relevant drugs, which have been known to cause dyskinesia, dry mouth, dizziness, and depression, among other symptoms. In addition to these physical benefits, the option to consent to placement in a mental health facility often spares a patient’s family or caregivers significant guilt in the event that the patient becomes violent and must be temporarily placed in such a facility regardless of opinions stated earlier. Admittedly, though, this benefit of Mental Health Advance Directives more frequently applies to hospital and psychiatric hospitals where patients undergo cycles of competency and incompetency and for whom the directives were originally designed. Nevertheless, mental health conditions such as delusion, depression, and hallucinations often accompany Alzheimer’s disease and justify the use of MHADs in these instances. Furthermore, the highly predictable nature of the progression of Alzheimer’s disease provides a real opportunity to anticipate and plan. Indeed, additional benefits of MHADs arise mainly from the process of future planning initiated by the directives. The resulting discussion often explicitly informs family members and caretakers of the patient’s core values, cultural care preferences, and financial plans, as well as illuminates the patient’s opinions on life-sustaining treatment.

Whether one privileges the “then” self or the “now” self will typically have bearing on one’s interpretation of the validity of advance directives for dementia patients. One specific example is when an advance directive for those with mental illness is considered to be the “then” self’s wish. Several cases have demonstrated the effect this can have when the “now” self is preserved in the theory of the “then” self, as Post demonstrates with the case of Mrs. A, an incompetent dementia patient who, as a competent person, expressed a wish not to have any surgical intervention in the later stages of her disease. Unfortunately, she developed a painful tumor, and, despite her previous wish, Post recommends surgery to reduce the size of the tumor. With his consent, Post is respecting the need for comforting the “now” self and suggesting a policy in which pain treatment is primary and life prolongation is merely a secondary consideration. This way, demented persons and their caretakers are not viewed as empty shells, memory is not overvalued, and the feelings and needs of dementia patients are noted and responded to using compassionate standards of care.

With respect to former Justice O’Connor’s ethical dilemma, Post presents the opposite side of the argument through the case of Mrs. S, a dementia patient who brings daily gifts to another resident, Mr. R, whom she mistakenly believes is her deceased spouse. One day, Mr. R objects to the nursing staff’s idea of cohabitation with Mrs. S for a night. However, Mrs. S’s daughter objects to what she deems a violation of the integrity of her mother’s “then” self. Post, quoting Erik Erikson, argues, “Eldersly people desire above all to integrate the fi nal phase of their life, their deepest values and meaning- ings.” Although refusing to enter Mrs. S’s reality completely and thus denying her a certain degree of happiness is objectively from Dresden’s standpoint, another example can provide further insight into the situation. Considering the case of a Jehovah’s Witness in the late stages of Alzheimer’s disease, this patient’s consistently expressed religious values while competent will assure that he or she is not subjected to blood transfusions even when in a state of advanced dementia. Similarly, the values of Mrs. S should not be violated simply because she is incompetent. Discovering and integrating the “then” self into the “now” self appears to be the ideal treatment goal whenever possible.

MHADs provide the opportunity for patients to avoid patient-relevant drugs, which have been known to cause dyskinesia, dry mouth, dizziness, and depression, among other symptoms. In addition to these physical benefits, the option to consent to placement in a mental health facility often spares a patient’s family or caregivers significant guilt in the event that the patient becomes violent and must be temporarily placed in such a facility regardless of opinions stated earlier. Admittedly, though, this benefit of Mental Health Advance Directives more frequently applies to hospital and psychiatric hospitals where patients undergo cycles of competency and incompetency and for whom the directives were originally designed. Nevertheless, mental health conditions such as delusion, depression, and hallucinations often accompany Alzheimer’s disease and justify the use of MHADs in these instances. Furthermore, the highly predictable nature of the progression of Alzheimer’s disease provides a real opportunity to anticipate and plan. Indeed, additional benefits of MHADs arise mainly from the process of future planning initiated by the directives. The resulting discussion often explicitly informs family members and caretakers of the patient’s core values, cultural care preferences, and financial plans, as well as illuminates the patient’s opinions on life-sustaining treatment. Whether one privileges the “then” self or the “now” self will typically have bearing on one’s interpretation of the validity of advance directives for dementia patients. One specific example is when an advance directive for those with mental illness is considered to be the “then” self’s wish. Several cases have demonstrated the effect this can have when the “now” self is preserved in the theory of the “then” self, as Post demonstrates with the case of Mrs. A, an incompetent dementia patient who, as a competent person, expressed a wish not to have any surgical intervention in the later stages of her disease. Unfortunately, she developed a painful tumor, and, despite her previous wish, Post recommends surgery to reduce the size of the tumor. With his consent, Post is respecting the need for comforting the “now” self and suggesting a policy in which pain treatment is primary and life prolongation is merely a secondary consideration. This way, demented persons and their caretakers are not viewed as empty shells, memory is not overvalued, and the feelings and needs of dementia patients are noted and responded to using compassionate standards of care. With respect to former Justice O’Connor’s ethical dilemma, Post presents the opposite side of the argument through the case of Mrs. S, a dementia patient who brings daily gifts to another resident, Mr. R, whom she mistakenly believes is her deceased spouse. One day, Mr. R objects to the nursing staff’s idea of cohabitation with Mrs. S for a night. However, Mrs. S’s daughter objects to what she deems a violation of the integrity of her mother’s “then” self. Post, quoting Erik Erikson, argues, “Eldersly people desire above all to integrate the fi nal phase of their life, their deepest values and meaning-ings.” Although refusing to enter Mrs. S’s reality completely and thus denying her a certain degree of happiness is objectively from Dresden’s standpoint, another example can provide further insight into the situation. Considering the case of a Jehovah’s Witness in the late stages of Alzheimer’s disease, this patient’s consistently expressed religious values while competent will assure that he or she is not subjected to blood transfusions even when in a state of advanced dementia. Similarly, the values of Mrs. S should not be violated simply because she is incompetent. Discovering and integrating the “then” self into the “now” self appears to be the ideal treatment goal whenever possible.

MHADs provide the opportunity for patients to avoid patient-relevant drugs, which have been known to cause dyskinesia, dry mouth, dizziness, and depression, among other symptoms. In addition to these physical benefits, the option to consent to placement in a mental health facility often spares a patient’s family or caregivers significant guilt in the event that the patient becomes violent and must be temporarily placed in such a facility regardless of opinions stated earlier. Admittedly, though, this benefit of Mental Health Advance Directives more frequently applies to hospital and psychiatric hospitals where patients undergo cycles of competency and incompetency and for whom the directives were originally designed. Nevertheless, mental health conditions such as delusion, depression, and hallucinations often accompany Alzheimer’s disease and justify the use of MHADs in these instances. Furthermore, the highly predictable nature of the progression of Alzheimer’s disease provides a real opportunity to anticipate and plan. Indeed, additional benefits of MHADs arise mainly from the process of future planning initiated by the directives. The resulting discussion often explicitly informs family members and caretakers of the patient’s core values, cultural care preferences, and financial plans, as well as illuminates the patient’s opinions on life-sustaining treatment. Whether one privileges the “then” self or the “now” self will typically have bearing on one’s interpretation of the validity of advance directives for dementia patients. One specific example is when an advance directive for those with mental illness is considered to be the “then” self’s wish. Several cases have demonstrated the effect this can have when the “now” self is preserved in the theory of the “then” self, as Post demonstrates with the case of Mrs. A, an incompetent dementia patient who, as a competent person, expressed a wish not to have any surgical intervention in the later stages of her disease. Unfortunately, she developed a painful tumor, and, despite her previous wish, Post recommends surgery to reduce the size of the tumor. With his consent, Post is respecting the need for comforting the “now” self and suggesting a policy in which pain treatment is primary and life prolongation is merely a secondary consideration. This way, demented persons and their caretakers are not viewed as empty shells, memory is not overvalued, and the feelings and needs of dementia patients are noted and responded to using compassionate standards of care.
These who oppose MHADs take issue with the very pos-
tibility that the directive may not be honored. Specifically, the
lack of a uniform competency standard plagues these
directives, which may be appropriately revoked if a patient is
incompetent.48 Few patients fall clearly into one category
or the other, while most display varying degrees of cogni-
tive impairment. Another argument against MHADs is
that, although Alzheimer’s disease may last eight to ten
years, most directives expire after only three years. Cur-
rently, a man or woman in an early stage of Alzheimer’s
disease may order an MHAD, but not refer the patient to a specialist or nec-
ternalism is dangerous to the individual.57 A final barrier to
manipulated for broad application and that the state’s pa-
tinents are deemed competent but can only be invoked if a patient
is incompetent.48 Few patients fall clearly into one category
or the other, while most display varying degrees of cogni-
tive impairment. Another argument against MHADs is
that, although Alzheimer’s disease may last eight to ten
years, most directives expire after only three years. Cur-
rently, a man or woman in an early stage of Alzheimer’s
disease may order an MHAD, but not refer the patient to a specialist or nec-
ternalism is dangerous to the individual.57 A final barrier to
manipulated for broad application and that the state’s pa-
tinents are deemed competent but can only be invoked if a patient
is incompetent.48 Few patients fall clearly into one category
or the other, while most display varying degrees of cogni-
tive impairment. Another argument against MHADs is
that, although Alzheimer’s disease may last eight to ten
years, most directives expire after only three years. Cur-
rently, a man or woman in an early stage of Alzheimer’s
disease may order an MHAD, but not refer the patient to a specialist or nec-
ternalism is dangerous to the individual.57 A final barrier to
manipulated for broad application and that the state’s pa-
tinents are deemed competent but can only be invoked if a patient
is incompetent.48 Few patients fall clearly into one category
or the other, while most display varying degrees of cogni-
tive impairment. Another argument against MHADs is
that, although Alzheimer’s disease may last eight to ten
years, most directives expire after only three years. Cur-
rently, a man or woman in an early stage of Alzheimer’s
disease may order an MHAD, but not refer the patient to a specialist or nec-
practical in the Netherlands, the United States, and anywhere else.

A second issue in the Netherlands with policy implications for the United States revolves around the acceptability of physician-assisted suicide (PAS) in patients with early stage Alzheimer’s disease. The Dutch refer to the ravages of dementia as “enhausting,” or effacement, and the Dutch government permits its citizens to seek physician-assisted suicide as a means to avoid this slow, debilitating process.5 5 Five cases of PAS in the Netherlands have been documented since 1980, and in 1990, Janet Adkins made headlines in the United States when she enlisted the help of Dr. Kevorkian and became the first dementia patient in the United States to participate in physician-assisted suicide.6 6 Post 1995 (309)

“Therefore, the authority of the ‘then’ self, while it should be restricted from ordering euthanasia and PAS, must otherwise be held paramount in an effort to prevent PAS and merciful killing.”

Bruce Jennings suggests three policy models to shape the future of dementia care: the public health model, the guardianship model, and trusteeship model.8 8 Rabins 2001 (453)

Policy

Bruce Jennings calls the third and perhaps most appropriate model, trusteeship model and suggests that the its primary goal is “sustaining agency and capacity” of the demented individual.9 9 Ibid.

“Another element to this debate is the fact that physician-assisted suicide for dementia patients has garnered massive criticism because the patient involved never officially received a diagnosis of Alzheimer’s disease before engaging in PAS. Critics believe that his symptoms were more characteristic of a condition known as primary progressive aphasia. This type of negligence leads down a hazardous road of potential misdiagnoses and unnecessary deaths due to the difficulty of diagnosing Alzheimer’s disease in an early stage. More troubling, still, is the idea of physicians who elect not to engage in PAS are viewed as wasters of valuable societal resources. Therefore, the authority of the ‘then’ self, while it should be restricted from ordering euthanasia and PAS, must otherwise be held paramount in an effort to prevent PAS and merciful killing.”

Public Policy

Jennings calls the third and perhaps most appropriate model, trusteeship model and suggests that the its primary goal is “sustaining agency and capacity” of the demented individual. Under this model, caregivers view dementia as a state of transitions rather than decline, and therapy routines display creativity and respect for the dementia patient as a human being. Minor illnesses and conditions are immediately treated to prevent accompanying further mental deterioration. The best treatment options involve increasing activity, minimizing psychotropic drug use, and educating the care staff. Caregivers emphasize the patient’s remaining abilities and build upon them as encouragement while simultaneously finding acceptable substitutes for activities that can no longer be performed.”

In this manner, the fundamental values of the “then” self are honored and maintained deep into disease progression.

Conclusion

Since cases of dementia are expected to more than triple in the coming years, public policy governing the vast realm of dementia ethics will become an important factor in the future of the United States healthcare system. Unlike the advent of drugs that slow, stop, or reverse the syndrome that gradually steals its victims’ most intimate thoughts and threaten the core of their identities, society’s interests are best served by a policy that protects those vulnerable individuals. The best model of protection society can offer results from respecting the precedent autonomy of the “then” self. Although arguments for the “now” self uphold the essential dignity of mankind, their roots in beneficence limits for activities that can no longer be performed.”

In this manner, the fundamental values of the “then” self are honored and maintained deep into disease progression.

The “now” patient and the “then self” Protection of the demented individual from harm defines the guardianship model. While guardianship is more pragmatic than state intervention because it involves the use of specific caregivers, this model is by no means perfect. Decision-making capacity from the perspective of the demented is viewed as all-or-nothing by the caregiver instead of as the continuum that it actually is. The inherent paternalism of guardianship also plays a major role in limiting patient autonomy, and this use of excessive caution can limit rather than foster the ward’s growth.

