

Latin Church, which deprives the Church of many gifted ministers and is causing serious eucharistic deprivation. The renewal of religious communities in light of the charism of their founders, and the approval of their revised constitutions, was not aided by the recent Synod of Bishops on religious life. The need for due process is glaring in many places in the Church. Canon 1371.1 permits punishment for dissent from nondefinitive teaching; this seems excessive and the canon's origins are mysterious. We have no independent judiciary in the Church.

On the other hand, lay persons are using their gifts from the Spirit in exercising the power of governance and have real influence in the Church. *Epikeia* and canonical equity are alive and well; how do they relate to the Spirit?

JAMES A. CORIDEN

*Washington Theological Union
Washington DC*

THE SPIRIT AND HINDUISM

- Topic: The Hidden Ground of Grace: Reflections on the Holy Spirit in the Light of Hindu Approaches to Spiritual Liberation
- Moderator: James L. Fredericks, Loyola Marymount University
- Presenter: Bradley Malkovsky, University of Notre Dame
- Respondents: Francis X. Clooney, Boston College
Stephen Duffy, Loyola University, New Orleans

In keeping with the overall theme of pneumatology, Brad Malkovsky offered a reflection on the Christian doctrine of the Holy Spirit in light of his studies of grace in the thought of Samkara and his Advaita Vedanta school. Malkovsky's basic thesis is as follows: while in Israel the Spirit is revealed in the great interventions of God into history, in Hindu thought, the Spirit must be sought in the hidden ground of the world and the soul. This raises an issue of extreme importance which Christianity addressed in its controversy with the Gnostics: does liberation come through knowledge or through grace? This basic issue in Christian theology can be addressed anew through a study of the relationship between divine grace and human effort in Samkara's thought.

In the works of Samkara, two theological methods can be detected: (1) a nonsectarian philosophical theology (which emphasizes divine aseity and human activity) and (2) a theistic theology based on a sectarian devotion to Vishnu (which emphasizes divine activity and addresses ultimate reality in personal

terms). In Brad Malkovsky's view, grace is central to Samkara, but does not operate independent of liberating knowledge.

In the responses from Frank Clooney and Steve Duffy and in the discussion that followed, four issues basic to Christianity's theology of grace and pneumatology surfaced. First, the manualist theology of grace has been criticized for being nonexperiential. In what sense can grace be said to be experienced? Here, the theology of grace flows into pneumatology in the form of the theological foundations for the discernment of spirits. Samkara's contention that divine grace transforms experience by leading us beyond ignorance is very suggestive in this regard. Second, the Christian theology of grace has had to grapple with the problem of dualism. Take, for example, Rahner's criticism of what he called the "extrinsicism" of manualist theologies of grace. Samkara offers a philosophically and religiously sophisticated view of human transformation in which grace comes neither from "outside" nor from "inside" but rather from the ground of both outside and inside. Third, Samkara has much to say regarding the debate over grace and works in ecumenical discussions between Catholics and Protestants. As noted above, Hinduism has generated religious rhetorics of grace and self-help, liberation through divine intervention and through the self-cultivation of knowledge. In Samkara, we are presented with an example of a religious thinker who has deeply integrated both of these rhetorics in a unified religious cosmology and anthropology. Finally, Samkara compels Christians to return to what may have been thought to be a settled question in theological anthropology. Should salvation be construed as the liberation of the human or transcendence of the human? This issue remains ambiguous in Samkara. This ambiguity may assist Christians in asking if redemption is a restoration of what we were created to be or the becoming of something new as in the Eastern Orthodox teaching regarding divinization.

JAMES L. FREDERICKS
Loyola Marymount University
Los Angeles