The “now” patient and the “then self” Protection of the demented individual from harm defines the guardianship model. While guardianship is more pragmatic than state intervention because it involves the use of specific caregivers, this model is by no means perfect. Decision-making capacity from the perspective of the demented is viewed as all-or-nothing by the caregiver instead of as the continuum that it actually is. The inherent paternalism of guardianship also plays a major role in limiting patient autonomy, and this use of excessive caution can limit rather than foster the ward’s growth.

ENDNOTES

1. Rabins 2001 (44)
2. Rabins 2001 (56)
3. Brodoff 2010 (240)
4. Ibid.
5. Post 1995 (309)
6. Ibid.
7. Rabins et al. 1994 (74)
8. Brodtok et al. 1995 (74)
9. Zimmie 2007 (5)
10. Richmond 2001 (10)
12. Post 1995 (308)
13. Rabins et al. 1995 (77)
14. Ibid.
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid.
17. Brodtok et al. 1994 (74)
18. Brodtok et al. 1995 (74)
19. Zimmie 2007 (5)
20. Richmond 2001 (10)
22. Binstock et al. 2003 (5)
23. Ibid.
24. Post 1995 (309)
25. Ibid.
26. Ibid.
27. Mitchell 2010 (33)
28. Ibid.
29. Binstock 1992 (77)
30. Post 1995 (309)
31. Mitchell 2010 (33)
32. Mitchell 2001 (317)
33. Post 1995 (309)
34. Ibid.
35. Ibid.
36. Post 1995 (309)
37. Ibid.
38. Zimmie 2007 (5)
39. Ibid.
40. Richmond 2001 (10)
41. Rosenfield 2001 (57)
42. Rosenfield 2001 (54)
43. Ibid.
44. Ibid.
45. Richmond 2001 (10)
46. Rosenfield 2001 (57)
47. Rosenfield 2001 (54)
48. Ibid.
49. Ibid.
50. Ibid.
51. Ibid.
52. Ibid.
53. Ibid.
REFERENCES

“This dependence on foreign aid, for both the Jordanian government and for the Iraqi population in Jordan, is not a long-term solution for assisting displaced Iraqis in Jordan. . . . Encouraging methods of economic self-reliance will be crucial in the near future and over the long-term.”
The study presents the situation and history of Iraq through the experiences of Iraqi women. Over the past three decades of conflict, women have endured losing husbands, sons, brothers, and other male family members. These losses, coupled with increasing denial of equal rights by Iraq’s previous socialist regime, have made them especially vulnerable as displaced persons, both inside and outside Iraq. Both Iraqi women in Iraq and those who have fled to Jordan face social barriers to working in the informal economy. A female-headed-household (FHH) denounces a household in which a woman is directly responsible for providing financially for her family. Iraqi FHHs in Iraq and in Jordan are stigmatized for living alone (without a male figure present). Women have played an important role in shaping the politics and direction of their communities in the past, and Iraqi women, both internally displaced persons and those living abroad, must assume this role again in rebuilding their country. According to recent statistics released in July 2010 by UNHCR, there are currently 30,710 Iraqi refugees residing in Jordan. Iraqis in Jordan are not considered refugees, but rather temporary “guests.” Most significantly, Iraqis are not legally allowed to work. It is widely known, however, that Iraqis engage in informal work in Jordan to provide an income for their families. While traditionally, in Iraqi families, the household head is male, it is estimated that among the 90,700 active Iraqis registered with UNHCR in Jordan today, 40% of Iraqi households are female-headed. These FHHs typically comprise the poorest sector of the population. Married women have very little knowledge about or are not involved in managing the finances of their households. It therefore becomes very difficult for Iraqi women who must assume the traditional role of father, providing a source of income for the family, and the traditional role of mother as caretaker of the house, at the same time. Many Iraqi women in Jordan have previously taken on the role of household head before immigrating to Jordan. This situation often results in the exploitation of both men and women by their employers. As they are not officially employed, they cannot seek justice for this exploitation in the Iraqi legal system. This study highlights the mechanisms by which Iraqi FHHs are coping economically in Jordan and in order to provide recommendations on how to better serve the most vulnerable group of displaced persons in Jordan.
were interviewed for this study, including women who were divorced, widowed, or who had husbands living abroad. Iraqi women interviewed had varying family sizes, education levels, and varying amounts of time spent in Jordan. Women were between the ages of 18 and 60, and thus had varying experiences growing up in Iraq. Interviews with Iraqi FHHs were conducted in the form of discussions and, while a core set of questions was asked to each participant, the order in which each question was answered. These discussions lasted no more than half an hour. Before their interviews, all participants were given a paper and pencil and were informed of their rights as participants of this study, as well as their right not to participate. Some non-Iraqi interviewees granted permission to use their names and interviewees’ names are preserved. Translators acted as witnesses for those who gave verbal consent.

FINDINGS

In total, fourteen individuals were interviewed, seven were Iraqi female household heads, and the remaining seven were individuals who have had experience working with Iraqi women in Jordan, and often times in the greater MENA region. All Iraqi female household heads interviewed had arrived in Jordan from Iraq, aside from one family that had arrived in 2006. Informal interviews were held with Iraqi women within Amman. Specifically, in the areas of Amman, Jordan, and in one case, in Sweden. Four out of seven interviewees stated they were receiving funds from mothers, sisters, or sons in the United States and in Iraq. Three out of these four families had two or more children attending school, and they reported that most of the funds received by family members were allocated towards the children’s education. For all but one of the households receiving remittances, the extra income helped to lift their living situation, which is fairly stable, and their lives generally more comfortable, than that of other female household heads interviewed. Therefore, it became clear that remittances are seen as a supplement to UNHCR cash assistance received each month. From these interviews, it did not indicate a consensus on the exact amounts of remittances received, making it difficult to generate conclusive findings. Interviews and observations suggested that while remittances were not as common as other economic coping mechanisms, they provided a significant source of income for those families that received them.

Volunteer Positions through Local NGOs

Although Iraqis in Jordan are not allowed to work in the formal economy, many NGOs have begun to allocate funding for volunteers. These positions, usually women, take on these positions for two to three months and are provided a monthly stipend, for transportation and their time, between 200-300 JD. Representatives interviewed from a CBO in Zarqa, Jordan, explained that some women take up two of these positions at once, and thus generate twice the amount for their work. In these positions, women work as translators, program coordinators, and often help facilitate programs within the local Iraqi community as well as the local community. Some of these organizations have volunteers who work in schools, as translators, and help with the correspondence between the NGOs and partnering CBOs. However, because of decreased funding for UNHCR and for local NGOs, the number of volunteers hired within the local community has decreased. As a result of restrictions in the annual budget, it became clear that many different individuals, volunteers are usually not hired for more than two or three months. These positions, then, do not provide long-term solutions for generating an adequate source of income; rather, they are a way for volunteers to generate a small amount of supplemental income for a limited amount of time.

Travel Stipends

Vocational training and skills courses for women have become increasingly prevalent among NGOs and CBOs as ways to provide useful programs to Iraqi women in Jordan. All but two Iraqi female household heads interviewed reported having attended such training courses, as well as psychosocial counseling sessions. These services are provided at no cost to participants, and Iraqi FHHs interested in receiving travel stipends for 2-3 days each. While these courses provide valuable services and skills to the attendees, there is speculation as to whether individuals participate to benefit from the services provided from the course itself, or to simply profit from the travel stipend, and make it difficult to accurately determine the amount of funds provided for Water Program (WFPW) representative stated that UNHCR and WFPW International provided one-time travel stipends as an indirect form of distributing cash assistance to Iraqis. A program coordinator in Irbid explained that for the Irbid social activity program, participants received a travel stipend of 2-3 JD each. These travel stipends, whether enabling Iraqi FHHs to directly work with fellow Iraqis in the local community, while receiving a small stipend for their travel, were not as common as other economic coping mechanisms, they provided a significant source of income for those families that received them.
women to profit from the amount remaining from the actual travel cost, are seen as an extra form of income.

Small businesses, solely headed by women entrepreneurs, were also reported in preliminary research to be sources of income for Iraqi FHHs. Because these businesses are home-based, household heads can simultaneously run this business while taking care of dependents and daily household work. Usually, female heads of household attend vocational training courses, which provide basic skills training classes or business entrepreneurship training. Upon completion of such skills training courses, women receive a package that helps them to begin their own business ventures.

Some non-Iraqi interviewees also cited microcredit programs as being ways in which Iraqi FHHs generate income. UNHCR, through UNICEF in Jordan, has sought to expand opportunities for Iraqi women and women in local communities by instituting microfinance programs. CBOs in Jordan such as WFEP and Khawla Bint Al Azwar, East Amman Charitable Association, and Al Amal have implemented similar microfinance programs. A WFEP representative explained that while the theory of microfinance for FHHs is an excellent one, microfinance and small business entrepreneurship, among Iraqi women, have not been successful. Irikora described her experience with Iraqi FHHs and small business entrepreneurship, among Iraqi women, have not been successful. Irikora described her experience with Iraqi FHHs and small business entrepreneurship, among Iraqi women, have not been successful. 

Irikora’s insight that many women do not see their situation as temporary. Their mind is not in Jordan, was also observed by the researcher in her field-work. All but one Iraqi female head of household interviewed intended to immigrate to the United States in the future. Despite studies that suggest small businesses can be a sustainable source of income, no Iraqi female household head interviewed in this study had her own business or was currently attending training courses for a business entrepreneurship. While enthusiastic about the potential of these programs for improving the FHHs’ livelihoods, a program coordinator from a CBO in Irbid emphasized that when these businesses are profitable, the income generated is not enough, on its own, to sustain a FHH, especially a household with children. Nevertheless, like remittances and travel stipends, profits from small businesses are seen as a supplement to monthly cash assistance from UNHCR.

Representatives from Khawla Bint Al Azwar, an organization funding a variety of different training courses for both Iraqi women and for women from the local community in Zarqa, explained the difficulties with funding business entrepreneurship courses and the base costs for the businesses. Reception to business entrepreneurship courses among Iraqi participants was highly positive, but they only had funding for beginning level courses. They have not received sponsorship or funding to expand these courses.

Informal Work

Because the large majority of Iraqis do not have work permits in Jordan, they are not able to work in the formal sector and be legally employed in Jordan. Thus, along with having a self-owned small business, some Iraqi FHHs are forced to work illegally in Jordan. There was an overall consensus, though, that women feel safer participating in informal work than men do. Iraqi men typically experience more trouble with the police, as Jordanian police are hesitant to harass women. Also, especially for household work, it is easier for a woman to enter another family’s home. Working as household cleaners or as seamstresses is the most common type of informal work reported by case-workers and CBO representatives.

There are two main problems arising from Iraqi FHHs engaging in the informal economy: they are paid less than their Jordanian counterparts or are not paid at all. On average, a social worker at an NGO in Amman reported that if paid for her work, an Iraqi woman receives between one half and three quarters of what another woman, working legally in Jordan, would make in her place.

On average, a social worker at an NGO in Amman reported that if paid for her work, an Iraqi woman receives between one half and three quarters of what another woman, working legally in Jordan, would make in her place. "

While Iraqi women in Jordan use a variety of means by which to ensure financial security for day-to-day necessities, vulnerable Iraqis, namely FHHs, in Jordan have a high dependence on UNHCR cash assistance as well as on foreign aid. Foreign aid is allocated to local NGOs and CBOs who, in turn, facilitate programs for Iraqi and non-Iraqi beneficiaries in the community. Iraqi female heads of household benefit from the stipends generated through these programs and from the extra cash generated by selling their travel stipends. These courses are seen as an opportunity to socialize with other Iraqis and bridge gaps between the Iraqi community and the local community.
Effectively, many Iraqi FHHs’ livelihoods in Jordan are highly dependent on foreign aid, both in the form of funding for volunteer positions and for travel, though UNHCR funding has begun to decline since 2009. Furthermore, the Jordanian government estimated in 2009 that Iraqi guest workers in Jordan had cost the country 1.6 billion JD from 2005-2008; however, the Jordanian government has never published the raw data from this estimate. While the Jordanian government has allowed Iraqis to access public schools and healthcare, there is speculation that Jordan has “benefited greatly” from the inflow of foreign aid, aimed at assisting those directly affected by the current conflict in Iraq. This dependence on foreign aid, for both the Jordanian government and for the Iraqi population in Jordan, is not a long-term solution for assisting displaced Iraqis in Jordan. Especially for vulnerable groups within Jordan’s Iraqi population, such as FHHs, encouraging methods of economic self-reliance will be crucial in the near future and over the long-term. International aid, through cash and material assistance, allows families to meet basic needs in the short-term; however, this aid cannot potentially increase the livelihood of Iraqis in Jordan. Because the majority of Iraqis in Jordan will not be resettled to a third country or return to Iraq in the near future, there will be a remaining core group of Iraqis in Jordan. Self-reliance strategies, which decrease reliance on international support for those Iraqis remaining in Jordan, deserve attention in future research projects.

While this study has focused specifically on FHHs as a vulnerable group within the Iraqi community in Jordan, new literature suggests that men displaced by conflict—particularly those who are not in school or are not working—are also considered vulnerable. With a loss of employment, “Iraqi women don’t have a stable mind here, as they see their situation as temporary. Their mind is not in Jordan.”

nomic self-reliance will be crucial in the near future and over the long-term. International aid, through cash and material assistance, allows families to meet basic needs. This aid, however, is not everlasting, and funding for UNHCR and NGOs has begun to decline over the past few years. Many organizations request additional funding in the form of aid or cash assistance, though these allocations are not a permanent solution for improving the lives of Iraqis in Jordan. More funding should be allocated to endeavors aiding assistance in order to better encourage their self-reliance. This, in itself, presents a challenge, as Iraqi women cannot work legally in Jordan. Previous studies on the situation of Iraqis in Jordan have concluded that the most sustainable way to improve the livelihoods of displaced Iraqis in Jordan is for the government to grant them work permits. However, the chance of the Jordanian government allowing Iraqis to work in Jordan is quite slim. Thus, future research on mechanisms of international funding to support economic sustainability is strongly encouraged.

Such programs, channelled through NGO programs on the ground, will bring forth new ways by which to encourage financial self-reliance for Iraqis remaining in Jordan, thereby reducing poverty among Iraqi refugees residing in Jordan. These mechanisms could serve as a model for displaced Iraqis in surrounding MENA countries, and, more generally, for other displaced peoples living in a foreign country.

Future studies regarding the possibility and efficacy of establishing a permanent community fund for Iraqis in Jordan is highly encouraged. This fund could potentially increase the livelihood of Iraqis in Jordan. Because the majority of Iraqis in Jordan will not be resettled to a third country or return to Iraq in the near future, there will be a remaining core group of Iraqis in Jordan. Self-reliance strategies, which decrease reliance on international support for those Iraqis remaining in Jordan, deserve attention in future research projects.


REFERENCES
42. Guglielmo 2008 (76)
41. Odeh 2007 (32)
40. Odeh 2007 (17)
39. Odeh 2007 (6)
38. Leila, interview by S. Moradian, 25 Nov. 2010
37. Ibid.
35. Khuzaie 2010
34. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
33. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
32. While Jordanian law allows both legal and illegal workers to work legally for employment in the workplace, Iraqi women feel that their working illegally prevents them from taking legal recourse when exploited for their work in the informal sector.
31. Leila, interview by S. Moradian, 25 Nov. 2010
30. Nadia, interview by S. Moradian, 16 Nov. 2010
29. Leila, interview by S. Moradian, 16 Nov. 2010
28. While Jordanian law allows both legal and illegal workers to work legally for employment in the workplace, Iraqi women feel that their working illegally prevents them from taking legal recourse when exploited for their work in the informal sector.
27. Aya and Zeinab, interview by S. Moradian 23 Nov. 2010
26. Ibid.
25. Ibid.
24. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
23. While Jordanian law allows both legal and illegal workers to work legally for employment in the workplace, Iraqi women feel that their working illegally prevents them from taking legal recourse when exploited for their work in the informal sector.
22. Ibid.
21. Ibid.
20. Ibid.
19. Women’s Refugee Commission 2009 (3)
18. Al Ali 2007b (186)
17. Rheema, interview by S. Moradian, 14 Nov. 2010
15. Debit cards are distributed to Iraqi families, rather than them obtaining cash assistance from UNHCR Jordan each month.
14. All Iraqi women interviewed were from Baghdad.
13. Mean number of individuals in FHHs interviewed was 2.3.
11. Al Ali 2007b (138)
10. Al Ali 2007b (12)
8. Al Ali 2007b (56)
7. Mean number of individuals in FHHs interviewed was 2.3.
6. Al Iraqi women interviewed were from Baghdad.
5. Al Iraqi women interviewed were from Baghdad.
4. Al Iraqi women interviewed were from Baghdad.
3. Odeh 2007 (6)
2. Odeh 2007 (29)
1. Odeh 2007 (32)

ELEMANTTS | FALL 2011

COMING TO JORDAN


ENDNOTES
1. Al JT - 21 Apr 2011
2. Guglielmo 2008 (46)
3. Al Ali 2007b (58)
4. Al Ali 2007b (56)
5. Odeh 2007 (5)
7. Ibid.
8. Guglielmo 2008 (59)
10. Al Ali 2007b (127)
11. Al Ali 2007b (138)
13. Mean number of individuals in FHHs interviewed was 2.3.
14. All Iraqi women interviewed were from Baghdad.
15. Debit cards are distributed to Iraqi families, rather than them obtaining cash assistance from UNHCR Jordan each month.
16. Women’s Refugee Commission 2009 (3)
17. Rheema, interview by S. Moradian, 14 Nov. 2010
18. Aya and Zeinab, interview by S. Moradian 23 Nov. 2010
20. Ibid.
21. Ibid.
22. Ibid.
23. Ibid.
24. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
25. Ibid.
26. Ibid.
27. Ibid.
28. While Jordanian law allows both legal and illegal workers to work legally for employment in the workplace, Iraqi women feel that their working illegally prevents them from taking legal recourse when exploited for their work in the informal sector.
29. Ibid.
30. Nadia, interview by S. Moradian, 16 Nov. 2010
31. Leila, interview by S. Moradian, 16 Nov. 2010
32. While Jordanian law allows both legal and illegal workers to work legally for employment in the workplace, Iraqi women feel that their working illegally prevents them from taking legal recourse when exploited for their work in the informal sector.
33. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
34. Irikora, interview by S. Moradian, 9 Nov. 2010
35. Khuzaie 2010
37. Ibid.
38. Leila, interview by S. Moradian, 25 Nov. 2010
39. UNHCR, UNHCR - July 2010.
40. Odeh 2007 (57)
41. Al Ali and Pratt 2009 (657)
42. Guglielmo 2008 (56)
“The strong presence of art and archaeology, despite a lack of textual evidence, shows how the distinct cult of Mithras acted not only as a supplementary religion for Roman troops, but also as a cornerstone of religious tolerance in this ancient city.”
Due to its uniqueness, the religions were exceptionally atypically tolerant of and associated with each other. The religious relationships at Dura-Europos were exceptional in gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city. Tracing the foundation of the cult of Mithras in the civilization of Dura-Europos is essential to the understanding of religions such as Judaism and Christianity which welcomed, and in fact promoted, the conversion of both genders. 3 However, one must not forget that the two were also almost exclusively male oriented in that only men assumed the positions of prophets, deities, or apostles in the Bible. According to Lucinda Dirven, the cult of Mithras became “a brotherhood of men who mainly shared the same profession.” While it is not clear where those men, and particularly Palmyrene archers, originally became exposed to the cult, it is clear that it was possibly adopted in Dacia or Moesia.4

While the historical context and religious participants are clearly important elements of any religion or cult. The actual beliefs and customs of each of the cults of Mithras should re-ceive significant attention in this discussion. This mysteri-
ous religion was thought to include seven levels of initiation, ritual banquets, and a promise of salvation after death to all members.5 Cultists worshipped the god Mithras, originally an Iranian god who, according to legend, was born from a rock in a moment outside time and killed a cosmic, primeval bull, after which, Mithras consecrated Sol and be-stowed on him his nimbus.6 The account of these events necessarily marks:

Some scholars have assumed that one reason for the great variety of cults found at Dura-Europos is the variety of peoples from different cities and regions who came to Dura-Europos. It was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks: “Due to its uniqueness, the cult of Mithras is a religious sect that deserves its own analysis. The lack of Mithraic texts necessitates conclusions about the group based on the art and archaeology unearthed at Dura-Europos. By starting with an examination of Mithraic history and religious art works while cross-referencing the Bible and The Aeneid, scholars can discover what made the cult of Mithras so unique and capable of gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city.

The Aeneid

While the historical context and religious participants are clearly important elements of any religion or cult. The actual beliefs and customs of each of the cults of Mithras should receive significant attention in this discussion. This mysterious cult was thought to include seven levels of initiation, ritual banquets, and a promise of salvation after death to all members.5 Cultists worshipped the god Mithras, originally an Iranian god who, according to legend, was born from a rock in a moment outside time and killed a cosmic, primeval bull, after which, Mithras consecrated Sol and bestowed on him his nimbus.6 The account of these events necessarily marks:

Some scholars have assumed that one reason for the great variety of cults found at Dura-Europos is the variety of peoples from different cities and regions who came to Dura-Europos. It was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks: “Due to its uniqueness, the cult of Mithras is a religious sect that deserves its own analysis. The lack of Mithraic texts necessitates conclusions about the group based on the art and archaeology unearthed at Dura-Europos. By starting with an examination of Mithraic history and religious art works while cross-referencing the Bible and The Aeneid, scholars can discover what made the cult of Mithras so unique and capable of gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city.

Tracing the foundation of the cult of Mithras in the civilization of Dura-Europos is essential to the discussion of its historical and religious significance and its fundamental deviation from the more popular religions of the city. The Mithraeum, the building of worship for the cult of Mithras, was built on the northern wall of Dura-Europos in approximately A.D. 165. Palmyrene archers serving in the Roman army were the first to institute Mithraic practices into Dacian society, emphasizing the make-believe of the religious culture of Dura-Europos. The Cult of Mithras actually gained footing during the reign of the third cultural group of the Romans rather than that of the Selucids or Parthians.7 Perhaps the cult of Mithras was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks:

Some scholars have assumed that one reason for the great variety of cults found at Dura-Europos is the variety of peoples from different cities and regions who came to Dura-Europos. It was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks: “Due to its uniqueness, the cult of Mithras is a religious sect that deserves its own analysis. The lack of Mithraic texts necessitates conclusions about the group based on the art and archaeology unearthed at Dura-Europos. By starting with an examination of Mithraic history and religious art works while cross-referencing the Bible and The Aeneid, scholars can discover what made the cult of Mithras so unique and capable of gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city.

Tracing the foundation of the cult of Mithras in the civilization of Dura-Europos is essential to the discussion of its historical and religious significance and its fundamental deviation from the more popular religions of the city. The Mithraeum, the building of worship for the cult of Mithras, was built on the northern wall of Dura-Europos in approximately A.D. 165. Palmyrene archers serving in the Roman army were the first to institute Mithraic practices into Dacian society, emphasizing the make-believe of the religious culture of Dura-Europos. The Cult of Mithras actually gained footing during the reign of the third cultural group of the Romans rather than that of the Selucids or Parthians.7 Perhaps the cult of Mithras was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks:

Some scholars have assumed that one reason for the great variety of cults found at Dura-Europos is the variety of peoples from different cities and regions who came to Dura-Europos. It was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks: “Due to its uniqueness, the cult of Mithras is a religious sect that deserves its own analysis. The lack of Mithraic texts necessitates conclusions about the group based on the art and archaeology unearthed at Dura-Europos. By starting with an examination of Mithraic history and religious art works while cross-referencing the Bible and The Aeneid, scholars can discover what made the cult of Mithras so unique and capable of gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city.

Tracing the foundation of the cult of Mithras in the civilization of Dura-Europos is essential to the discussion of its historical and religious significance and its fundamental deviation from the more popular religions of the city. The Mithraeum, the building of worship for the cult of Mithras, was built on the northern wall of Dura-Europos in approximately A.D. 165. Palmyrene archers serving in the Roman army were the first to institute Mithraic practices into Dacian society, emphasizing the make-believe of the religious culture of Dura-Europos. The Cult of Mithras actually gained footing during the reign of the third cultural group of the Romans rather than that of the Selucids or Parthians.7 Perhaps the cult of Mithras was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks:

Some scholars have assumed that one reason for the great variety of cults found at Dura-Europos is the variety of peoples from different cities and regions who came to Dura-Europos. It was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks: “Due to its uniqueness, the cult of Mithras is a religious sect that deserves its own analysis. The lack of Mithraic texts necessitates conclusions about the group based on the art and archaeology unearthed at Dura-Europos. By starting with an examination of Mithraic history and religious art works while cross-referencing the Bible and The Aeneid, scholars can discover what made the cult of Mithras so unique and capable of gaining a following in an already religiously cultivated city.

Tracing the foundation of the cult of Mithras in the civilization of Dura-Europos is essential to the discussion of its historical and religious significance and its fundamental deviation from the more popular religions of the city. The Mithraeum, the building of worship for the cult of Mithras, was built on the northern wall of Dura-Europos in approximately A.D. 165. Palmyrene archers serving in the Roman army were the first to institute Mithraic practices into Dacian society, emphasizing the make-believe of the religious culture of Dura-Europos. The Cult of Mithras actually gained footing during the reign of the third cultural group of the Romans rather than that of the Selucids or Parthians.7 Perhaps the cult of Mithras was a newer, more attractive practice, but even more probably it is that Dura-Europos was simply becoming an increasingly impressionable city that was open to various languages, cultures, and religions. Gail R. Hoffman remarks:
was taken from various pieces of art in the Mithraeum, which will be examined later on in the discussion.

Such discoveries could be made from only art and archaeology because there were no written documents such as The Aeneid or the Bible which scholars could use as religious evidence. Little was recorded about the cult’s beliefs and practices precisely because of its nature; as a secret cult the members would not have written much down, but instead would have expressed their religion through reliefs and other artwork in the Mithraeum. The graffiti on the walls of the third-century Mithraeum at Dura-Europos lists the names of the initiates with their Mithraic grade, while paintings and sculptures hint at various aspects of their religious practices. Subsequently, the cult of Mithras shows the importance of artwork and archaeology to understanding the religions of Dura-Europos and all ancient cities.

The Mithraeum itself, as the site for worshipping Mithras, becomes an existential piece of evidence in unearthing the Mithraic practice. It was built into a renovated house in 168 CE by the Palmyrene commander Zenobius, included the dedicant, or donor, along with other figures thought to be members of the cult association. Their presence is significant in that they are not family members, which was typical of the Roman cult in which familial ties were unimportant, and thus creates a blunt contrast with Judaism and Christianity, in which family was of the utmost importance: “Honour your father and your mother so that you may long in the land that Yahweh your God is giving you.”

The cult of Mithras offers no such declaration of paternal or familial prominence, and instead focuses on the relationship between Mithras and the sun god Sol. In a painting found in the Mithraeum at Dura-Europos, which was originally placed to the left of the cult niche during the building’s second phase, Sol and Mithras are shown feasting on the sacrificial bull. Unlike in Roman or Greek tradition, the god Mithras himself seemed to be doing both the sacrificing and feasting. This presents a problem in that it completely opposes traditional beliefs regarding sacrifice. When Hercules came to the aid of the Arcadians to kill the bestial half-man Cacus, “he choked him till his eyes burst out, his gullet whitened and dried up with loss of blood.” He left the violence at that.” He never ate the animal as a sacrificial feast and instead, “since then / This feast (by the Arcadians) is held, and younger men are told to keep the memory of the day.” It seems that though the cult of Mithras may have been traditional in holding ritual banquets, it was not unique. In any event, the ideology behind such feasts remains very unique.

Such oppositions and critiques of Mithraism can actually work to demonstrate how well the different religious groups coalesced in Dura-Europos. Although historical and religious texts demonstrate rivalry and intolerance of different religions, the archaeological evidence for Mithraism, Christianity, Judaism, and paganism show adherence to other belief systems and a willingness to share common elements in their ritual space. The commemorations of the Mithraeum, Synagogue, and Christian building in design and decoration are especially unique and create a “Dura-rena” style of art and architecture. The typical rivalry and distrust usually seen among religions of the third century remains very unique, but took on a different twist.

Despite its distinctiveness, the cult of Mithras does maintain a subtle relationship with other religions such as Christianity. The pagan Celus criticized that “superstitious Mithraics and Christians are led by wicked men who convince simple people to believe in their false teachings without explanation.” The grouping of Mithraism and Christianity seems faulty because the two are wholly independent and individual religions. Unlike the cult of Mithras, both Judaism and Christianity claim a basis on the textual evidence of the Hebrew Bible. Furthermore, Mithraic practices also involve worshipping a god entirely different than Yahweh. Critics, such as Justin Martyr, never even held fast to these apologetic works by claiming that “the wicked devils who adheres to the cult of Mithras have imitated the actions commanded by Jesus of his followers.” Martyr saw similarities between Mithraism and Christianity, as the cult followers ate and drank with prearranged prayers during their ritual feast, but took bread and water rather than wine. The act of feasting, however, was not unique to Christianity and it was often pagan practice to eat a sacrificial feast while praying to the gods.
REFERENCES


“Beyond the purpose of entertainment, historical films serve as portals to the past, and the power of film then becomes the ability to transport the viewer to that past.”
While war films had previously created an image of the Conflict in the Social Climate these films, serves to mirror American society’s self-aware- of reconciliation, as portrayed by the main characters of character with an altogether novel identity. This final place 
strate the general transformation of the “American hero” (1994). Each film ultimately reflects different stages of Forrest Gump Platoon (1979), (1970), proves to be a marker of change for the following Vietnam battle. Yet, to consider the genre of these films and to ex-
the Americans at home and images of those abroad in 
ments of this image-laden war. Rich Warland expressed 
al and powerful vehicle for reflecting the personal senti-
mental. Such are the conflicting sentiments depicted in numerous Vietnam centered films that were produced during, soon after, and long after the end of the war. Throughout the past half century, film has become an ide-
and powerful vehicle for reflecting the personal senti-
sentiment. 
ment that the government was a potential instigator of vio-
ture, and many Americans slowly toyed with the realiza-
Inherent in the Vietnam War themed movie persists a re-
fluence on the screen? Is the historical films, which then influences the version of history 
tivity of film. This difference is the basis for mediated his-
ory when she explains, “The relationship of the cam-
re-fashioning its presentation to shape the contemporary public’s memory of the past. Strounk notes this analytic and catalytic interaction between a film, history, and memory when she explains, “The relationship of the cam-
rebeautiful. On one hand, photographed, filmed, and videotaped im-
mation can embody and read a history, on the other hand, they have the capacity, through the power of their pres-
 vaults the debate on how one’s memory of the past is con-
crease the images on the screen. To film history is 
are clearly incompatible with the professional histori-
the presenter’s own moment of purposefulness in covering and exposing the ‘real’ stories of the war, which the military and political establishment attempted to hide.”2 Strounk is quick to point out that this search through the past rings true for our collective society as a whole, rather than for any spec-
overlaid images of war, the conflict, and the elusive meaning of war, as well as the process of remembering it accurately. William Guynn, author of Writing History in Film, warns the reader of overly mediat-
ing indelible images of the past on the public imagination. Historians acknowledge that filmic representation has such power.

clear-cut enemy to ensure domestic independence and jus-
tice, Vietnam-era movies would emphasize the image of Americans resisting domestic order rather than resisting the foreign enemy. Self-awareness of one’s place in society seemed to the pursuit of many inelay American culture, and many Americans slowly toyed with the real-
tension that the government was a potential instigator of vio-
Inherently, this is due to the nature of film as the art of image capturing and simultaneous mem-

As the camera images, whether photographs, films, or television front-

As one of the most prolific film historians of the late 20th and early 21st centuries, Mary Sturken’s work has been instrumental in understanding the cultural and historical impact of film. Her research has explored the ways in which film has shaped our collective memory of the past, and how it has been used to both preserve and distort historical narratives.

Sturken’s work is characterized by a commitment to understanding film as a powerful tool for shaping our collective consciousness. In her book, “Reframing History: On Film and Memory,” she explores the ways in which film has been used to construct and deconstruct historical narratives. Sturken argues that film has the power to shape our understanding of the past, and that it is therefore important to critically examine the ways in which film has been used to construct particular versions of history.

One of the key themes that runs through much of Sturken’s work is the idea of film as a form of historical memory. She argues that film has the ability to capture and preserve events in a way that is both immediate and permanent, allowing for a form of collective memory that is both visceral and emotional. However, she also points out that film is not a neutral medium, and that its power lies in its ability to select, interpret, and frame events in particular ways.

Sturken’s work also explores the ways in which film has been used to negotiate and reconcile the conflicting narratives of war and memory. She argues that film has the power to both preserve and distort historical narratives, and that it is therefore important to critically examine the ways in which film has been used to construct particular versions of history.

In her book, “Images of the Vietnam War,” Sturken examines the ways in which film has been used to construct and deconstruct historical narratives about the Vietnam War. She argues that film has been used to both preserve and distort historical narratives, and that it is therefore important to critically examine the ways in which film has been used to construct particular versions of history.

Sturken’s work is characterized by a commitment to understanding film as a powerful tool for shaping our collective consciousness. In her book, “Reframing History: On Film and Memory,” she explores the ways in which film has been used to construct and deconstruct historical narratives. Sturken argues that film has the power to shape our understanding of the past, and that it is therefore important to critically examine the ways in which film has been used to construct particular versions of history.
Given in this article, Sturken highlights the basic binary: the past is conveyed in two ways, often in opposition. Ultimately, multiple narratives about history are constructed in their attempt to accurately represent the memory within a culture. This struggle that image may or may not endure. This deliberation over the level of conflict expressed in the films' narratives. Indeed, Sturken refers to David James’s breakdown of the development of the Vietnam War film from the 1960s to 1970s when she writes:

David James has divided the mainstream films made about the Vietnam War into four groups: films made during the war and up until the 1970s, of which were very few; films made in the late 1970s; films made in the early 1980s; and films made in the late 1980s and 1990s. He has identified four stages in the evolution of the Vietnam War film genre as it has developed, and each of these stages has a different set of issues to address. The first stage, which he refers to as “cultural memory,” involves a gradual change in the way people remember and talk about the war.

The trend among these films has been observed and recorded on the true uniqueness of this experience in American history and the mark it has left on American culture. This stage focuses on the idea of the “cultural memory” of the war and how it has evolved over time. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict. The second stage, which he refers to as “public memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the public. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.

The third stage, which he refers to as “collective memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the collective. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.

The fourth stage, which he refers to as “public memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the public. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.

As narrative films depicting a highly charged event in US history, Vietnam War docudramas often have two conflicting intentions—to represent the war realistically and to examine its larger meanings through metaphorical interpretation. For Americans and American culture, the Vietnam War depicted in films represents both of these “conflicting intentions.” Interestingly, the augmentation of this conflict can be witnessed over several decades, suggesting a link between the levels of conflict in the film and the real conflict present among Americans’ reactions to the Vietnam War. Ultimately, the film genre can be categorized based on the level of conflict expressed in the films’ narratives. Indeed, Sturken refers to David James’s breakdown of the development of the Vietnam War film from the 1960s to 1970s when she writes:

David James has divided the mainstream films made about the Vietnam War into four groups: films made during the war and up until the 1970s, of which were very few; films made in the late 1970s; films made in the early 1980s; and films made in the late 1980s and 1990s. He has identified four stages in the evolution of the Vietnam War film genre as it has developed, and each of these stages has a different set of issues to address. The first stage, which he refers to as “cultural memory,” involves a gradual change in the way people remember and talk about the war.

The trend among these films has been observed and recorded on the true uniqueness of this experience in American history and the mark it has left on American culture. This stage focuses on the idea of the “cultural memory” of the war and how it has evolved over time. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict. The second stage, which he refers to as “public memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the public. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.

The third stage, which he refers to as “collective memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the collective. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.

The fourth stage, which he refers to as “public memory,” involves the way in which the war is remembered and talked about by the public. In this phase, filmmakers have sought to capture the experience and meaning of the war in a way that is both reflective and critical of the dominant narrative of the conflict.
The most recent Vietnam films were in many ways a reaction against the inaccuracies of the earlier films. Produced after the construction of the Vietnam Veterans Memorial, the most recent Vietnam films constitute part of the rewriting of the war’s narrative generated by the memorial and the accompanying process of healing and memory. These films are also more self-conscious about their role as historical works."

In being more “self-conscious” about the historical depiction of the war, the more contemporary Vietnam films in-
depict such a disturbing and visually assaulting act of violence such as the rape of a young woman resonates with the notion of “senseless violence” that became a common sentiment among protagonists of the war. In an attempt to explain the rationale behind this type of violence in films, Polan writes:

“A space of floating, of meaningless violence that can come from anywhere, but also the effect of not just of sitting, of living witness to this act. The messengers want to imagine that this is the experience of war, but it is also an experience of cinema, a com- mon occurrence. In this variation, its redundancy of what Gilles Deleuze famously termed the ‘time-image,’ a configura- tion of modern cinema’s amnesia and auspicious inability to fix itself within the world.22”

Although controversial and uncomfortable for viewers to accept, violence against young women did happen during the war, and to include this social dimension would only mediate the past in film once again. In the same manner that the soldiers in the film do not know how to comprehend how their own existence is turned; every sense, the same confusion and frustration is reflected in the film’s plotline. The struggle to even include sexual violence with nonaction. One might want to imagine that this is the example of understanding their place in the war. Yet, this reason this film suggests a kind of reconciliation with the ambiguity that befell the honorable character of Forrest Gump, who transcends every marginality to embody every American. Forrest survives the war and furthermore leaves Vietnam with little to no remorse about serving his country. As a reciprocal for American sentiment toward the Vietnam War, he has the metaphor of society toward the war the detached level of conflict that sedates our current American culture. While we do not forget the war, Americans today do not feel the need to remember the war either.

**CONCLUSION**

No one has seemingly felt the need to portray the Vietnam War in a film recently. The public contemporary seems to have reached a more comfortable place, or at least a better understanding of its role in the war. Not only have we re- written the idea of the “American soldier” but we have also finally acknowledged the darker side of the Vietnam War. With 1980s film depictions of the Vietnam War such as Platoon (1986) and Casualties of War (1989), directors took a critical stance against America’s role in the East, conveying a grittier tone than the previous light heartedness of the 1970s. In an attempt to present a means to confront loss and transform it into healing. It is precisely the instability of memory that allows for renewal and redemption without letting the tension of the past in the present fade away.23

Reliving a culturally significant event in American history through “reenactment” can alleviate any negative sentiment that is associated with the memory of that event in the past. Visiting the past becomes even more efficient when utilizing the medium of film to do the images of American history. Yet, the healing process cannot be de- spite a recent increase in production of Vietnam War rev- ersed films. Perhaps the current social climate does not need these films as it once did during the era of the Viet- nam War. Indeed, as reflective as memories are of history, is the movie screen of culture and of that culture’s history.

**REFERENCES**


Indeed, memory often takes the form not of recollection but of cultural reenactment that serves important needs for catharsis and emotional expression. As reflective as memories are of history, is the movie screen of culture and of that culture’s history.
“Indeed, the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux was commissioned and crafted during an exceptionally transitional period in French history; to a certain extent, the statue stylistically exemplifies this transition from the treasured prosperity of the thirteenth century to the impending controversy of the fourteenth century.”

**The Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux**

*An Affectionate Mother in an Unaffectionate Era*

Brian D. Varian

Named after the third and final wife of King Charles IV of France, the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux is an ornate, silver-gilt statue of familiar iconography—the Virgin and Child. This exquisite reliquary statue, coming out of the late Gothic period, embodies the devotional fervor of the medieval world, the precarious position of France during the fourteenth century, and the very vision of its patron, Jeanne d’Evreux. Crafted amidst a crisis of succession in the French monarchy, the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux hints at a kingdom in transition, while, at the same time, evidencing a pivotal transition in artistic style. Indeed, behind the familiar iconography of the Virgin and Child lies a fascinating bit of history, of which this reliquary statue itself may serve as a relic.
In 1339, English forces under the leadership of King Edward III were arriving on the continent of Europe and were laying brutal siege to the Flemish city of Cambrai. Meanwhile, a Parisian silversmith was completing an elaborately adorned reliquary statue of the Virgin and Child, a statue known in modern times as the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux. Indeed, the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux was commissioned and crafted during an exceptionally transitional period in French history; to a certain extent, the statue stylistically exemplifies this transition from the treasured prosperity of the thirteenth century to the impending controversy of the fourteenth century. In addition to the style and its bearing upon the iconography, there are other aspects of the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux worth discussing, including the patronage of the statue and its functionality as a reliquary. Thus, this paper begins by examining the patronage of the statue, particularly amid the turmoil surrounding the onset of the Hundred Years War. Next, the essay discusses the style, iconography, and medium of the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux, with regard to both the statue itself as well as the statue within the context of the Late Gothic Period. Finally, the essay concludes by analyzing the function of the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux as a reliquary, one which remarkably contains the relics of perhaps the most venerated saint in all of Christendom, Mary.

The Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux was named after the French queen who so generously financed the reliquary statue. Jeanne d’Evreux was the third wife of King Charles IV of France (1322-1328), the last reigning monarch of the Capetian line. While history regards the brief reign of Charles IV as insignificant, the death of Charles IV was of the utmost significance, commencing a quite unprecedented struggle over the succession of the French throne. Charles IV, the third son of King Philip IV (1285-1328), inherited the throne upon the deaths of his two older brothers, Louis X (1314-1316) and Philip V (1316-1322), each of whom died without a male heir. Unfortunately such was also the fate of Charles IV. The first wife of Charles IV, Blanche of Burgundy, gave birth to a son and a daughter who both died as infants.3 The second wife, Mary of Luxembourg, gave birth to a son and a daughter, with only the daughter surviving into adulthood.4 The third and final wife, Jeanne d’Evreux gave birth to three daughters.5 Thus, the direct Capetian line came to a tragic end with the death of Charles IV in 1328.

Nevertheless, there were male descendants of Philip IV in 1328. King Charles of Navarre and King Edward III of England were the sons of Jeanne (sister-in-law of Jeanne d’Evreux) and Isabella, respectively, and thus the grandsons of Philip IV. Philip IV had several daughters, including Jeanne and Isabella.6 It seemed almost natural for a grandson of Philip IV to succeed Charles IV. However, it was a longstanding tradition within the French monarchy that a woman could neither assume the throne nor transmit the throne.7 Therefore, the throne passed to the cousin of Charles IV, Philip V, known as Philip VI.8 The ascendance of Philip VI to the kingship of France was arguably the start of the Hundred Years War.

Even after the coronation of Philip VI, Edward III of England still held ambitions for the French throne, much more so than Charles of Navarre.9 It is important to note that the English already maintained a strong presence on the European continent. The vast Duchy of Guyenne in the southwestern part of France had been under English control for a long time.10 Nevertheless, the territorial control that England exerted over Guyenne paled in comparison to the economic control that England exerted over Flanders. In the early fourteenth century, Flanders was an exceptionally wealthy country, largely because of the textile industry.11 Long before it was colonized by the English, Flanders was distinct from the Kingdom of France. There were several guilds in Flanders that were completely independent of any ties between both states; in fact, Flemish nobility were often simultaneously Flemish nobility.12 Certainly, economic and political influences were pulling Flanders in opposite directions. With the controversy over the succession of the French throne so recent, Edward III decided to exploit the tenuous kingship of Philip VI and invade Flanders in 1337.13 But even before the forces of Edward III were able to arrive on the European continent and begin attacking Flemish cities, Philip VI was already laying siege to English fortresses in Guyenne.

The conflict escalated rapidly. Unbeknownst at the time, the Hundred Years War was already underway. It was during this period of monarchial uncertainty and intensifying warfare that the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux was produced.

In all likelihood, Jeanne d’Evreux commissioned the statue in 1334, prior to the death of Charles IV and prior to the onset of the Hundred Years War.14 The statue was not completed until 1339, according to a dated inscription on the base.15 Throughout the thirteenth century, guilds emerged as the predominant means of organization for the various industries that existed within the medieval world.16 In France, the guilds were differentiated based upon the material that was used, rather than the object that was produced.17 For example, rosary-makers who used bone belonged to a separate guild from rosary-makers who used amber.18 A statue such as the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux, composed of multiple materials, was almost certainly the cumulative product of many different craftsmen belonging to several different guilds. Therefore, the statue quite possibly represents more than fifteen years worth of craftsmanship, given that different craftsmen could be working on its various components simultaneously. While the primary craftsman of the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux is unknown, it is likely that this craftsman worked near the Grand Pont in Paris. In many instances, guilds gravitated toward geographic districts or quarters.19 Money changers and those who worked with precious metals were normally located on the Grand Pont.20 With such an abundance of silver, the statue was probably sold in part in order to support this location. Once the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux was finally completed, its namesake donated the statue to the royal abbey of Saint-Denis, in the hope of obtaining spiritual merit.21 Jeanne d’Evreux never intended the statue for private devotion, but for public.

As a public devotional image, the iconography of the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux is quite accessible—the Virgin and Child. The Virgin and Child comprise the main portion of
“During a time of monarchical uncertainty, and uncertainty more generally, the fleur-de-lis likely served as a hopeful sign of unending prosperity—a hope that all but disappeared in the following century.”

the Flight into Egypt, the Presentation in the Temple, the Massacre of the Innocents, the Descent from the Cross, the Flight into Egypt, the Presentation in the Temple, the Annunciation to the Shepherds, the Adoration of the Magi, scenes from the life of Christ, including the Nativity, the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux

the Virgin stands with a certain sway in her body, a distiguishing characteristic of Late Gothic sculpture. By the concluding years of the fourteenth century, the austere, enthroned Virgin was replaced by the more affectionate, standing Virgin. And by 1324, the enameled Virgin was widespread throughout French sculpture, both stone and metal. The beginnings of this trend are visible as early as the rather conventional iconography of the statue. The Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux

While the Late Gothic style clearly influenced the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux, the unique circumstances surrounding this particular statue likely influenced it as well. Still, any influences of this latter type are mostly speculative. Even so, they are worth mentioning. When the statue was commissioned in 1324, Jeanne d’Evreux, a young woman, was to give birth to three daughters in the years 1325, 1326, and 1328. It is possible that the statue was commissioned to celebrate Jeanne’s future role as mother.36 In the Virgin of Jeanne d’Evreux, the upper portion of Christ’s body is nude, allowing for a much more natural representation of Christ. Arguably, this sort of representation foreshadows the gradual conclusion of the Gothic Period and the beginning of the Renaissance.
umphal queen, but as a tender and affectionate mother embracing her child, Christ.

REFERENCES


ENDNOTES

1. MacDonald 1915 (229)
2. Duby 1966 (20)
3. Volkmann 2002 (65)
4. Ibid.
5. Ibid.
6. Ibid.
7. Ibid.
8. Duby 1966 (275)
9. Ibid.
10. Ibid.
11. MacDonald 1915 (220)
12. Ibid.
13. Ibid.
14. Ibid.
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid.
17. Ibid.
19. Ibid 1966 (24)
20. Francois 1991 (48)
21. Ibid.
22. Ibid.
23. Ibid.
24. Ibid.
25. Ibid.
26. Ibid.
27. Ibid.
29. Ibid.
30. Male 1987 (177)
31. Snyder 1989 (449)
32. Ibid.
33. Ibid.
34. Ibid.
35. Ibid.
36. Male 1987 (177)
37. Ibid 2006 (38)
38. Ibid.
39. van On 2001 (20)
40. Ibid.
41. Ibid.
42. Ibid.
43. Ibid.
44. Ibid.
45. Ibid.
46. Ibid.

THE VIRGIN OF JEANNE D’ERVEX

ELEMENTS | FALL 2011

58

59
Currently, the needs of the organ donation community are not being met. The sole use of brain-dead donors is limiting the amount of possible viable organs that could be donated each year. For this reason, a handful of hospitals have implemented protocols to introduce non-heart beating cadaver donors into the pool, and many more are investigating this as an option. NHBDCs are individuals who have experienced the cessation of cardio-respiratory function but are not brain-dead and so could be resuscitated if life support were removed—in this way they do not yet fulfill either of the two criteria for death. It would not be until the surrogate consents to donation that life support would be removed and irreversible death could be declared two to five minutes after cessation of heart function. The AMA’s Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs estimates that the inclusion of this group could expand the donor pool by 20-35%. NHBDCs have been criticized for testing the boundaries of irreversible death, and this article addresses such concerns in order to show that the protocol is both ethical and increasingly necessary.
INTRODUCTION TO THE ISSUE

The number of organs needed each year greatly exceeds the number available for transplant. Over 102,000 Americans were waiting for organs as of January 1, 2011, yet the 28,664 organ transplants that occurred in 2010, came from just 14,506 donors. Some of this disparity stems from the strict eligibility criteria set forth by the Organ Procurement and Transplantation Network (OPTN). The Protocol establishes criteria for age, living donors, as well as medical criteria regarding, for instance, hypertension, intracranial hemorrhage, and impaired renal function.5 Despite programs such as the Expanded Criteria Donors (ECDs) which loosen OPTN criteria, the few additional organs supplied are of no benefit to the young and otherwise healthy transplant patients.6

Many hospitals, medical personnel, and transplant centers recognize the need for an increased supply of organs to address this demand. An increase in the donor pool could be achieved by opening up an entirely new category of donors: non-heart beating cadaver donors (NHBCDs).4 In order to dispel misperception, it is important to distinguish between conventional and non-heart beating cadavers. A heart beating cadaver is currently the most common type of organ donor: a brain-dead individual existing with the aid of life-support. A non-heart beating cadaver is an individual who has experienced the cessation of respiratory function but is not brain-dead and so could be reuscitated if life support were removed.7 The AMA’s Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs (CEJA) estimates that full utilization of NHBCDs may increase the organ pool significantly by 20-25%, and evidence from the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center suggests that these donors significantly by 20-25%, and evidence from the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center suggests that these

...the specific ethical issues of DCD in NHBCDs. Following, it will outline the important method of donations from NHBCDs: controlled donation after cardiac death (DCD). Afterwards, it will discuss the specific ethical issues of DCD in NHBCDs. Finally, it will offer suggestions for future public policy supporting the use of NHBCDs and provide a conclusion of the topic.

RELEVANT DEFINITIONS

Brain Death: (As provided by CEJA) “Brain death occurs when a person is declared dead according to neurological criteria (i.e., the irreversible cessation of the functions of the entire brain, including the brain stem). Though the person has died, cardiopulmonary function may be maintained through artificial means.8

Cardiac Death: (As provided by CEJA) “Cardiac death occurs when a person is declared dead according to cardiopulmonary criteria (i.e., the irreversible cessation of circulatory and respiratory functions).9

Dead Donor Rule: An unwritten standard used to guide organ procurement in the United States. The rule states, first, that patients must not be killed by organ retrieval, which includes killing patients in order to retrieve their organs. And second, that organs must not be taken from patients until they die, with exceptions made for living donors and partial transplantations between relatives as a reasonable exception.10

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The first cadaveric organ donation was performed by Dr. Joseph Murray in 1962, just eight years after he performed the first live donation between identical twins.11 This first NHBCD set a precedent for the newfound transplant community as it operated under the traditional and only definition for death: the cessation of heart and lung function. The success rate of transplantation, however, was very low. Since organs were only taken from those whose hearts had stopped beating, all procured organs were of poor quality due to warm ischemic time—the time during which the organs themselves die due to the lack of oxygen and blood.12 As a result, transplant teams needed a way to retrieve oxygenated organs from dead donors either more quickly or efficiently than they had previously accomplished.

The mid-to-late 1960s brought about the definition of “breath death” and the push for it to be a criterion to define death. Doctors quickly developed the ability to sustain heart and lung function of neurologically devastated patients.13 The use of mechanical ventilation despite ongoing cell death in the brain issue. At this time transplant teams realized the importance of artificial respiration for neurologically devastated patients presented. If surgeons could procure organs from heart-beating cadavers, warm ischemic damage would be essentially eliminated, vastly increasing the quality and viability of organs available to the transplant community and increasing the survival rates of transplant patients. However, medical personnel feared criminal and civil implications of homicide absent a legal redefinition of death.14

The cries for more suitable organs were answered. As the success so that the result is an individual whose heart continues to beat but whose brain is irreversibly damaged. The burden is great on patients who suffer permanent loss of intellect, their families, on the hospital, and on those in need of organ donor pool already occupied by those comatose patients.15 Obsolete criteria for the definition of death can lead to controversy in obtaining organs for transplantation.16

The mission of the Committee was clear: to decrease the strain on the family of a neurologically devastated patient by withdrawing the necessity of continual life support as well as to enable an entirely new category of organ donor with which the success of the transplant community would no doubt improve.17 After the Committee’s publication, states began to adopt the new criterion for death. Despite the adoption of the new definition by 24 states, other states failed to enact the new brain death legislation. In order to precipitate a unanimous adoption, Congress assembled an interdisciplinary body under the sponsorship of the President’s Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research. This body, after exploring the issue, ultimately recommended the adoption of the Uniform Determination of Death Act (UDDA) in 1981.18

The UDDA is a viable option...
This allows ample time to assemble a transplant team and organ donation while he/she is sustained on life-support.

controlled donation after cardiac death (DCD). It is here, in the history of organ donation, that the medical community finds itself struggling ethically today.

Despite efforts to use older donors and those with underlying diseases, as in the Expanded Criteria Donors (ECDs) program, the medical community began to turn its attentions to non-heartbeating donors (NHBD) as a means to increase the recovery and survival rates of transplant patients. By 2006 these numbers increased (disproportionately) to 14,756 donors for 58,415 patients needing transplant.

In 2000 it issued a report of DCD recommendations and concerns, including lack of protocol, physician resistance, organ quality, determination of death, and financial resources, among others. This, however, revived the plight of the non-heartbeating donor as an original source of organ availability.

One establishment that implemented a working, non-heartbeating donor protocol was the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center in May 1999 with what would be known as “The Pittsburgh Protocol.”

The University of Pittsburgh Medical Center (UPMC) carefully constructed an extensive, non-heartbeating organ donation protocol which it believes “is medically appropriate to consider organ procurement from non-heartbeating donors.” The principle of the protocol is as follows. First, decisions regarding treatment and management of the patient shall be conducted separately from any dialog about organ donation. This topic should only be broached after the patient/surrogate requests removal of life support (unless the patient’s request is clear and unequivocal).

If, after the patient’s request or the patient is found to be incompetent and no surrogate is present, the DNR orders as part of the DCD process. It would make no sense to withhold a patient from life support and then re-uscitate simply because the hospital has the required technology to do so. The decision to withdraw life support is itself a DNR. Consider a patient without donor status after withdrawal of life support. Should the patient have died in the ICU, no doctor would hesitate to declare death, despite the reversibility of the condition, after two minutes. It is the mere fact that the medical community has something to gain from a DCD patient’s death that causes some to question the legitimacy of death after two minutes of cardiac arrest in an OR. The CEJA argues that “the patient’s request to be freed from life support and permitted to die must be honored whether the patient’s expressed wishes. The council shares the view that the patient’s loss of cardiopulmonary function may legitimately be viewed as irreversible because resuscitation is ethically precluded.”

Similarly, it has been deemed unnecessary to nitpick about the period of time between cessation of heart and lung function and declaration of death, so long as it is beyond two minutes. Irreversible brain damage will not occur under two minutes after cessation of cardiovascular function.

When dealing with the viability of organs, every additional minute spent has a substantial effect. One will find in DCD protocols and written guidelines across the country

The determination of when a patient is ‘dead’ is perhaps the most controversial aspect of DCD protocol. The Dead Donor Rule prevents the cause of death in patients to be organ removal. However it does not provide the specific criteria necessary to declare death.

Tilt 10-15 minutes after cessation of cardiac function.32 Similarly, it has been deemed unnecessary to nitpick about the period of time between cessation of heart and lung function and declaration of death, so long as it is beyond two minutes. Irreversible brain damage will not occur under two minutes after cessation of cardiovascular function.

When dealing with the viability of organs, every additional minute spent has a substantial effect. One will find in DCD protocols and written guidelines across the country
that the period of time between cardiac arrest and death ranges normally from two to five minutes, any time beyond which would seriously compromise the viability of organs. However, the less time surgeons wait to procure a donor’s organs, the more scrutiny they undergo. In response, the American College of Critical Care Medicine and the Society of Critical Care Medicine declared that a period of two minutes and a period of five minutes are physiologically and ethically identical. Furthermore, they found any period of time between two and five minutes to be acceptable for the declaration of death and the commencement of organ procurement. This is because adults have auto-resuscitated (Lazarus Syndrome) after a period of two minutes. Despite criticism, it has been well established, and many accept, that the condition of patients agreeing to DCD, and more importantly the withdrawal of life support, is irreversible. Waiting longer than two to five minutes would mean that the wishes of the donor, the program, and toward the potential donors.

**Death on Operating Table**

One may assume that any patient would prefer to die in an aesthetically pleasing environment surrounded by family; however, this is not always the case. The concern here is for those few who will remain conscious in the OR upon the removal of life support. This assumption, however, disregards the personal preferences of each patient. For instance, many patients may find that being surrounded by family while dying makes them uncomfortable—that they would rather have their family’s last memory be one of life and not death. Additionally, being surrounded by highly trained professionals in an OR with specific technology for treating discomfort may alleviate the fear of dying for some. John A. Robertson argues in his review of the policy issues in the Pittsburgh Protocol, “It is not clear at all that these concerns differ materially in substance from concerns that already attend retrieving organs from heart-beating donors.” He explains that DCD patients and brain-dead donors will both die in ORs, absent of family, surrounded by medical staff and high-tech equipment. Perhaps the consideration of dying on an operating table really is not an ethical consideration at all, but rather a decision with regard to personal or surrogate preference. Recall too that, in order to participate in a DCD program, doctors are required to disclose all details of the procedure to the patient/surrogate upon agreement to follow through. This includes the manner and location of procurement according to the Pittsburgh Protocol Policy and IOM recommendations, should a patient decide against donation at any point, even after consenting, he/she may withdraw without fear of prejudice or resistance.

**Surrogate Consent**

One might argue that surrogate consent is a critical concern regarding the withdrawal of life support in favor of organ donation. The topic of organ donation may color a surrogate’s decisions about the withdrawal of life support. For this reason, some might argue that the decision to donate organs should come, early on, from the patient and the patient alone. However, the power of surrogates has already been established in the American medical community and without surrogates the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation. The removal of specific powers of the surrogate is a slippery slope that could result in disregard for the wishes of many incompetent patients would go unconsidered. In fact, the harm involved in removing surrogacy powers with regards to organ donation may be greater than sustaining the role of a surrogate. Although the power of the surrogate may unfortunately cause physicians to stay important conversations until after a patient is incompetent (due to the discomfort of discussing DNR orders or organ donation with the patient), this problem is not unique to the withdrawal of life support and organ donation.

**CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

**Healthcare Motives**

There are two significant conflicts of interest that healthcare providers may face when dealing with a potential DCD patient. The first is an institution or organ bank’s motives in desiring to expand the donor pool by implementing NHBCD protocol with specific emphasis on the public’s perception of such motives. Second is the attending ICU physician’s conflict between ‘doing no harm’ and promoting the viability of potential organs once DCD status has been established.

A series of different public policy changes have been suggested to increase the donor pool. Among them have been presumed consent, living donors, and procurement from condemned prisoners, animals, and anencephalic infants. Those promoting these sorts of changes would support the use of NHBCDs in favor of shrinking the gap, since a lot of these suggestions carry more controversy than NHBCDs do. Those opposed, however, may see the push for use of NHBCD protocol differently.

**First, a greater availability of organs is necessary in order for the field of transplantation to grow. The promising growth of this branch of medicine will cease without additional donors.** While the protestor might find this outcome acceptable, a large extent of industry and job creation will be negatively impacted, which is a precursor to the most complicated of all motivating factors in medicine—money. Up to this point, little has been said in this article regarding money because it seems improper to utilize financial arguments in an article of purely ethical consideration. However, the protestor will not ignore the fact that the transplant industry is a burgeoning money-maker with widespread interest. For instance, of the average $159,000 it takes to transplant a kidney: $57,000 is spent on immunosuppressive drugs, $6,500 on procurement of the organ, and $92,700 and $17,500 on hospital admission and physician fees respectively. Clearly immunosuppressive drug manufacturers and hospital administrators have a lot to gain from the enlargement of the donor pool. New immunosuppressive drugs are constantly being manufactured in order to promote the success of transplantation post-operatively. Similarly, hospitals with transplant units have a lot of publicity to gain as well as money to earn should they be able to have their beds filled continuously.

This thought, however, is representative of a view contrary to that of this article and its author. To deny the installment of NHBCD protocol due to the distrust of motives is itself morally depraved. Arthur L. Caplan in his article in the Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal states it seems impolite, if not downright paranoid, to wonder about the motives of those who argue for a shift in professional prac-
The second conflict of interest addresses the medical management of the potential NHBCD candidate. For example, an ICU physician dealing with a patient who has already agreed to DCD status may have to prevent clots or vasodilators to promote organ viability contrary to the medical indicated care of the patient who desires, first and foremost, palliative care.44 Even excluding complete malpractice, negligence, and corruption, these are very real concerns, each of which depends solely upon the resolve of the surgeon, physician, nurse, or technician attending a potential NHBCD patient. Additionally, the suggestion or even mention of organ donation may color a patient/surrogate’s views one way or the other, and would be considered unethical, despite the potential to obtain otherwise unobtainable organs. There is, however, hope for this dilemma as well. Each protocol comes with a system of principles and procedures. This article has already outlined the procedures of the Pittsburgh Protocol. It is evident that the UPMC has sought to eliminate this specific conflict of interest. First, and perhaps most importantly, physicians in the ICU have the duty to police the effective-ness of the requirements for separation of the medical personnel’s duties.”45 Should there be an ethical breech in any decision (like the administering of heparin or vasodilators to prevent clots or vasodilators to promote organ viability) the physician attending a potential NHBCD patient. Additionally, the suggestion or even mention of organ donation may color a patient/surrogate’s views one way or the other, and would be considered unethical, despite the potential to obtain otherwise unobtainable organs. However, medical professionals should not feel entitled to make decisions regarding NHBCDs without accepting public input. The public discussion of NHBCD protocol will also allow for input, awareness, and approval. Additionally, community members will gain providing consideration to the thought of organ donation prior to trips to the ER or ICU. The complete transparency of NHBCD protocol will assure the public that organ donation is an altruistic act and that its practice is highly regulated and scrutinized.46 Familiarizing the community with standard NHBCD protocol may also serve to make the subject less taboo both in the home and at the bedside.47

Second, the successful implementation of NHBCD protocols in the community may rely on the slow implementation of policy. A ‘policy creep’ has been widely recommended and would allow the community to get used to the idea of donation after cardiac death.48 Although difficult, starting with stricter criteria for NHBCDs in order to prove to the community that NHBCDs are a significant source of organs would allow for protocol to be applied to specific restricting criteria over time. To what extent and how slowly this policy creep should take place depends entirely on the receptivity of the community. A community fully in favor of NHBCD protocol should see it implemented in full, while a community resistant to the idea should be introduced to the idea, slowly, one policy change at a time. The details of such a creep would, most likely, be left to the institution attempting to implement NHBCD protocol in order to avoid the misapplication of some irrelevant standard guidelines.49

CONCLUSION

Transplant statistics indicate a growing disparity between supply and demand. Many patients on the transplant waiting list are dying while waiting. The United Network for Organ Sharing (UNOS) recently revealed that with the current rate of donation, it would take approximately 3,000 years to fill the transplant waiting list.50 The question arises, how quickly can the current NHBCD protocol be modified to meet this demand? This is certainly encouraged. In the absence of a well-honed argument regarding the acceptability of death and its declaration, the wonderful promise of future NHBCD protocols lies in the slow implementation around the country of protocols such as the Pittsburgh Protocol. The continuation of this trend is certainly encouraged.

ENDNOTES

1. www.UNOS.org
2. Caplan 1993 (116)
3. Light 2008 (735)
4. Caplan 1993 (124)
5. Harrington 2009 (341)
6. CEJA Report 4 1994 1-3
7. Arnold 1993 (164)
8. CEJA Report 4 1994 1-94
9. Ibid.
10. Arbed 1998 (164)
12. Ad Hoc Committee 1968 (337)
14. Harrington 2009 (346)
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid.
17. Harrington 2009 (341)
18. Ibid.
20. Ibid.
21. Ibid.
22. Ibid.
23. Harrington 2009 (346)
24. Ibid.
26. Ibid.
29. Fiddler 2008 (123).
30. Ibid.
32. Ibid.
33. Ibid.
REFERENCES


The significance of light transcends cultural and geographical barriers, connoting spirituality, knowledge, and goodness in a variety of contexts throughout the ages. Architects have long used light to highlight spaces and structural features of buildings and landscapes. The cultural, intellectual, and industrial developments of the 19th century gave birth to a new theory of light in architecture, realizing previously unthinkable manipulations of natural and artificial light. Renowned architect Frank Lloyd Wright’s mastery of illuminating techniques is manifest in his most famous designs, and his innovation contributed greatly to the emphasis on natural light so apparent in contemporary home architecture.

“Wright’s general concern for the proper use of light stemmed from a desire to give people a sense of freedom and openness while creating a closed, functional shelter for them.”

FRANK LLOYD WRIGHT
The Power of Illumination in Architecture

TIPHAINIE LEVIERE
It is no wonder that light, one of the main supports of life itself, has inspired the imaginations of countless artists, architects, and audiences for generations. As a result, light is charged with much allegorical and spiritual meaning. Abbot Suger, an innovator in the Gothic movement in France, used light as a metaphor for God’s majesty, transcending matter and flesh and raising believers’ spirits. In 1134, he had the portal of Saint Denis Church engrained with “Our darkened spirit arises to Truth by the means of light.” Nature and building, he thought, exist in a symbiotic relationship, with man’s work echoing and complementing landscapes.

Since Suger’s time, light has lost none of its potency in the creation of spaces, although the specific connotations of divinity have faded somewhat. Light is now seen as less of a bridge to the heavens and more as a mediator between a building’s artificial exterior and its natural exterior. Frank Lloyd Wright conceptualized this view as “organic architecture.” Nature and building, he thought, exist in a symbiotic relationship, with man’s work echoing and complementing landscapes.

Frank Lloyd Wright conceptualized this view as “organic architecture.”Nature and building, he thought, exist in a symbiotic relationship, with man’s work echoing and complementing landscapes.

“Wright grew up in a rather conservative and pious family, light as a spiritual metaphor for God must have been emphasized. As a youth, the architect lived in Wisconsin, in the presence of natural and open spaces. Thinking back to the days of his youth, Wright wrote of sunlight slanting through the trees and falling on leaf-covered ground. From dancing illumination on the ground, he drew his feelings for the play of sun splashes on the floor of a building.”

Wright’s upbringing in the nineteenth century was characterized by industrialization. In the past, glass had been expensive and technically difficult to produce. Because of its physical characteristics, it was also complicated to use as a structural element of buildings, or in large panels. Beginning in the 1840s, however, a series of innovations made glass both easier and cheaper to produce. The development of electricity in the 1880s touched off a revolution in interior lighting, enabling novel manipulations of space and shadow. In addition to these technical innovations, artistic movements had a significant role in reshaping light. The Impressionist movement, which first began in the 1860s in France, was officially introduced in the United States in an 1886 art exhibition. Impressionism attempts to capture the world as it appears to the human eye in a glance. As all impressions are characterized to some degree by the play of light and shadow, so too was the movement intimately linked to the perceptions of light. More specifically, the architectural concern for materialization and dematerialization of buildings along with light comes from Impressionism. Along with Impressionism, the Arts and Crafts movement of the 1880s saw the revival of glass works as an artform, especially the works of Louis Comfort Tiffany and his contemporary John La Farge. Wright, who began his career during this period, was influence by those evolving art movements, which ultimately led him to contemplate light and glass.

With this background in mind, it is easier for us to consider the role of light in Wright’s houses. To Wright, architecture was not a spiritualization of matter as Sullivan understood it, but rather a materialization of spirit. “The open landscape was nature’s eloquent way of making freedom visible; to Wright, buildings too should speak of freedom.” A dwelling should be open on nature, full of light and receptive to nature’s and time’s changes. It should be “a broad shelter in the open,” as he said, an invitation to freedom. He conceived of his buildings with great consideration for the primary forces of nature, and for the basic requirements of life, light, air, shade. He thought rays of sun stood for joy, flaunting the confines of indulgent life, and that an awareness of the sky ought to be as much as part of daily indoor life as an awareness of the earth. Light, to him, was a cosmic force and a messenger of natural order, existing un-violated in cities and thus maintaining man’s access to nature even in the heart of civilization.

Wright regarded glass as the materialization of light, the weightless medium of sight. Out of all the materials he used, glass was his favorite because it allowed for the establishment of a new relationship between man and nature: in the openings of my houses, glass as a place comparable to precious stones among all the other materials... This super-material that is glass is, in the way we currently use it, pure...
Glass is the architect's dream because it is such malleable building material. It could be a plane through which one could see with perfect clarity, a "lens by which the landscape could be understood with a grace sufficient to make pictorial art redundant." It could be as refractive as ice, reflective as water, or "composed of colored panes of pares as iridescent as a butterfly's wings." tensuous, transparent, opalescent or opaque; polished, frosted or rusticated.

Wright liked to use high casement windows and French doors. To cascade to let light in. For his openings in dwellings, Wright arranged to allow indoor spaces to interact with the outdoor environment. He wanted to have dim intimate spaces interspersed with open planes and refused to use walls to create indoors.

Another major desire, was that the openings would not look like holes in a wall, but rather form an open, integrated and flowing space.

Wright was well aware of the effects that each of his arrangements would create with light; with this knowledge, he manipulated the way light itself would interact with the observer.

In stark contrast to architects such as Ludwig Mies von der Rohe, Wright did not want the window frame to disappear. Windows were to remain a protective screen; a kind of frontier, giving the dweller a feel of intimacy and privacy while also lending a taste of freedom and possibility to witness changes in time and nature. Glass stands out among materials, according to Wright, because:

- by means of glass something of the freedom of our arboreal ancestors living in the trees becomes a precedent for freedom in the 20th century life. It is by way of glass that the sunlit ancestry living in the trees becomes the most useful servant of a higher purpose. Through a window, glass gives us something of the freedom of our ancestors living in the trees.
- Windows were to remain a protective screen: a kind of frontier, giving the dweller a feel of intimacy and privacy while also lending a taste of freedom and possibility to witness changes in time and nature.
- Glass diffuses light, reflects or diffracts it. In the case of the Prairie houses, for instance, the frost goes four feet into the ground in winter;
- Wright firmly believed that the purpose of the building and its natural environment should determine its shape:

architecture which is really architecture proceeds from the ground and somehow the terrain; the nature of materials and the purpose of the building must inevitably determine the form and character of any good building.

The weather conditions would have an effect on the shape of the house and thus the choice of lighting, and the natural lighting was to be either school or tempered to supplement artificial sources. In the case of the Prairie houses, for instance, one major desire, was that the openings would not look like holes in a wall, but rather form an open, integrated and flowing space.

Wright mastered the use of natural light. He adapted his architecture to the function of his building, but all of his designs place a premium on light. The classic way to begin architecture to the function of his building, but all of his designs place a premium on light. The classic way to begin architecture to the function of his building, but all of his designs place a premium on light.

Wright was interested in indirect lighting and smooth contrasts. A dwelling is meant to be a refuge, a retreat; this is one of the reasons the Prairie houses have overhanging roofs that cast shadow inside. Shadows are not just aesthetic, for they guarantee privacy and discretion as well as the creation of a quiet and comfortable entrance in a dimly lit space.

The interior of the Robie house being hot summer days, while keeping rain and snow away from the walls in winter times.

Wright mastered the use of natural light. He adapted his architecture to the function of his building, but all of his designs place a premium on light. The classic way to begin architecture to the function of his building, but all of his designs place a premium on light.

Wright designed the house walls turned into large light screens would disintegrate in light but still fulfill their protective functions. Moreover, this serial use solved the problem of isolated doors and windows that slowly modified large parts of the house from the street and the environment. It is particularly true of Wingspread's fifteen-foot high living room windows that completely overshadow the smaller entry-way. These rows of windows also often allegorically reflected to lived or flower fields, as they were also ornamented with abstracted organic patterns. As Wright worked with open plans and refused to use walls to create indoors spaces, he employed light to articulate and determine the use of the space. In Fallingwater, for instance, narrow rifts from floor to ceiling articulate the walls of servant wings and guest quarters. Wright also pierced the roofs with
Wright often used glass to efface the shadowy, enclosed feel of corners. By joining two panels of glass at corners, Wright created new and pleasant effects. One of Wright’s clearest demonstrations of how glass corners gave the impression that the roof was floating above walls. It also gave a new sense of volume and freedom. In the Johnson Wax Administration building, the walls and roofs are in continuity, the contrast between the plaster and the glass filled coves first, and the corner and roof secondly, give an aerial feel to the building. In the houses he designed, Wright used glass towers and light wells to create volumes, emphasize specific spaces, and create contrasts. This is the case in Fallingwater, where the horizontals and extended parapets while verticals are concealed with light and how they could either close a space or diffuse light indirectly. This is why he mainly used shaded and grey and beige to catch light, as well as oranges, terracotta and oak tones to create warmth. He had the overarching space and sometimes the cantilever painted in clear colors, so that they would protect the bedrooms from the sun but gently diffuse some light in it.

Wright also used electricity and fire lighting. Fire was important to him because it was earthly, complementary to the “heavenly” sunlight. It also referred to the passage of the seasons, as fire is linked to winter, while bright sunlight is associated with summer. The intimacy of a fire’s warm, dim light is reinforced by the heat it gives off. The fireplace is a common metaphor for family, indoor life and house tasks. For Wright, fire was the soul of the house itself, “the spirit within.” Chimneys were at the heart of dwellings Wright built, the focal point of the household, both the center of gravity and the gathering place for the family.

As for electricity, Wright was ahead of his contemporaries. He loved to test new technologies and adapt their use. He hid the cables and, obsessed with light coming from above, he roofed the mausoleum museum, entirely lit by its roof, could embody the idea of light itself. Wright loved to put light and openings in unexpected places to create novel atmospheres.

Wright was well aware of the effects that each of his arrangements would create with light. With this knowledge, he manipulated the way light itself would interact with the observer. His stained glass windows patterns would echo the roof design, their shadow resembling the roof pattern at some hours of the day. As in the Friehe house. To create intimate atmospheres while letting light in, he brought the ceilings down to a “human size” and reinforced the feel of their lowness with print and thin wood braid. As he explained:

ceilings could be brought down over onto the walls by the way of the horizontal broad bands of plaster on the wall in the windows and colored same as the roof ceilings. This would bring ceiling-surface and color down to the very window top.17

Wright also used colored windows to diffuse light. He would either close a space or diffuse light indirectly. This is why he mainly used stained or shaded and grey and beige to catch light, as well as oranges, terracotta and oak tones to create warmth. He had the overarching space and sometimes the cantilever painted in clear colors, so that they would protect the bedrooms from the sun but gently diffuse some light in it.

In his later Johnson Wax Administration building, there are absences of corners, as the light comes from the glass roof and the horizontal band of glass tube that replace the traditional cornice.

He used colors knowing fully well how they would interact with light and how they could either close a space or diffuse light indirectly. This is why he mainly used stained or shaded and grey and beige to catch light, as well as oranges, terracotta and oak tones to create warmth. He had the overarching space and sometimes the cantilever painted in clear colors, so that they would protect the bedrooms from the sun but gently diffuse some light in it.

Wright also used electricity and fire lighting. Fire was important to him because it was earthly, complementary to the “heavenly” sunlight. It also referred to the passage of the seasons, as fire is linked to winter, while bright sunlight is associated with summer. The intimacy of a fire’s warm, dim light is reinforced by the heat it gives off. The fireplace is a common metaphor for family, indoor life and house tasks. For Wright, fire was the soul of the house itself, “the spirit within.” Chimneys were at the heart of dwellings Wright built, the focal point of the household, both the center of gravity and the gathering place for the family.

As for electricity, Wright was ahead of his contemporaries. He loved to test new technologies and adapt their use. He hid the cables and, obsessed with light coming from above, used lantern-shapes and warm lighting in the places he hid the cables and, obsessed with light coming from above, used lantern-shapes and warm lighting in the places he
“The chiasm, the interweaving of nature and history into the fabric of our experience, is fundamental, and thinking of them in a way that is faithful to experience requires thinking through both of them together.”
we find that The Visible and the Invisible way of Maurice Merleau-Ponty’s ontology of the visible and ontology of nature? This article seeks to understand the significance of Nature as a philosophical concept the way toward the ontology of nature as a general? And why, in turn, is a history of the ‘evolution’ of philosophical mutation. We will show how the concept of Nature is deutic, since it more clearly shows the necessity of the ontological evolution of the concept of Nature is a more convincing propagation. Instead, being rests in being is concentrated within things. Either something is visible or it is not. Either something is with something ontologically related to itself. But the reflection, then this mediation is a condition for understanding between them. Habits of thought formed over time lead us to believe that it is easy to confuse the ‘subject’ with the ‘object’ as belonging to one side or another of a conceptual system. Either something is visible or it is not. Either something is reflective or unreflective. However, a sustained investigation reveals a phenomenon analogous to the twilight period that comes between clear hours of light and darkness. When one tries to point out precisely where something ceases to be visible and becomes invisible or where transcendence ends and immanence begins or what constitutes the difference between being that reflects and being that does not, one cannot derive clear concepts that eliminate this confusion. The secret of being does not ultimately rest in the things which enter into this relation; in fact, making being a static property of things leads to incoherence. One of the great lessons that phenomenology has drawn from the history of philosophy is that the assumptions of many things is flawed precisely because it is impossible to pin down what things are while simultaneously assuming that being is concentrated within things: Instead, being rests in the movement of the chiasm. Being is more productively associated with the dynamic relationship between a given subject and its possible objects. Examining this back-and-forth reveals a stuff that is neither material nor spiritual, what Merleau-Ponty calls ‘flesh.’

Rather than have us think of reality as ultimately material or spiritual, Merleau-Ponty asserts that in the fundamental chiasm of the two, Merleau-Ponty dismisses the traditional dialectic of the basic substance. Flesh is a meaning relation, not an intellectual one. It is a notion, but neither is it fully adequate to philosophy, because it is a relation that involves tangibility and visibility. Although discovering that the concept of Nature involves working back from traditional concepts of matter and spirit, flesh is not constituted by those two things. Merleau-Ponty asserts that flesh is an ‘always-already present relation,’ out of which traditional concepts emerge as dynamic poles. As an ultimate notion, the structure of flesh is also the structure underlying and manifested in the world and ourselves. What we perceive as objects are intelligible as such only by means of their engagement in this relationship of the flesh. ‘What exists are not present ‘things’ or forces but systems of differential relationships in an ongoing process of integration, deintegration and reformulation.’

Given flesh, given this relational system, how is ‘the concept of Nature’ related to ontology, and why might it be the ‘privileged expression’? Why do we treat nature, and thus ontology, historically, through studying the evolution of the concept? There are the questions which can be answered by asserting the existence of a chiasm between nature and history. We must begin by seeing what Merleau-Ponty means by Nature. One of the implications of the idea of flesh is that meaning in not existentially dependent on existence; rather, it can exist beneath thought. There is an unreflexive meaning that lies within the sensible, constituting the sensible. This unreflexive meaning is the starting point for understanding nature. ‘Nature is what has a meaning without this meaning being posited by thought.’

It is also what underlies all of our experiences—perception and action. Expanding on Husserl’s notion, Merleau-Ponty argues that: ‘As an overarching concept or horizon of experience, nature is a “carrier of all the possible,” a configuration that is the originary source of any sentient reflection concerning it.’

The sensibility of nature must then exceed attempts to reflect upon it because it is both the point from which reflection begins and toward which reflection is oriented. This aspect of nature captures the trait of simultaneous transcendence and immanence which Husserl, and later Merleau-Ponty, understood as an essential characteristic of all perception. Sentient reflection on nature is ‘ontologically continuous’ with nature, springing from the ‘soil,’ the ‘Earth,’ and the ‘unreflective—in a word, nature—remains for the personal self a prehistory, an irrepressible past.’ Reflection takes up nature and in doing so deals with something ontologically related to itself. But the reverse of this familiarity, this immanence, is the insurmountable transcendence of nature. Reflection cannot capture every possible relation with nature in its gaze, and it is this experiential fact that preserves reflection from being identical to nature in its totality.

Reflection emerges from the unreflexive when a subject, an instance of sentient meaning, doubles back on itself to explore its history. This phenomenon introduces a paradox. We seem to experience nature directly and unreflectively all the time as we perform habitual tasks in our daily lives. But if the unreflective expresses itself only through reflection, then this mediation is a condition for understanding nature and direct access is impossible. As soon as consciousness is examined, as soon as it stands out from the background of the world one lives through, then reflection comes into play.

What are we doing in the majority of our relations with nature? At any given moment, the meaningful sensibility
nature is flowing into the meaningful sentient of human life which is its expression. The doubling back of reflection, the effort to join itself to its originary source, must always be incomplete. Reflection cannot seamlessly rejoin the unreflective that is its beginning.

Although a seamless rejoining is impossible, there is reversibility between reflection and the unreflective. Not only does nature flow into human reflection, but reflection enters into nature. The act of reflecting seeks a passage from sentient, articulate meaning back to sensible, lived-through nature. The human sciences, which are tasked with working to relate human life back to this nexus, “that which he meant the web-like continuity between nature and psychic life. Due to the fleeting nature of experience, the human sciences are tasked with working to relate human life back to this nexus; back to the pre-reflective, and active source, which we sometimes call, in a more popular vein, the self, the psyche, or the unconscious.” 

This temporal expression of nature is not a potentiality of the human subject but as an event of nature itself, of its own duplicity, which enables us to “abstract” from nature, if this word has any sense, can only be a moment of nature’s own self-ladenness.11

The neo-Kantian Wilhelm Dilthey saw history (and the human sciences in general) as directed toward discovering the relation of the coexistence and the interweavings of original and vertical chains of reflection which link the meanings in history. He formulates the chiasm between reflection and the unreflective. The tension that emerges here is the same tension that characterizes the chiasm between reflection and the unreflective.

For Husserl, in reading Dilthey, paid close attention to this problem and attempted to move beyond it in formulating his own philosophy. In his essays “The Crisis” and in his essay “The Origin of Geometry” he formulated this question in a way that is intended to not be overcome by what comes later. “Reflection must add more and more layers to history in its attempts to double back and access the structure of what lies beneath it.”

This temporal expression of nature cannot fully penetrate back through sedimented layers of meaning to disclose the structure of history? Reflection must add more layers to history in its attempts to double back and access the structure of what lies beneath it. In other words, the tension that emerges here is the same tension that characterizes the chiasm between reflection and the unreflective.

Of course, between the philosophies, not reduction to one unique answer is necessary. If there is but one solution: show that there is transcendence, to be sure, between the philosophies, not reduction to one unique answer.
This idea of the continuity of questioning through time is similar in structure to the passing of the sensible meaning into sentient meaning – the logic of chiasm permeates them both. Nature has doubled over itself to produce history, and the process of history is a continuation of this doubling over in order to move forward. I said before that the movement from nature to history is reversible, that the march of history finds its motivation in its desire to re-enter the mute sensible which generated it. So, adherence to the logic of the chiasm requires not only a continuity of questioning through time, but that this continuity also be a folding back over which seeks to complete the circle of its reflection. In this dynamic, the act discovers the impossibility of its completion that is very condition for its being. This is, in fact, the next step Merleau-Ponty takes in his notes.

He works to show that a structural philosophy of history such as he is outlining must circle back to nature, and that the crossing of history and nature is what resolves the problems that both Dilthey and Husserl deal with in their works. Near the very end of the notes for The Visible and the Invisible he makes the following point about a philosophical account of history:

Whereas geography—or rather: the Earth as Ur-Arche brings to light the carnal Urhistorie (Husserl—Umsurtz). In fact it is a question of grasping the nexus—neither “historical” nor “geographic” of history and transcendental geology, this very time that is space, this very space that is time, which I will have rediscovers by my analysis of the visible and the flesh, the simultaneous Urstiftung of time and space which makes there be a historical landscape and a quasi-geographical inscription of history. Fundamental problem: the sedimentation and the reactivation.16

Here Merleau-Ponty references Husserl’s concepts of sedimentation and reactivation which are so important to “The Origin of Geometry.” How this sedimentation and reactivation occurs and how understanding is possible (epistemology), must be grappled with within the content of an ontology which apprehends being in terms of crossing, or movement between. Where the being of time and space, or history and the natural world, is found in the moment of their crossing, then there can be a structural philosophy that begins to make out the landscape it is traversing, all the while recognizing the truth of incomplete reversibility as a condition for any reflection.

The way to come to this point is, as Merleau-Ponty points out in his lecture course on nature, to begin with the ontology of nature. The chiasm between the reflective and the unreflective points the way to the fundamental notion of reversibility and shows that history, too, is incorporated into this pattern by being that which nature touches and that into which nature flows. The chiasm, the interweaving of nature and history into the fabric of our experience, is fundamental, and thinking of them in a way that is faithful to experience requires thinking through both of them together.

ENDNOTES
1. Merleau-Ponty 2003 (204)
2. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (IX 301)
3. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (IV 1401)
4. Toadvine (95)
5. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (31)
6. Merleau-Ponty 2003 (77)
7. Ibid.
8. Toadvine 2009 (35)
9. Merleau-Ponty 2003 (35)
10. Toadvine 2009 (35)
11. Dilthey 2009 (35)
12. Husserl 1975 (176)
13. Husserl 1975 (256)
14. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (256)
15. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (VI 1635)
16. Merleau-Ponty 1968 (VI 258)

REFERENCES
ROSA MARIBEL COLORADO
is a member of the College of Arts and Sciences Class of 2011. As an undergraduate at Boston College, she coupled an English major with an American Studies minor. Yet, weaving film studies into as many classes as possible was a favorite endeavor for her. Her research published here was a final paper for the American Studies Senior Seminar led by Professor Charles Morris. In addition to Professor Morris, she would also like to acknowledge Professor Richard Blake from the Film Studies Department for cultivating her interest in film and film history. She plans to attend Columbia University in the fall of 2011, pursuing a Master’s Degree in allied healthcare.

JENNA HOWARTH
is a member of the College of Arts & Sciences class of 2014, majoring in English and minoring in Economics. She was an intern at the Edward W. Brooke Courthouse this past summer and plans to attend law school after she graduates from Boston College. Jenna, a member of the College of Arts and Sciences Honors Program, would like to thank Professor Timothy Duket and the students of his 2010-2011 Western Cultural Tradition classes for their extensive assistance with her research and analysis of the Dura-Europos exhibit at the McMullen Museum.

KAREN KOVAKA
is a philosophy and environmental geoscience major in the class of 2012. While at Boston College, she has been a part of the Presidential Scholars Program and the College of Arts and Sciences Honors Program. She also ran the Boston Marathon as a Campus School Volunteer, helped launch the BC Rhetorical Society, and taught public speaking and urban agriculture courses to middle school students through Citizen Schools. She has interned for the International Water Management Institute in Bangalore, India and worked as a wilderness education instructor for La Vida Center for Outdoor Education and Leadership. Currently, Karen is working on a senior thesis on nature as a philosophical concept and applying to PhD programs in continental philosophy.

TIPHAINÉ LEVERRIER
studied at Boston College as an exchange student from Institut d’Études Politiques in Paris ("Sciences Po"). Tiphaine came to Boston College to fulfill her school’s study abroad requirement. While at Boston College, she especially took interest in theology and art courses. She wrote her featured article for a class about Frank Lloyd Wright, taught by the wonderful Prof. Jeffrey Howe. Tiphaine just finished her bachelor in political sciences and is continuing her studies at Sciences Po’s law school. She is considering a return to the United States to work or specialize in Human Rights law.

ZACHARY T. MARTIN
is a recent College of Arts and Sciences graduate from the class of 2011. During his time at Boston College he studied both Physics and Math and was involved in groups such as 4Boston and Relay for Life. His article was written for a College of Arts and Sciences Honors Program seminar, “Law, Medicine, and Public Policy,” which he took in the fall of his Senior year under Father John Paris. Zach was raised in Northern New Jersey, where his parents remain, and enjoys spending his time at Lake George in Upstate New York. He is happy to be moving to Boston indefinitely in the Fall.

SOPHIA MORADIAN
is a member of the College of Arts and Sciences class of 2012 from Oakland, California, majoring in International Studies and minoring in Islamic Civilizations & Societies. She spent last summer and fall in Amman, Jordan, where she conducted research with Iraqi women and worked as an ESL instructor at community development centers. Sophia plans to work internationally in the field of economic development and human rights.

ANDREW ORR
is a former chemistry major in the Boston College Class of 2011 and is now continuing his education at Robert Wood Johnson Medical School in his home state of New Jersey. His feature paper was written for the “Law, Medicine, and Public Policy” seminar and was prompted by a search for how to best maintain the dignity of those who struggle with Alzheimer’s disease.

BRIAN VARIAN
is a former Editor-in-chief of Elements who graduated summa cum laude in the class of 2011 from the Carroll School of Management with a double major in finance and history. He authored this paper while taking Professor Pamela Berger’s eye-opening course, “Great Art Capitals of Western Europe.” Originally from Mahopac, New York, Brian hopes to return to “the land of the bean and the cod” temporarily before pursuing a PhD in U.S. Economic History, with the goal of one day teaching at Boston College.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Artwork</th>
<th>©</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WITHOUT MEMORY</td>
<td>Syldavia / iStockphoto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRAQI IMMIGRANTS LEAVE JORDAN</td>
<td>Marco Di Lauro / Getty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRAQI VICTIMS OF VIOLENCE RECEIVE EMERGENCY CARE OUTSIDE OF IRAQ</td>
<td>Spencer Platt / Getty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MITRAS TAUROCTONY</td>
<td>Scala / Art Resource, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERIOR OF THE SYNAGOGUE OF DURA EUROPOS, 3RD CE. REPLICA.</td>
<td>Erich Lessing / Art Resource, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP STRUGGLES WITH PROTESTER AT 1968 DEMOCRATIC NATIONAL</td>
<td>APA / Getty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MADONNA AND CHILD OF JEANNE D’EVREUX</td>
<td>Réunion des Musées Nationaux / Art Resource, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHRIST’S DESCENT INTO LIMBO</td>
<td>Réunion des Musées Nationaux / Art Resource, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGAN DONOR</td>
<td>drbueller / iStockphoto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUMAN HEART</td>
<td>Ingram Publishing / Stockphoto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRANK LLOYD WRIGHT IN STUDIO AT TALIESIN, 1956</td>
<td>The Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation / Artists Rights Society, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRIGHT, FRANK LLOYD (1867-1959)</td>
<td>The Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation / Artists Rights Society, NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAURICE MERLEAU-PONTY</td>
<td><a href="http://www.philosophical-investigations.org/Users/PerigGouanvic/Merleau-Ponty_and_the_Post-Modern">http://www.philosophical-investigations.org/Users/PerigGouanvic/Merleau-Ponty_and_the_Post-Modern</a>_, Non-Self / acquired under Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported license.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WILHELM DILTHEY</td>
<td>Atelier Dührkopp Berlin, around 1910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15 27 31 36 39 48 54 57 63 66 75 77 84 86